Quantifying the correlation between mobile continents and elevated temperatures in the subcontinental mantle

C. Jain, A. B. Rozel, P. J. Tackley

Institute of Geophysics, Department of Earth Sciences, ETH Zurich, Sonneggstrasse 5, CH-8092 Zurich, Switzerland

3

Key Points: Correlation decreases with increasing core temperature, number of continents, internal heating, or decreasing reference viscosity Downwellings along continental margins increase thermal contrast between subcontinental and suboceanic mantle Decompression melting leads to basaltic crust production which breaks the continents and destroys the correlation

Corresponding author: C. Jain, charitra1989@gmail.com

13 Abstract

Continents influence the mantle's convective wavelength and the heat flow escaping from 14 the planet's surface. Over the last few decades, many numerical and analytical studies 15 have contributed to the debate about whether the continents can warm up the subcon-16 tinental mantle or not and if they do, then to what extent? However, a consensus regard-17 ing the exact nature and magnitude of this correlation between continents and elevated 18 temperatures in the subcontinental mantle remains to be achieved. By conducting a sys-19 tematic parameter study using 2D global mantle convection simulations with mobile con-20 tinents, we provide qualitative and quantitative observations on the nature of this cor-21 relation. In our incompressible and compressible convection models, we observe the gen-22 eral processes of downwellings bringing cold material into the mantle along continental 23 margins and a subsequent buildup of warm thermal anomalies underneath the continents. 24 We compute the amplitude and degree of this correlation using spectral decomposition 25 of the temperature and composition fields. The dominant degree of correlation evolves 26 with time and changes with continental configuration. Using simple empirical fits, we 27 observe that this correlation decreases with increasing core temperature, number of con-28 tinents, internal heating, or decreasing reference viscosity. We also report simple regres-29 sions of the time-dependence of this correlation. Additionally, we show that decompres-30 sion melting as a result of a mantle upwelling or small-scale sublithospheric convection 31 leads to voluminous volcanism. The emplacement of this dense basalt-eclogite material 32 breaks the continents apart and destroys the correlation. 33

³⁴ 1 Introduction

The existence of dynamic feedback between the convecting mantle and the drift-35 ing continents is evident from numerical simulations and laboratory experiments. It has 36 been shown that continents exert a first-order influence on Earth's mantle flow by af-37 fecting convective wavelength and surface heat flow (e.g., Grigné, Labrosse, & Tackley, 38 2007; Guillou & Jaupart, 1995; Gurnis, 1988; Lowman & Gable, 1999; Lowman & Jarvis, 39 1993, 1996; B. Phillips & Bunge, 2005; Yoshida, Iwase, & Honda, 1999; S. Zhong & Gur-40 nis, 1993; S. Zhong & Liu, 2016; S. Zhong, Zhang, Li, & Roberts, 2007). The notion that 41 continents can have an insulating effect on the mantle has received considerable atten-42 tion over the last few decades (Cooper, Lenardic, & Moresi, 2006; Cooper, Moresi, & Lenardic, 43 2013; Lenardic & Moresi, 2001; Lenardic, Moresi, Jellinek, & Manga, 2005). 44

Numerical simulations by Gurnis (1988); S. Zhong and Gurnis (1993) showed the 45 accumulation of heat underneath mechanically stiff, thick continental plates, and the de-46 velopment of long-wavelength thermal structures in the mantle. By using laboratory ex-47 periments, Guillou and Jaupart (1995) proposed that continents wider than the man-48 the depth are susceptible to breakup as they generate large positive thermal anomalies 49 below them. Lowman and Gable (1999) suggested that the inclusion of oceanic plates 50 and internal heating in convection modeling reduces the thermal contrast between sub-51 oceanic and subcontinental mantle. By modeling mechanically and thermally distinct 52 continental and oceanic plates, but with the same thickness and a depth-dependent vis-53 cosity, Heron and Lowman (2010, 2011) argued that continental insulation plays a mi-54 nor role in affecting the mantle's thermal field and did not report any elevated temper-55 atures in the subcontinental mantle on timescales relevant to supercontinent assembly. 56 Heron and Lowman (2014) further highlighted the decreasing influence of continental in-57 substitution on subcontinental mantle temperatures with increasing Rayleigh number Ra, 58 albeit with a stationary supercontinent and viscosity not being fully temperature-dependent 59 in their models. In their mixed-heating (basal and internal) cartesian models, O'Neill, 60 Lenardic, Jellinek, and Moresi (2009) showed the propensity of plumes to rise underneath 61 continents (\sim 3000 km in extent) and elevate temperatures away from the cold slabs sub-62 ducting along continental margins. This temperature anomaly diminishes with strongly 63 temperature dependent viscosity. Moreover, for continents over 8000 km in width, the 64

inefficient lateral advection of material underneath the continents results in the forma-65 tion of drip instabilities causing small-scale convection cells and a reduction in the ther-66 mal anomaly. They also explored the possible relation between melting and rifting and 67 did not observe voluminous volcanism owing to hot upwelling subcontinental mantle in their steady-state simulations. By simulating mobile continents, B. R. Phillips and Coltice 69 (2010) also observed an increase in subcontinental temperature as a function of both con-70 tinental extent and convective wavelength, although their models lacked oceanic plates 71 and a temperature-dependent viscosity, which might result in overestimation of the re-72 sulting temperature difference between suboceanic and subcontinental mantle. Based on 73 their purely internally heated 3D models with various continental configurations and width, 74 Rolf, Coltice, and Tackley (2012) showed temperature excess of up to 140 K underneath 75 the continents compared to the suboceanic mantle. They showed that as opposed to a 76 dispersed configuration, a cluster of continents results in higher insulation and provides 77 a possible explanation for the episodic continental crustal growth (Condie, 2004; Hawkesworth 78 & Kemp, 2006; Pearson, Parman, & Nowell, 2007). The absence of basal heating and 79 plumes in their models is a significant simplification and demands further testing. 80

Considering all these numerical studies with varying degrees of complexity, some 81 underlying processes have been agreed upon. First, subcontinental mantle can become 82 hotter than suboceanic mantle provided that subduction zones develop along continen-83 tal margins and inhibit lateral mantle flow. Furthermore for this transient thermal anomaly 84 to develop, the continents would have to be stationary for a sufficient length of time. Sec-85 ond, any factors that promote thermal mixing will diminish the amplitude of these anoma-86 lies. Most of these studies have however neglected the effects of melting-induced crustal 87 production (hereafter, referred to as MCP) which are considered as significant processes in planetary evolution and dynamics (e.g., Davies, 2007; Nakagawa & Tackley, 2012; Ogawa, 89 2014; Stevenson, 1990; Xie & Tackley, 2004b). Lourenço, Rozel, and Tackley (2016) have 90 also shown that MCP strongly enhances the mobility of the lid and extends the range 91 of parameters over which a mobile lid is present on planets. Aiming for more realistic 92 simulations, we consider MCP in a subset of our simulations. 93

Understanding the mechanism behind the voluminous magmatism and the result-94 ing formation of continental flood basalts (CFB) remains a contentious issue. Anderson 95 (1982) proposed that the geoid highs above Africa and South Pacific were caused by el-96 evated temperatures generated by the assembly of the Pangea supercontinent during the 97 Mesozoic. Coltice et al. (2009); Coltice, Phillips, Bertrand, Ricard, and Rey (2007) ar-98 gued in favor of continental-aggregation induced elevated temperatures and large-scale 99 melting that caused the emplacement of continental flood basalts of the Central Atlantic 100 Magmatic Province following the breakup of Pangea. Alternatively, it has been proposed 101 that deep-seated mantle plumes can cause intense magmatic activity while emplacing 102 continental flood basalts followed by continental breakup (Campbell & Griffiths, 1990; 103 Condie, 2004; Morgan, 1972; Richards, Duncan, & Courtillot, 1989; Scrutton, 1973; White 104 & McKenzie, 1989). 105

In this paper, we study the possible correlation between mobile continents and el-106 evated subcontinental mantle temperatures using a broad range of thermo-chemical man-107 tle convection simulations. We systematically vary parameters such as core-mantle bound-108 ary (CMB) temperature, continental configuration, mantle heating modes (internal and 109 basal heating), and reference viscosity. We further investigate the effect of MCP on this 110 correlation and explore the possible origin of continental flood basalts. We introduce the 111 methodology and the governing equations in section 2. We present the results of our sim-112 ulations in section 3 and discuss their geophysical implications in section 4. Finally, we 113 summarize the key aspects of our study in section 5. 114

¹¹⁵ 2 Physical Model and Numerical Model

We study the thermo-chemical evolution of the mantle coupled with mobile con-116 tinents. Continents are simplified as homogeneous Archean cratons and represented by 117 a continuous non-diffusive compositional field $C (0 \le C \le 1) (C = 1)$ being pure con-118 tinental and C = 0 being pure non-continental material). In our models, these differ-119 ent cratons are allowed to drift closer and collide. They can then drift as a combined con-120 tinent or move apart. We do not specify a distinct continental thermal conductivity. Com-121 pared to the ephemeral oceanic crust that reaches a maximum age of $\sim 200 \,\mathrm{Myr}$, con-122 123 tinents are much older (Rudnick & Gao, 2003). Geophysical, geochemical, and geological investigations have attributed continents' long-term stable behavior to the presence 124 of strong, compositionally buoyant, and possibly viscous cratonic roots underlying the 125 continental crust (Boyd, 1987, 1989; Hirth & Kohlstedt, 1996; Jordan, 1978, 1979; Lee, 126 2003; Pollack, 1986; Schutt & Lesher, 2006). Accordingly, continents are modeled as lighter 127 and more viscous than the mantle. We use models featuring both incompressibility (with 128 non-dimensional units) and compressibility (with dimensional units) with parameters listed 129 in Table 1. The numerical model employed here incorporates pressure-temperature-dependence 130 of viscosity, internal and basal heating, plasticity, phase transitions, diffusion creep, melt-131 ing, and crustal production and is an extension of the ones described by Rolf et al. (2012); 132 Rolf and Tackley (2011). 133

2.1 Rheology

134

In our models, diffusion creep with homogenous grain size is the viscous deforma-135 tion mechanism. Between continents and mantle material, the density contrast is spec-136 ified by the buoyancy ratio B and the rheological contrast is controlled by viscosity ra-tio $\Delta \eta^{\rm C}$ and yield stress ratio $\Delta \tau_{\rm Y}^{\rm C}$. The mantle is divided into 3 different layers *i*: up-per mantle (1), lower mantle (2) and post-perovskite layer (3), with each layer having 137 138 139 different values for activation energy E_i and activation volume V_i (Karato & Wu, 1993; 140 Yamazaki & Karato, 2001). See Table 2 for a list of the rheological properties used in 141 the study. The dimensional temperature-, pressure- and composition-dependent viscos-142 ity η in each layer is given by an Arrhenius law: 143

$$\eta(T, P, C) = \eta_0 \Delta \eta_i \Delta \eta^C \exp\left(\frac{E_i + PV_i}{RT} - \frac{E_i}{RT_0}\right),\tag{1}$$

where η_0 is the reference viscosity at zero pressure and reference temperature T_0 (1600 K), $\Delta \eta_i$ is the viscosity offset between layer *i* and the reference viscosity, *P* is the pressure, *R* is the gas constant and *T* is the dimensional absolute temperature. η_0 is valid for the phase system olivine and the reference composition (60% olivine and 40% pyroxenegarnet), both of which have viscosity multipliers of 1 (see Table 2).

Following the viscosity profile expected by the inversion of postglacial rebound data 149 (Čížková, van den Berg, Spakman, & Matyska, 2012) and geoid inversion studies (e.g., 150 Ricard, Richards, Lithgow-Bertelloni, & Le Stunff, 1993; Ricard, Vigny, & Froidevaux, 151 1989), a viscosity jump of 30 is applied at the upper-lower mantle transition (660 km). 152 As suggested by mineral physics experiments and theoretical calculations (Ammann, Brod-153 holt, Wookey, & Dobson, 2010; Hunt et al., 2009), an additional viscosity jump of 0.1 154 (compared to reference viscosity) is imposed at the transition to post-perovskite at low-155 ermost mantle depths (2740 km). The activation volume decreases exponentially with 156 increasing pressure in each layer i according to the relation: 157

$$V(P) = V_i \exp\left(-\frac{P}{P_i}\right).$$
⁽²⁾

where P_i is the pressure scale which is different for each layer *i* as given in Table 2.

In simulations featuring incompressibility (non-dimensional units), the viscosity takes
 the form:

$$\eta(T^*, C) = \Delta \eta^{C} \exp\left(\frac{\tilde{E}_{A}}{T^* + 1} - \frac{\tilde{E}_{A}}{2}\right),\tag{3}$$

where $\Delta \eta^{C} = \eta (T^*, C = 1) / \eta (T^*, C = 0)$ accounts for the compositional dependence, and $\tilde{E}_{A} = 2 \ln (\eta (T^* = 0, C) / \eta (T^* = 1, C))$ is the non-dimensional activation energy, which accounts for the temperature-dependence of the viscosity. A constant value of 23.03 for \tilde{E}_{A} gives five orders of magnitude viscosity variation in the interval of nondimensional temperature $0 \leq T^* \leq 1$. By adding an offset to the temperature, Eq. 3 is obtained from Eq. 1 using the relation:

$$\frac{E}{RT} = \frac{E}{R\left(T_{\text{surf}} + \Delta T \ T^*\right)} = \frac{E}{RT_{\text{surf}}} \frac{1}{\left(1 + \Delta T/T_{\text{surf}} \ T^*\right)} = \frac{\dot{E}_{\text{A}}}{1 + T^*},\tag{4}$$

¹⁶⁷ where T_{surf} is the surface temperature and ΔT is the temperature scale. In our ¹⁶⁸ case, as is often done in geodynamics, we simply considered that $T_{\text{surf}} = \Delta T$ and the ¹⁶⁹ non-dimensional activation energy is defined by $\tilde{E}_{\text{A}} = E/(RT_{\text{surf}})$. This approxima-¹⁷⁰ tion might seem quite strong but what matters is the viscosity contrast more than the ¹⁷¹ exact shape of the viscosity profile.

To break the stagnant lid and obtain Earth-like plate tectonics, plastic yielding is assumed to be the weakening mechanism (Moresi & Solomatov, 1998; Tackley, 2008b). The maximum stress that a material can sustain before deforming plastically is given by the yield stress τ_Y and it increases linearly with depth d at a rate of τ'_Y ,

$$\tau_{\mathbf{Y}}(d,C) = \Delta \tau_{\mathbf{Y}}^{\mathbf{C}} \left(\tau_{\mathbf{Y}}^{\mathbf{0}} + d\tau_{\mathbf{Y}}' \right), \tag{5}$$

where $\Delta \tau_{\mathbf{Y}}^{\mathbf{C}} = \tau_{\mathbf{Y}} (d, C = 1) / \tau_{\mathbf{Y}} (d, C = 0)$ accounts for the different yield stresses of continental and oceanic lithosphere. $\tau_{\mathbf{Y}}^0 = \tau_{\mathbf{Y}} (d = 0, C = 0)$ is the yield stress at the oceanic surface. If the convective stresses exceed the yield stress, the viscosity is reduced to the yielding viscosity $\eta_{\mathbf{Y}} = \tau_{\mathbf{Y}}/2\dot{\epsilon}$, where $\dot{\epsilon}$ is the 2nd invariant of the strain-rate tensor. The effective viscosity is then given by:

$$\eta_{\text{eff}} = \left(\frac{1}{\eta} + \frac{2\dot{\varepsilon}}{\tau_{\text{Y}}}\right)^{-1}.$$
(6)

In simulations with MCP, the viscosity is limited between 10^{18} and 10^{25} Pa·s to mitigate large viscosity variations, which would decrease the stability of the code. These viscosity cutoffs are reached at temperatures of ~1150 K (highest viscosity) and ~5900 K (lowest viscosity). We therefore resolve the viscosity of the mantle through the entire evolution of the Earth.

Continents are less dense by $\Delta \rho_{\rm craton} = -100 \,{\rm kg/m^3}$ (buoyancy ratio $B = \Delta \rho_{\rm craton} / (\alpha \rho_0 \Delta T)$ = -0.4 with thermal expansivity α , reference density ρ_0 and temperature scale ΔT) compared to the mantle. A viscosity ratio $\Delta \eta^{\rm C} = 100$ and yield stress ratio $\Delta \tau_{\rm Y}^{\rm C} = 10$ are used to ensure cratonic lithosphere's relative stability and longevity when compared to oceanic lithosphere. When considering non-dimensional units, yield stresses $\tau_{\rm Y}$ are non-dimensionalized with the factor $\eta_0 \kappa / D^2$. The dimensional time t is obtained from the dimensionless time t* using $t = t^* D^2 / \kappa$ and similarly, velocities v are obtained from dimensionless velocities v* using $v = v^* \kappa / D$.

Table 1. Non-dimensional and dimensional parameters used in this study. Parameters that

vary with simulations are given in Table 4.

^s valid at the surface for olivine phase system.

The potential correlation between continents and temperature in the subcontinental mantle is strongly related to mantle stirring. However, as we use different values of reference viscosity in models with incompressibility, the average number of overturns occurring in the mantle decreases for cases with higher viscosity for a given amount of dimensional time. To overcome this issue, we use a renormalized time $t_{\rm r}$ based on the average dimensional velocity of our simulations. The renormalized time is given by:

$$t_{\Gamma} = \frac{v_{\rm E}}{\langle v \rangle_t} t,\tag{7}$$

200 with

$$\langle v \rangle_t = \frac{1}{t_{\max}^*} \int_{t^*=0}^{t^*=t_{\max}^*} v_{\text{RMS}} \, dt^*,$$
 (8)

where $v_{\rm RMS}$ is the dimensional root-mean-square (RMS) velocity in the whole domain and $v_{\rm E}$ is the average plate velocity for present-day Earth (3.4 cm/yr as used in Coltice, Rolf, Tackley, and Labrosse (2012) considering a transit time of 85 Myr for presentday Earth's mantle). $t^*_{\rm max}$ is the final dimensionless time in our simulations. We thus force a sufficiently large number of overturns in all cases, which leads to comparable evolution states. This renormalization is not required for models with compressibility and dimensional units.

| Property | Symbol | Value | Units |
|-----------------------------|-----------------|----------|----------------|
| - Upper Mantle (Olivine) | | | |
| Activation energy | E_1 | 300 | $\rm kJ/mol$ |
| Activation volume | V_1 | 5.00 | $\rm cm^3/mol$ |
| Pressure scale | P_1 | ∞ | GPa |
| Viscosity multiplier | $\Delta \eta_1$ | 1.0 | - |
| - Lower Mantle (Perovskite) | | | |
| Activation energy | E_2 | 370 | $\rm kJ/mol$ |
| Activation volume | V_2 | 3.65 | $\rm cm^3/mol$ |
| Pressure scale | P_2 | 200 | GPa |
| Viscosity multiplier | $\Delta \eta_2$ | 30.0 | - |
| - Post-perovskite layer | | | |
| Activation energy | E_3 | 162 | kJ/mol |
| Activation volume | V_3 | 1.40 | $\rm cm^3/mol$ |
| Pressure scale | P_3 | 1610 | GPa |
| Viscosity multiplier | $\Delta \eta_3$ | 0.1 | - |

Table 2. Rheological properties used for compressible convection in 3 different layers i.

2.2 Conservation Equations, Boundary Conditions and Solution Method

Using the code StagYY (Tackley, 2008a), we solve the equations for both incompressible (Boussinesq approximation) and compressible (anelastic approximation with infinite Prandtl number) Stokes flow. The equations of conservation of mass, momentum, and energy governing compressible flow are (see (Chandrasekhar, 1961; Schubert, Turcotte, & Olson, 2001) for details):

211

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial x_j} \left(\rho v_j \right) = 0, \tag{9}$$

$$0 = -\frac{\partial P}{\partial x_i} + \frac{\partial}{\partial x_j} \left\{ \eta \left(\frac{\partial v_i}{\partial x_j} + \frac{\partial v_j}{\partial x_i} - \frac{2}{3} \delta_{ij} \frac{\partial v_k}{\partial x_k} \right) \right\} + \rho g_i, \tag{10}$$

$$\rho C_P \left(\frac{\partial T}{\partial t} + \mathbf{v} \cdot \nabla T \right) - \alpha T \left(v_r \cdot \nabla_r P \right) = \nabla \cdot \left(k \nabla T \right) + \frac{\partial v_i}{\partial x_j} \sigma_{ij} + \rho H, \tag{11}$$

²¹⁷ with density ρ , position x_j (j = 1,2,3 hereinafter), velocity component v_j , Kronecker ²¹⁸ delta δ_{ij} , gravity g, specific heat capacity C_P , thermal expansivity α , thermal conduc-²¹⁹ tivity k, stress tensor σ_{ij} and internal heating rate per unit mass H (when specified). ²²⁰ The reader is referred to Rolf et al. (2012) for equations describing incompressible flow.

We use a 2D spherical annulus geometry (Hernlund & Tackley, 2008) with a vary-221 ing radial resolution and the domain is discretized by 768 (lateral) times 64 (radial) cells. 222 4,915,200 tracers are advected through the domain using a 4th-order Runge-Kutta method, 223 and converted to a continuum compositional field using the tracer-ratio method (Tack-224 ley & King, 2003) (983,040 tracers in compressible convection calculations). This rep-225 resents an average of 100 tracers per cell for the incompressible convection simulations 226 and 20 tracers per cell for the simulations considering compressibility and MCP. How-227 ever, in the latter case, the surface cells are typically replenished with tracers due to mag-228 matism, which results in a local increase of tracer density. We employ free-slip bound-229

Table 3. Phase change parameters for Olivine and Pyroxene-Garnet phase systems. $\rho_{\rm S}$ is the

surface density at zero pressure, $\Delta \rho$ is the density jump across a phase transition, and γ is the Clapevron slope.

| Depth (km) | Temperature (K) | $\Delta \rho ~({\rm kg/m^3})$ | $\gamma ~({\rm MPa/K})$ |
|----------------------------|--|-------------------------------|-------------------------|
| Olivine ($\rho_{\rm S} =$ | $= 3240 \mathrm{kg/m^3})$ | | |
| 410 | 1600 | 180 | 2.5 |
| 660 | 1900 | 400 | -2.5 |
| 2740 | 2300 | 61.6 | 10 |
| Pyroxene-Ga | rnet ($\rho_{\rm S} = 3080 \rm kg/s$ | $m^3)$ | |
| 60 | 1000 | 350 | 0 |
| 400 | 1600 | 150 | 1 |
| 720 | 1900 | 400 | 1 |
| 2740 | 2300 | 61.6 | 10 |
| | | | |

ary conditions for the surface and the core-mantle boundary with the surface temper-230 ature fixed as 300 K. In models featuring compressibility, core cooling is included with 231 a parameterization based on (Buffett, Huppert, Lister, & Woods, 1992, 1996) and for 232 the parameterization details, the reader is referred to (Nakagawa & Tackley, 2004). The 233 code uses a finite volume discretization, with velocity and pressure defined on a staggered 234 grid. For incompressible convection calculations, a multigrid solver is used. For compress-235 ible convection calculations, a parallel MUMPS solver from the PETSc package is used 236 (Amestoy, Duff, & L'Excellent, 2000). 237

238 2.3 Ph

2.3 Phase Changes and Composition

The model includes a parameterization based on mineral physics data (Irifune & 239 Ringwood, 1993; Ono, Ito, & Katsura, 2001) in which minerals are divided into olivine 240 and pyroxene-garnet systems that undergo solid-solid phase transitions, as used in pre-241 vious studies (Nakagawa & Tackley, 2012; Xie & Tackley, 2004b). Their mixture depends 242 on the chemical composition, which varies between basalt (100% pyroxene-garnet) and 243 harzburgite (75% olivine and 25% pyroxene-garnet). The mantle is initialized with a py-244 rolytic composition, which is taken as a petrological mixture of 80% harzburgite and 20% 245 basalt (e.g. as in Xu, Lithgow-Bertelloni, Stixrude, and Ritsema (2008)). The phase change 246 parameters are given in Table 3. At a depth of 60 km, basalt forms eclogite, which is around 247 $190 \,\mathrm{kg/m^3}$ denser than olivine. At lowermost mantle depths, the phase transition from 248 perovskite to post-perovskite is also considered (e.g., Tackley, Ammann, Brodholt, Dob-249 son, & Valencia, 2013). 250

254

2.4 Melting and Crustal Production

When melting is considered, melt-induced differentiation changes the composition 255 following previous work by Lourenço et al. (2016); Nakagawa, Tackley, Deschamps, and 256 Connolly (2010); Xie and Tackley (2004b). The composition and temperature fields are 257 stored and advected on tracers. As melting is calculated on a cell level to ensure numer-258 ical efficiency, the cell-based solid composition and melt fraction are computed at cell 259 centers using mass averaging of these tracers. At each time-step, the required change in 260 melt fraction for every cell is computed by comparing cell temperature T_{cell} with the 261 composition-dependent pyrolite solidus T_{sol} (as used by Nakagawa and Tackley (2004)). 262 The solidus temperature is a function fitting experimental data by Herzberg, Raterron, 263

and Zhang (2000) in the upper mantle and by Zerr, Diegeler, and Boehler (1998) in the 264 lower mantle, which is increased linearly by up to 60 K as the basaltic component is de-265 pleted, with no melting possible once the basaltic component has been completely re-266 moved. In case the cell temperature exceeds or is lower than the solidus, then either more melt is generated or the existing melt is frozen in the cell to bring the cell temperature 268 back to the solidus. Latent heat of melt is consumed during melting and released dur-269 ing freezing and the resulting change in temperature ΔT_{cell} is computed for each cell. 270 Accordingly, molten basaltic tracers are created in each cell. If the melt generated on 271 tracers is at less than 300 km depth, it is instantaneously removed and erupted at the 272 surface by transporting the tracers. The erupted melt is further solidified to generate 273 oceanic crust with the surface temperature (Christensen & Hofmann, 1994; Xie & Tack-274 ley, 2004a). This is equivalent to considering a much shorter time-scale of melt migra-275 tion than that of the mantle flow (Kelemen, Hirth, Shimizu, Spiegelman, & Dick, 1997). 276

277

2.5 Criterion for Correlation

To investigate whether there is a correlation between continents and elevated temperatures in the subcontinental mantle, we perform Fourier decompositions of both temperature T and composition C fields. The Fourier coefficients $a_{l,f}, b_{l,f}$ of field f for harmonic degree l are given by:

$$a_{l,f} = \frac{1}{\pi (d_2 - d_1)} \int_{\theta=0}^{2\pi} \int_{d_1}^{d_2} f(\theta, R) \cos(l\theta) \, dR \, d\theta, \tag{12}$$

282

$$b_{l,f} = \frac{1}{\pi (d_2 - d_1)} \int_{\theta=0}^{2\pi} \int_{d_1}^{d_2} f(\theta, R) \sin(l\theta) \, dR \, d\theta,$$
(13)

where d_1 and d_2 are the heights (measured from the base of the mantle) between which 283 the temperature and composition fields are averaged. For the composition field, the Fourier 284 coefficients are obtained by averaging in the top 100 km of the mantle: $d_2-d_1=2890-$ 285 $2790 = 100 \,\mathrm{km}$. The spectral decomposition of the temperature field is computed from 286 70 km below the continent (the same depth is employed below the oceans) to the core-287 mantle boundary: $d_1 = d_{craton} + 70$ where d_{craton} is given in Table 4. As the conti-288 nental material can deform and break apart at its edges, it could sink underneath the 289 existing continents and give a false positive correlation in our calculations. Hence, we 290 consider the temperature field from below a fixed distance of 70 km irrespective of con-291 tinental thickness. Two different depth windows are used: $w_{T1} = 2890 - d_1$ for the whole mantle and $w_{T2} = 1000 - d_1$ for the upper part of the mantle. See Fig. 1 for a 293 schematic representation of the model setup. 294

Using Fourier coefficients, we calculate the correlation function between the temperature T and composition C fields using the relation:

$$\operatorname{corr}_{l,\mathrm{C},\mathrm{T}} = \left(a_{l,\mathrm{C}}a_{l,\mathrm{T}} + b_{l,\mathrm{C}}b_{l,\mathrm{T}}\right) \frac{\pi\Delta T}{\sum_{j=1}^{l} 2/j},\tag{14}$$

where $\Delta T = 2500 \,\mathrm{K}$ is a constant used to dimensionalize temperature. The factor on the right hand side of Eq. 14 is used to obtain the amplitude of the temperature anomalies assuming discontinuous continents. This formulation helps in computing the amplitude of a degree l sinusoidal thermal anomaly below a Heaviside shaped continent of identical degree.

305

2.6 Time-dependence of the Correlation

The time-dependence of the continent-temperature correlation can also be obtained using our spectral analysis. However, the result might not directly answer the question



Figure 1. Schematic representation of the model with continent (red), composition correlation window (orange), and temperature correlation windows $w_{\rm T}$ (teal) as defined in Section 2.5 (not to scale).

of how fast temperature can rise below a continent as the Fourier decomposition simul taneously reports how fast the regions away from the continents cool. Yet, this spectral
 method gives insightful trends concerning the evolution of lateral temperature anoma lies associated with the surface distribution of continents on a global scale.

Since the correlation has the dimensions of temperature, one can calculate the evolution of the lateral temperature anomalies for each harmonic degree. In the present study, we computed an average of the evolution of temperature anomalies over the first 6 degrees only to avoid introducing too much noise. Thus, we used:

$$\left\langle \frac{\partial \operatorname{corr}_{C,T}}{\partial t} \right\rangle = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{l=1}^{N} \frac{1}{t_{\max}} \int_{t=0}^{t_{\max}} \left| \frac{\partial \operatorname{corr}_{l,C,T}}{\partial t} \right| dt \tag{15}$$

where N is the number of harmonics used for the average (N = 6 in the present study) and t_{max} is the final physical time non-renormalized by the average velocity.

318 3 Results

In order to investigate both the magnitude of temperature anomalies appearing be-319 low continents (together with the heating or cooling at a distance from continents) and 320 their effects on mantle convection, we performed two sets of simulations. First, we ex-321 amined 33 cases considering incompressible convection with constant basal and inter-322 nal heating (Table 4). Second, we performed 12 simulations considering compressible con-323 vection with core cooling, no internal heating, melting and crustal production (Table 5). 324 For both sets of simulations, the surface heat flow Q_{surf} and CMB heat flow Q_{cmb} re-325 ported in this paper are obtained by multiplying the heat fluxes obtained in 2D simu-326 lations by the surface area of the Earth. The heat flows can therefore be directly com-327 pared to Earth's values. 328

The absence of melting, and thereby the lack of consumption of latent heat in the first set of simulations allows the mantle temperatures to rise. Thus, we were able to study the effect of core temperature $T_{\rm cmb}$, number of continents $n_{\rm craton}$, radiogenic heating H, and reference viscosity η_0 on the amplitude of these thermal anomalies. In cases with melting and crustal production, we also observed the development of warm thermal anomalies below the continents, which often caused their breakup.

Table 4. Simulations featuring incompressibility with core temperature $T_{\rm cmb}$ (K), radiogenic

heating H (W/kg), cratonic thickness d_{craton} (km), reference viscosity η_0 (Pa·s), number of

continents $n_{\rm craton}$, final model runtime $t_{\rm r}$ (Gyr), average velocity $v_{\rm RMS}$ (cm/yr), mean surface

its amplitude corr (K) and the averaged evolution of the correlation $\langle \partial corr/\partial t \rangle$ (K/Gyr). For

 $_{334}$ correlation, temperature field was averaged in the depth window w_{T1} for all simulations.

| $T_{\rm cmb}$ | Н | η_0 | $n_{\rm craton}$ | d_{craton} | $t_{\rm r}$ | $v_{\rm RMS}$ | Q_{surf} | $Q_{ m cmb}$ | deg | corr | $\langle \partial \mathrm{corr} / \partial t \rangle$ |
|---------------|--------------------|----------------------|------------------|-----------------------|-------------|---------------|---------------------|--------------|-----|--------|---|
| $2000^{s1,x}$ | 0 | $7.88 \cdot 10^{22}$ | 1 | 570 | 4.50 | 0.06 | 2.17 | 2.01 | - | - | - |
| 2000^{x} | 0 | $7.88\cdot10^{22}$ | 2 | 570 | 4.14 | 0.05 | 2.14 | 1.96 | - | - | - |
| 2000^{x} | 0 | $7.88 \cdot 10^{22}$ | 6 | 570 | 3.84 | 0.04 | 1.96 | 1.80 | - | - | - |
| 3000^{a} | 0 | $7.88 \cdot 10^{22}$ | 1 | 570 | 4.50 | 0.46 | 12.57 | 11.78 | 1 | 231.24 | 11.53 |
| 3000^{b} | 0 | $7.88\cdot10^{22}$ | 2 | 570 | 3.60 | 0.40 | 12.67 | 11.55 | 2 | 55.89 | 13.84 |
| 3000^{s2} | 0 | $7.88\cdot10^{22}$ | 3 | 570 | 4.50 | 0.39 | 13.74 | 12.08 | 3 | 3.57 | 37.14 |
| 3000 | 0 | $7.88\cdot10^{22}$ | 4 | 570 | 4.50 | 0.35 | 14.10 | 12.66 | 1 | 17.38 | 21.17 |
| 3000^{x} | 0 | $7.88\cdot10^{22}$ | 5 | 570 | 4.50 | 0.33 | 14.14 | 12.86 | - | - | - |
| 3000^{x} | 0 | $7.88\cdot10^{22}$ | 6 | 570 | 4.50 | 0.26 | 13.72 | 12.91 | - | - | - |
| 4000^{e} | 0 | $7.88\cdot10^{22}$ | 1 | 570 | 4.50 | 1.81 | 31.67 | 34.61 | 2 | 10.02 | 43.62 |
| 4000 | 0 | $7.88\cdot10^{22}$ | 2 | 570 | 4.50 | 1.50 | 33.26 | 35.34 | 2 | 9.78 | 45.35 |
| 4000 | 0 | $7.88\cdot10^{22}$ | 6 | 570 | 2.69 | 1.29 | 31.06 | 36.19 | 1 | 7.29 | 37.07 |
| $2000^{i,x}$ | 0 | $7.88 \cdot 10^{22}$ | 2 | 570 | 2.23 | 0.05 | 2.62 | 2.22 | - | - | - |
| $3000^{c,i}$ | 0 | $7.88\cdot10^{22}$ | 2 | 570 | 2.93 | 0.36 | 13.22 | 11.63 | 1 | 65.81 | 15.83 |
| $4000^{i,x}$ | 0 | $7.88\cdot10^{22}$ | 2 | 570 | 0.89 | 1.03 | 31.57 | 32.88 | - | - | - |
| 3000 | $3\cdot 10^{-12}$ | $7.88\cdot10^{22}$ | 1 | 570 | 4.50 | 1.08 | 20.25 | 12.40 | 1 | 75.71 | 17.47 |
| 3000 | $3 \cdot 10^{-12}$ | $7.88 \cdot 10^{22}$ | 2 | 570 | 4.50 | 0.78 | 21.25 | 13.09 | 2 | 20.84 | 20.06 |
| 3000 | $3\cdot 10^{-12}$ | $7.88\cdot10^{22}$ | 6 | 570 | 4.50 | 0.74 | 21.64 | 13.75 | 1 | 14.47 | 22.02 |
| 3000^{x} | $3 \cdot 10^{-12}$ | $1.57\cdot 10^{22}$ | 1 | 335 | 1.60 | 1.57 | 24.79 | 19.39 | - | - | - |
| 3000 | $3\cdot 10^{-12}$ | $1.57\cdot 10^{22}$ | 2 | 335 | 4.50 | 1.67 | 28.23 | 20.61 | 2 | 14.98 | 34.23 |
| 3000 | $3\cdot 10^{-12}$ | $1.57\cdot 10^{22}$ | 6 | 335 | 4.50 | 1.77 | 27.75 | 20.97 | 2 | 3.84 | 41.34 |
| 3000 | $3\cdot 10^{-12}$ | $7.88\cdot10^{21}$ | 1 | 263 | 4.50 | 2.35 | 29.83 | 23.12 | 1 | 18.34 | 42.12 |
| 3000 | $3\cdot 10^{-12}$ | $7.88\cdot10^{21}$ | 2 | 263 | 4.50 | 2.24 | 29.16 | 23.38 | 2 | 6.40 | 44.77 |
| 3000 | $3 \cdot 10^{-12}$ | $7.88 \cdot 10^{21}$ | 6 | 263 | 4.50 | 2.49 | 29.09 | 24.08 | 1 | 5.67 | 48.08 |
| 3000^{d} | $6 \cdot 10^{-12}$ | $7.88\cdot10^{22}$ | 1 | 570 | 4.50 | 1.88 | 26.52 | 13.20 | 1 | 54.78 | 27.90 |
| 3000 | $6 \cdot 10^{-12}$ | $7.88\cdot10^{22}$ | 2 | 570 | 4.50 | 1.13 | 29.55 | 14.01 | 2 | 28.24 | 28.43 |
| 3000 | $6 \cdot 10^{-12}$ | $7.88\cdot10^{22}$ | 6 | 570 | 4.50 | 1.29 | 29.49 | 14.71 | 6 | -3.76 | 34.58 |
| 3000 | $6 \cdot 10^{-12}$ | $1.57\cdot 10^{22}$ | 1 | 335 | 4.50 | 2.42 | 33.56 | 20.32 | 1 | 20.70 | 41.95 |
| 3000 | $6\cdot 10^{-12}$ | $1.57\cdot 10^{22}$ | 2 | 335 | 4.50 | 2.39 | 34.53 | 21.19 | 2 | 9.33 | 52.56 |
| 3000 | $6\cdot 10^{-12}$ | $1.57\cdot 10^{22}$ | 6 | 335 | 4.50 | 2.80 | 31.67 | 21.21 | 2 | 2.41 | 58.16 |
| 3000^{s3} | $6\cdot 10^{-12}$ | $7.88\cdot10^{21}$ | 1 | 263 | 4.50 | 3.05 | 35.74 | 23.70 | 1 | 17.79 | 59.39 |
| 3000 | $6\cdot 10^{-12}$ | $7.88\cdot10^{21}$ | 2 | 263 | 4.50 | 2.99 | 36.73 | 24.30 | 2 | 5.64 | 48.99 |
| 3000 | $6\cdot 10^{-12}$ | $7.88\cdot10^{21}$ | 6 | 263 | 4.50 | 3.44 | 35.82 | 24.83 | 1 | 6.29 | 52.72 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

 $\overline{a-e}$ cases presented in Section 3.1.1 and Fig. 2, 3 and 4.

 $^{s1-s3}$ additional cases presented in Appendix Fig. A.1, A.2 and A.3

 x unrealistic cases excluded from empirical regressions. See text for details.

 i continents initialized 90 degrees apart.

heat flow Q_{surf} (TW), mean CMB heat flow Q_{cmb} (TW), dominant degree of correlation deg,

Table 5. Simulations featuring compressibility with MCP and without internal heating. Initial 335

core temperature $T_{\rm cmb}$ (K), number of continents $n_{\rm craton}$, depth window for averaging tem-336

perature field $w_{\rm T}$, average velocity $v_{\rm RMS}$ (cm/yr), mean surface heat flow $Q_{\rm surf}$ (TW), mean 337

CMB heat flow $Q_{\rm cmb}$ (TW), dominant degree of correlation deg, its amplitude corr (K) and the 338

averaged evolution of the correlation $\langle \partial \operatorname{corr} / \partial t \rangle$ (K/Gyr). Reference viscosity $\eta_0 = 1 \cdot 10^{20} \operatorname{Pa} \cdot \mathrm{s}$, 339 340

cratonic thickness $d_{\rm craton} = 231$ km, and final model runtime $t_{\rm r} = 4.5$ Gyr for all simulations.

| $T_{\rm cmb}$ | n_{craton} | w_{T} | $v_{\rm RMS}$ | Q_{surf} | $Q_{ m cmb}$ | deg | corr | $\langle \partial \mathrm{corr} / \partial t \rangle$ |
|---------------|-----------------------|------------------|---------------|---------------------|--------------|-----|-------|---|
| 3500 | 1 | 1 | 1.19 | 16.35 | 5.85 | 1 | 38.86 | 24.22 |
| 3500^{f} | 1 | 2 | 0.91 | 13.12 | 5.45 | 1 | 17.32 | 74.22 |
| 3500 | 2 | 1 | 0.89 | 12.63 | 5.68 | 1 | 56.06 | 27.76 |
| 3500 | 2 | 2 | 0.94 | 13.04 | 5.92 | 2 | 20.30 | 42.73 |
| 4000 | 1 | 1 | 2.03 | 18.40 | 12.59 | 1 | 19.62 | 62.78 |
| 4000^{g} | 1 | 2 | 1.74 | 17.48 | 13.17 | 1 | 28.08 | 89.76 |
| 4000 | 2 | 1 | 1.52 | 17.77 | 13.31 | 2 | 13.26 | 59.89 |
| 4000 | 2 | 2 | 2.01 | 16.68 | 12.03 | 2 | 0.07 | 65.41 |
| 4500 | 1 | 1 | 1.48 | 18.58 | 13.23 | 7 | -3.05 | 46.29 |
| 4500^{h} | 1 | 2 | 1.50 | 19.02 | 13.33 | 1 | 23.52 | 85.67 |
| 4500 | 2 | 1 | 1.50 | 16.97 | 13.30 | 9 | -5.47 | 41.89 |
| 4500 | 2 | 2 | 1.49 | 19.31 | 12.95 | 2 | 5.95 | 79.38 |

 g case presented in Fig. 5.

 f^{-h} cases presented in Fig. 6.

347

350

351

352

353

354

355

356

3.1 First Set of Simulations: Incompressible Convection Without MCP

In this set of simulations, we systematically varied the following parameters (see 348 Table 4): 349

- Constant internal heating: $H = 0, 3 \cdot 10^{-12}$ and $6 \cdot 10^{-12}$ W/kg,
 - + Constant core temperature: $T_{\rm cmb}=2000,\,3000$ and 4000 K,
 - Initial number of continents: 1, 2 and 6, where the sum of the continents' length is always 30% of the surface length,
 - Initial position of continents: antipodal points and 90 degrees apart,
 - Reference viscosity: $\eta_0 = 7.88 \cdot 10^{21}$, $1.57 \cdot 10^{22}$ and $7.88 \cdot 10^{22}$ Pa·s (see Table 1 for all parameters).

The thickness of continents is decided in accordance with the expected background 357 lithospheric thickness as cratons on Earth have a larger thickness than the oceanic litho-358 sphere. Boundary layer theory (Solomatov, 1995) demonstrates that self-consistently form-359 ing boundary layers depend on the Rayleigh number Ra: $\delta \simeq D Ra^{-1/3}$, where δ is the 360 lithospheric thickness and D is the mantle thickness. The Rayleigh number itself depends 361 on several quantities that are kept fixed in our simulations but also on the core to sur-362 face temperature difference and the internal viscosity. For simplicity, since we vary the 363 core temperature much less than the viscosity in our parameter space, we chose to only 364 use a viscosity-dependent continent thickness. Assuming an oceanic boundary layer thick-365 ness of $\delta_{\text{oceanic},E} = 100 \,\text{km}$ and continental boundary layer thickness of $\delta_{\text{craton},E} =$ 366 210 km for the Earth, our oceanic and continental initial lithosphere thicknesses are obtained using the relation $\delta_{\text{model}} = (\eta/\eta_E)^{1/3} \cdot \delta_E$ as used previously in (Rolf & Tackley, 2011). This ensures that the continents are always thicker than the surrounding litho-367 368 369 sphere for any choice of reference viscosity. A small thermal perturbation of 125 K is in-370 troduced in the mid-mantle at 3 o'clock to help initiate the first upwellings. In this set 371

of simulations, a value of 1550 K is used for initial potential temperature T_{P0} , which represents the temperature of a given portion of the mantle if it ascended adiabatically to the surface without undergoing melting (McKenzie & Bickle, 1988).

375 3.1.1 Qualitative Observations

384

385

386

Fig. 2, 3 and 4 depict the temporal evolution of five cases to help understand why and how positive temperature anomalies tend to be located below continents. Fig. 2 shows the evolution of the temperature fields and Fig. 3 represents the evolution of the correlation between temperature and composition field (cratons) for harmonic degrees 1 to 10. Fig. 4 shows the time series of CMB heat flow $Q_{\rm cmb}$, surface heat flow $Q_{\rm surf}$, and the fraction of internal heating $(Q_{\rm surf}-Q_{\rm cmb})/Q_{\rm surf}$. The rows of these three figures are organized as follows:

- a: 3000 K, one supercontinent, no internal heating,
 - b: 3000 K, two continents initially at antipodal points, no internal heating,
 - c: 3000 K, two continents initially 90 degrees apart, no internal heating,
 - d: 3000 K, one supercontinent, strong internal heating $(H = 6 \cdot 10^{-12} \text{ W/kg})$.
- e: 4000 K, one supercontinent, no internal heating
- All five cases employ a reference viscosity of $7.88 \cdot 10^{22}$ Pa·s.

In cases a - e, the initial plumes rising from the core-mantle boundary are slower be-389 low the continents. Away from the continents, the oceanic lithosphere is weak enough 390 to subduct and it brings cold material down into the lower mantle. This increases the 391 thermal contrast between the surrounding mantle and regions of plume generation and 392 provides additional buoyancy to the plumes, which quickly diffuse their heat while reach-393 ing the surface. As the continents are 100 times more viscous and have 10 times the yield 394 stress compared to the oceanic lithosphere, they do not break. The thermal contrast be-395 tween the subcontinental and suboceanic mantle is enhanced by the cold downwellings 396 along continental margins and in regions away from the continents. 397

In case *a* presented in Fig. 2a, the correlation between continent and temperature field arises as soon as convection cells form due to the strength of the cratonic material and this correlation is maintained throughout the simulation with a maximum amplitude of 237 K.

Additionally, cases b, c with 2 continents (each covering 15% of surface area) ini-402 tialized at antipodal points and 90 degrees apart are also presented in Fig. 2b and 2c, re-403 spectively. When the 2 continents are at antipodal points, a degree-2 thermal structure 404 is dominant in the mantle (Fig. 2b and 3b) with an episode of anti-correlation in degree-405 2 between 1 and 1.5 Gyr of evolution. This anti-correlation can be understood by look-406 ing at the third column of Fig. 2b, which shows that downwellings can be pushed to the 407 edges of the continents and produce cold anomalies below the continents. In Fig. 2c and 408 3c, continents are first closer to each other until 500 Myr, which generates a degree-1 cor-409 relation. They drift apart and form a degree-2 correlation until 1.3 Gyr and then come 410 close again, which brings the correlation back to degree-1. These cases show that ther-411 mal structure of the mantle and the degree of the continent-temperature correlation fol-412 lows the geometrical configuration of the cratons. 413

In internally heated case *d* presented in Fig. 2d, radiogenic heating strongly increases the internal temperature with time as melting and crustal production is not employed in this simulation. For Earth, the internal temperature would be buffered by the removal of latent heat resulting from MCP. Still, one can see that downwellings preferentially stay away from continents despite the non-stationarity of the flow patterns and the efficient stirring. Correlation in degree-1 and degree-2 is observed (see also Fig. 3d). In case e shown in Fig. 2e, despite the fact that a degree-1 correlation is formed,
the large core temperature generates strong plumes which tend to push the continent
laterally. This explains why the continent moves over a cold region (3rd column) and generates an anti-correlation (see arrow in Fig. 3e).

As seen in the second column of each row of Fig. 2, downwellings preferentially prop-424 agate through the lower mantle, also below continents, but the subcontinental upper man-425 the stays warm. This observation lead us to investigate the correlation using both the 426 whole mantle and the upper part of mantle in the second set of simulations (see Fig. 1) 427 and rows 3 and 6 in Table 6). Despite the known limitations of numerical models, this 428 observation is probably robust and applies to the Earth. Even if slabs rebound at the 429 660 km discontinuity on Earth, they do not tend to come back up below cratons due to 430 their weight. 431

442

Effects of the Reference Viscosity and Internal Heating Rate

Fig. 2d and 3d show that a degree-1 correlation below a supercontinent persists with 443 strong internal heating but is lower in amplitude. We observe that a decrease in refer-444 ence viscosity (see Fig. A.1s3 and A.2s3) or an increase of internal heating rate both tend 445 to decrease the magnitude of the correlation between continents and subcontinental man-446 tle temperature. In both cases, convective stirring laterally scatters thermal anomalies 447 which intrinsically decreases the correlation. This naturally happens when the reference 448 viscosity is low as the flow is vigorous and small wavelengths form while broader plumes 449 are no longer present. When strong radiogenic heating is considered, strong stirring takes 450 some time to appear as it arises from the decrease of viscosity with time. 451

452 Effect of the Core Temperature

Cases with $T_{\rm cmb} = 2000 \,\mathrm{K}$ (for example, see Fig. A.1s1 and A.2s1) show similar 453 processes of rising mantle plumes, subduction and entrainment of cold slabs in the con-454 vecting mantle and a buildup of elevated temperatures in the subcontinental mantle. Yet, 455 the low core temperature does not allow the mantle to maintain an internal tempera-456 ture, which is comparable to the observed present-day value. Large downwellings strongly 457 decrease the ambient temperature well below 1000 K, which leads to an unrealistic sit-458 uation where the mantle has huge blobs of high viscosity and the entire lithosphere starts 459 to drift. We do not use these cases for our empirical regressions of correlation amplitude 460 (discussed further in Section 4.4.1). In cases with $T_{\rm cmb} = 4000\,{\rm K}$ (for example, see Fig. 2e 461 and 3e), there are many more thermal instabilities at the bottom, which is expected with 462 a hotter core. Again, the region of subcontinental mantle warming develops (seen as degree-463 1 correlation in Fig. 3e) but this warm thermal anomaly disappears over time due to a stronger convective flow. 465

470

3.1.2 Evolution of surface and CMB heat flows

Fig. 4 represents the evolution of the heat flow of the simulations previously dis-471 cussed (Fig. 2 and 3). We display surface and CMB heat flows (see purple and green curves 472 with left y-axis). The normalized difference between top and bottom heat flows is also 473 shown (see yellow curve with right y-axis). This quantity reflects the evolution of aver-474 age temperature of the mantle in cases without internal heating and converges to zero 475 when the equilibrium is reached. When internal heating is active, the heat flow differ-476 ence also reflects the amount of radiogenic heating, preventing it from reaching zero even 477 478 if an equilibrium is found (as seen in Fig. 4d).

Fig. 4a, 4b and 4c show that the simulations excluding internal heating and considering a realistic core temperature (3000 K in incompressible convection simulations correspond to ~4000 K in reality when considering the adiabatic temperature increase



Figure 2. Thermal evolution of the cases *a-e* featuring incompressibility and without MCP.
White triangles demarcate the continents, which are represented by composition field (white)
superimposed over the temperature field. A small thermal anomaly of 125 K is introduced in the
mid-mantle at 3 o'clock in all these models.

with depth) quickly reach an equilibrium. The heat flows themselves stabilize and their time-averaged difference is close to zero, with significant short-timescale fluctuations. A slight tendency for cooling is more visible in case c which has 2 continents initialized at non-antipodal positions. Fig. 4d shows that radiogenic heating warms up the planet. The last two billion years of evolution show the equilibrium state in which radiogenic heating stabilizes the difference between surface and CMB heat flows. One can see that the



Figure 3. (left) Spectrogram of the cases *a-e* featuring incompressibility and without MCP, where positive (red to yellow) and negative (shades of blue) values indicate correlation and anticorrelation between continental material at the surface and elevated temperatures underneath respectively (using temperature correlation window w_{T1}). Also shown are the minimum and maximum temperature contrasts obtained from the models. (right) Initial state of the models with continents (white).

initial difference between the heat flows is lower, which means that the mantle is warming up (also seen in Fig. 2d). Fig. 4e shows that the planet gradually warms up due to

⁴⁹⁰ the large core temperature. The average heat flow difference is slightly negative and the



Figure 4. Time series of heat flow at the core-mantle boundary $Q_{\rm cmb}$ and at the surface $Q_{\rm surf}$ on the left y-axis for the cases *a-e* featuring incompressibility and without MCP. Also shown, on the right-axis is the fraction of internal heating $(Q_{\rm surf} - Q_{\rm cmb})/Q_{\rm surf}$ as a function of time. Note that case e has different limits on both y-axes.

⁴⁹¹ absolute values of heat flows slightly increase with time. This is due to the decrease in ⁴⁹² internal viscosity of the mantle. However, the heat flows do not vary more than $\sim 10\%$. Although Fig. 4 depicts the general thermal evolution of the planet, we do not find a direct correlation between heat flows (or their difference) and the evolution of the continenttemperature correlation.

496

510

3.2 Second Set of Simulations: Compressible Convection With MCP

In this second set of simulations, we used a more realistic setup in which the core
cools with time, and more importantly, melting and crustal production are considered.
As these features result in much higher computational costs, a smaller number of simulations were run in the selected parameter space.

The primary distinguishing aspect of these models is the inclusion of melting of py-501 rolytic mantle and the subsequent basaltic crustal production. Two different correlation 502 windows $w_{\rm T}$ define the depth range over which the temperature field is averaged with 503 $w_{T1} = 300 - 2890$ km and $w_{T2} = 300 - 1000$ km. Continental thickness is initialized 504 as 230 km and all the cases have mixed heating with a reference viscosity $\eta_0 = 10^{20} \,\mathrm{Pa} \cdot \mathrm{s}$ 505 (the viscosity now also depends on pressure). The initial potential temperature is 1900 K 506 in this set of simulations. For numerical reasons, there is no radiogenic heating in these 507 simulations. Unlike the incompressible convection cases, no thermal anomaly is intro-508 duced in the models because it might lead to an artificial melting event. 509

3.2.1 Qualitative Observations

In this set of simulations, the mechanical behavior leading to cooling around the continents by the formation of downwellings at the continental margins is also observed but the melting and crustal production events break the continents apart and therefore destroy the correlation.

Fig. 5A shows the time-dependence of the correlation for harmonic degrees 1-10 while 515 the breakup of a supercontinent is illustrated in Fig. 5B on global (annuli) and local (white 516 boxes) scales with a further magnification of the key regions (yellow boxes) for case q517 (given in Table 5). A degree-1 correlation with an amplitude ~ 30 K can be seen in Fig. 5A, 518 indicating that the subcontinental mantle is hotter than the suboceanic mantle. A spike 519 in this correlation amplitude (up to $67 \,\mathrm{K}$) at time $t_1 = 713 \,\mathrm{Myr}$ is observed when a man-520 tle plume reaches the upper mantle and results in voluminous magmatism. Following this, 521 the correlation in higher degrees albeit with lower amplitudes is observed owing to su-522 percontinent breakup. A quick comparison between the initial state and the later stages 523 of the simulation shows that the continental material gets deformed and thinned over 524 time owing to convective stresses. 525

At time $t_1 = 713$ Myr in Fig. 5B, the elevated subcontinental temperatures and the 526 arrival of a mantle plume in the subcontinental region cause temperatures that exceed 527 the pyrolytic mantle solidus. This results in decompression melting of the hot astheno-528 spheric mantle (White & McKenzie, 1989), which generates basaltic melt (light blue). 529 If this melt is in the top 300 km, then it is instantaneously removed from this depth and 530 placed at the surface above the continents to create oceanic crust or continental flood 531 basalt (pink, $\geq 30\%$ in a cell) and simulate volcanic eruption (see Section 2.4 for imple-532 mentation details). With time, this basaltic material gets buried and transforms into eclog-533 ite at a depth of 60 km following the phase changes introduced in Section 2.3. Eclogite 534 is around 190 kg/m^3 denser than olivine, and its negative buoyancy creates stresses that 535 weaken the continents. This cold eclogitic crust along with the continental material be-536 comes gravitationally unstable in the lithosphere (Lourenço et al., 2016) and starts to 537 sink into the lower mantle. As a result of this downgoing material, a return flow devel-538 ops in the mantle. A combination of this dense eclogitic material and the return man-539 the flow thins the continent inducing a continental rift at time $t_2 = 782$ Myr. By time 540 $t_3 = 785 \,\mathrm{Myr}$, the supercontinent breaks apart into two smaller continents, which start 541

to drift in opposite directions. Following the breakup, small-scale sublithospheric convection (Ballmer, van Hunen, Ito, Tackley, & Bianco, 2007; Bonatti & Harrison, 1976; Buck & Parmentier, 1986; Haxby & Weissel, 1986; Marquart, Schmeling, & Braun, 1999) starts in the subcontinental mantle at time $t_4 = 793$ Myr causing further decompression melting and the continent-temperature correlation fades away. The buildup of a new correlation requires large-scale mantle flow reorganization, which might never happen if the continents are too small or too mobile.

As the thermal boundary layer grows faster in the suboceanic mantle, small-scale 549 sublithospheric convection cells develop there earlier than time $t_1 = 713$ Myr. As a re-550 sult of partial melting in the suboceanic mantle, latent heat is consumed and this also 551 contributes towards the aforementioned correlation. Supercontinent breakup happens 552 over a period of $\sim 70 \,\mathrm{Myr}$ in the model presented here. The timing of this breakup might 553 strongly depend on the reference viscosity, which was not tested in this set of simula-554 tions. In simulations with lower initial core temperature of 3500 K, similar continental 555 breakup can last up to 300 Myr. 556

570

3.2.2 Evolution of surface and CMB heat flows

Fig. 6 shows the evolution of heat flow for three cases f-h (given in Table 5) each 571 with a supercontinent but with a different initial core temperature. As core cooling is 572 considered in simulations featuring compressible convection, a decrease in the CMB heat 573 flow $Q_{\rm cmb}$ is observed throughout their evolution. The positive fluctuations in the $Q_{\rm surf}$ 574 are attributed to the arrival of successive mantle plumes, which cause decompression melt-575 ing. These fluctuations become more frequent for cases with higher initial core temper-576 ature as they have a larger number of thermal instabilities at the bottom boundary. The 577 initial spikes in the Q_{surf} are because of the large amount of heat being transferred to 578 the surface with the eruption of basaltic melt. An equilibrium regime is never reached 579 in these simulations as the core never stops cooling. All simulations stopped with a CMB 580 heat flow between 5 and 10 TW. 581

582 4 Discussion

583

4.1 Empirical Regressions of the Continent-Temperature Correlation

Our spectral decomposition of temperature and composition fields allows us to quan-584 tify the correlation between continents and subcontinental mantle temperature (and neg-585 ative temperature anomalies away from continents). Using most of the cases listed in Ta-586 ble 4 (see superscripts in the table for details), we were able to find a first order empir-587 ical equation to quantify the magnitude of the correlation. Table 6 summarizes our es-588 timations for the first and second sets of simulations. For the first set of simulations, 4 589 parameters have been used to perform the regression of the correlation: $T_{\rm cmb}$, $n_{\rm craton}$, 590 H and η_0 . For the second set, H and η_0 were identical in all simulations and are there-591 fore absent from the regressions. Two fits are provided for the second set of simulations 592 as we perform correlations in the entire mantle (300-2890 km) and upper part of man-593 tle (300-1000 km). 594

Estimating the relative impact of our input parameters on the intensity of the continent-595 temperature correlation is a difficult exercise as there is no physical model providing an 596 analytical expression. Moreover, the correlation sometimes takes negative values, which 597 makes it impossible to employ standard power law formulations as is commonly done in 598 boundary layer theory for various quantities. We have tried various expressions to at-599 tempt to best fit the correlation: linear functions, power law, exponential, linear times 600 exponential, hyperbolic tangent, etc. In all cases, many parameter combinations were 601 tested. It appears that the regression giving the lowest standard deviation (within this 602 small space of functions listed above) is achieved by adding a constant to the correla-603 tion to make it always positive and then taking the logarithm of the sum, as shown in 604



557 Figure 5. Continental breakup in a compressible convection simulation (case g) with MCP, $4000 \mathrm{K} \mathrm{CMB}$ temperature, supercontinent, no internal heating, and correlation temperature win-558 dow w_{T2} . A: Spectrogram showing how the dominant harmonic degree changes with time. B: 559 Thermal and compositional evolution with time on global (annuli) and local (white boxes) scales 560 with a further magnification of the key regions (yellow boxes). Superimposed over the tempera-561 ture field are the continents (white), basaltic melt (light blue) and basaltic crust (pink, $\geq 30\%$ in 562 a cell). Red arrows indicate the direction of continental drift. Also shown is the initial state of 563 the simulation. 564

Table 6. This arbitrary logarithmic expression reflects the small influence of most parameters when the correlation is low. In our tests, using a power law expression of the sum



Figure 6. Time series of heat flow at the core-mantle boundary $Q_{\rm cmb}$ and at the surface $Q_{\rm surf}$ on the left y-axis for the cases *f*-*h* featuring compressibility and MCP. Also shown, on the right-axis is the fraction of internal heating $(Q_{\rm surf} - Q_{\rm cmb})/Q_{\rm surf}$ as a function of time. The thermal and compositional evolution along with the correlation spectrogram of case *g* is depicted in Fig. 5.

of the correlation with a constant gave a very similar standard deviation and showed identical relative importance of the parameters. We emphasize that the reader should not attempt to extrapolate these regressions away from the parameter window of the current study as they are not obtained from a physics-based scaling law.

Using our physically arbitrary formulation, we observe that an increase in $T_{\rm cmb},$ 611 $n_{\rm craton}$, and H, or a decrease in viscosity, all lead to a decrease in correlation. The dom-612 inant degree was used to fit the second set of simulations instead of the initial number 613 of continents as the continents are split in several parts and therefore their number varies. 614 Looking at the entire mantle, we find that the core temperature plays a negligible role 615 in forming a correlation. Yet, the third row in Table 6 shows that the correlation between 616 the temperature of the upper part of the mantle and the continents strongly depends on 617 the core temperature. This shows that the plumes provide large temperature anomalies 618 in the upper part of the mantle but contribute less to the formation of low degree pat-619 terns in the lower mantle. Moreover, broad downwellings tend to gather in the lower man-620 the disregarding the continental configuration at the surface due to the spherical geom-621 etry. 622

⁶²⁹ **Table 6.** Empirical regressions of the continent-temperature correlation (K) and their evolu-

tion (K/Gyr). $\operatorname{corr}_{i,C,T}$ is the correlation amplitude of the degree that shows the highest value.

These simple estimations are designed to show the relative importance of different parameters

but are not based on a physical model. They should therefore not be physically interpreted or extrapolated.

| Incompressible convection - No melting | Stand. Dev. |
|--|--------------|
| $\ln\left(\operatorname{corr}_{i,\mathrm{C},\mathrm{T}}-6.944\right) = 0.732 - 2.07 \left(\frac{T_{\mathrm{cmb}}-3000}{500}\right) - 4.416 \left(\frac{n_{\mathrm{craton}}}{3} - 1\right) - 0.893 \left(\frac{H}{2.72 \cdot 10^{-12}} - 1\right) - 1.043 \left(\frac{1.57 \cdot 10^{22}}{\eta_0} - 1\right)$ | 7.31 (K) |
| Compressible convection - Melting - whole mantle | Stand. Dev. |
| $\ln\left(\text{corr}_{i,\text{C},\text{T}} - 1.148\right) = 0.980 - 3.154\left(\frac{\text{degree}}{3} - 1\right)$ | 6.77 (K) |
| Compressible convection - Melting - upper part of mantle | Stand. Dev. |
| $\ln\left(\operatorname{corr}_{i,\mathrm{C},\mathrm{T}} + 6.254\right) = 2.711 - 0.810\left(\frac{\operatorname{degree}}{3} - 1\right) - 0.733\left(\frac{T_{\mathrm{cmb}} - 4000}{500}\right)$ | 4.98 (K) |
| Incompressible convection - No melting | Stand. Dev. |
| $\left\langle \frac{\text{corr}_{\text{C},\text{T}}}{\partial t} \right\rangle = 61.97 + 22.81 \left(\log \left(\frac{1.57 \cdot 10^{22}}{\eta_0} \right) - 1 \right) + 2.56 \left(\frac{n_{\text{craton}}}{3} - 1 \right) + 13.2 \left(\frac{T_{\text{cmb}} - 3000}{500} \right) + 7.61 \left(\frac{H}{2.72 \cdot 10^{-12}} - 1 \right)$ | 7.31 (K/Gyr) |
| Compressible convection - Melting - whole mantle | Stand. Dev. |
| $\left\langle \frac{\text{corr}C,T}{\partial t} \right\rangle = 61.34 + 9.05 \left(\frac{T_{\text{cmb}} - 4000}{500} \right) - 26.29 \left(\frac{T_{\text{cmb}} - 4000}{500} \right)^2$ | 1.83 (K/Gyr) |
| Compressible convection - Melting - upper part of mantle | Stand. Dev. |
| $\left\langle \frac{\text{corr}_{\text{C},\text{T}}}{\partial t} \right\rangle = 87.95 + 12.03 \left(\frac{T_{\text{cmb}} - 4000}{500} \right) - 7.08 \left(\frac{T_{\text{cmb}} - 4000}{500} \right)^2 - 20.71 \left(n_{\text{craton}} - 1 \right)$ | 5.30 (K/Gyr) |

Fig. 7A plots the correlations used to perform the empirical fits (on the y-axis) versus the results of the fits (x-axis). Globally, correlation amplitudes are between 0 and 40 K but also reach up to 100 to 200 K. Amplitudes of correlations in simulations considering melting and crustal production reach a maximum of 30 to 60 K (red squares and purple diamonds respectively). Overall, regressions are of good quality as the standard deviations are of the order of 5-7 K (see Table 6).

639

640

4.2 Empirical Regressions of the Evolution of the Continent-Temperature Correlation

The last columns of Table 4 and 5 show the average evolution of the continent-temperature correlation. In Table 6 and Fig. 7B, we present empirical regressions of this evolution.

Concerning the spectral analysis of the evolution of continent-temperature correlation, two important points should be noted. First, $\langle \partial \operatorname{corr}/\partial t \rangle$ (see Eq. 15) is not directly equal to the increase of absolute temperature below continents as it also reflects the decrease of temperature due to downwellings around the continents. Second, $\langle \partial \operatorname{corr}/\partial t \rangle$ provides an average of the independent evolution of several harmonics (up to degree 6
in the present study). In real space, harmonics might locally sum up and provide a much
larger or much lower correlation increase. Yet, the rather low standard deviations presented in Table 6 show that insightful trends and orders of magnitude can be obtained
using this method.

Overall, it appears that the evolution of the continent-temperature correlation is on the order of 10-100 K per billion year (see Table 4, 5 and Fig. 7B). In our cases featuring incompressible convection, we observe that decreasing the reference viscosity or increasing the number of continents, the initial core temperature or the internal heating results in an increase in the time-dependence of the correlation (see the fourth row in Table 6). Each of these contributions is discussed further.

A low viscosity favors both convective cooling around the cratons and their mobility. When the viscosity is low, downwellings can quickly cool a large volume of mantle surrounding the regions below the cratons, resulting in a rapid growth of correlation with time. Moreover, when cratons drift above cold regions, the continent-temperature correlation also quickly drops. The kinetics of both processes are increased by lower viscosities.

Increasing the number of continents slightly increases the time-dependence of the 664 correlation. Although this effect is minor, it might be due to the fact that numerous con-665 tinents are smaller in size, which makes it more difficult to maintain a potential corre-666 lation. A large core temperature generates warm plumes which slow down mantle cool-667 ing, tend to increase subcontinental mantle temperatures and push continents laterally. 668 These three mechanisms lead to a larger time-dependence of the correlation. Finally, in-669 ternal heating tends to both increase the subcontinental mantle temperature and decrease 670 the ambient viscosity. Both mechanisms lead to a high time-dependence of the correla-671 tion. 672



Figure 7. A: Numerical continent-temperature correlations (K) (y-axis) versus their empirical regressions as defined in Table 6 (x-axis) for all cases. B: The evolution of the correlation with time (see Eq. 15). Black circles represent the first set of simulations with no melting and crustal production, diamonds and squares depict the results of the second set of simulations. Correlations are of the order of tens to hundreds of K.

In compressible convection cases, looking at the entire mantle (fifth row in Table 6), 673 we observe that the time-dependence of the correlation is maximal for a core temper-674 ature of 4000 K (and not 4500 K as could be expected). We chose to represent this non-675 linearity by a second order polynomial in our regressions (see Table 6, fifth and sixth rows). This can be explained by the fact that the lowest core temperature considered here (3500 K, 677 for example in case f) does not generate very vigorous plumes. The mantle therefore cools 678 more efficiently which increases the viscosity and slows down the kinetics of convection. 679 On the contrary, a large core temperature (4500 K, for example in case h) generates such 680 widespread magnatism that continents are rapidly destroyed. Moreover, lateral motion 681 of the continent is observed in the simulation employing a core temperature of 4000 K 682 (case q). This is due to the fact that enough crust is produced to create strong lateral 683 density gradients in the lithosphere, leading to the mobility of the continent. When looking at the upper part of the mantle in compressible convection cases (sixth row in Ta-685 ble 6), one can see that the time-dependence of the correlation always increases with in-686 creasing core temperature, although we still observe some non-linearity as shown by the 687 second order term. Overall, both the magnitude of the correlation and its time-dependence 688 are higher when looking at the upper part of the mantle. 689

4.3 Illustration of our Regressions

Fig. 8 illustrates the regressions for temperature-continent correlation in the up-691 per part of the mantle as presented in Table 6. Since we did not systematically vary in-692 ternal heating and the reference viscosity in our compressible convection models, we in-693 ferred the influence of these parameters as determined from regressions for incompress-694 ible convection cases to estimate their influence on the correlation. We obtained a com-695 posite formulation based on both compressible and incompressible convection simula-696 tions which contains the four contributions of internal heating, reference viscosity, num-697 ber of continents and initial core temperature. We obtained the following equations: 698

$$\operatorname{corr} = 6.254 + \exp\left[2.711 - 0.733\left(\frac{T_{\text{cmb}} - 4000}{500}\right) - 0.81\left(\frac{n_{\text{craton}}}{3} - 1\right) - 0.893\left(\frac{H}{2.72 \cdot 10^{-12}}\right) - 1.043\left(\log\left(\frac{10^{21}}{\eta_0}\right) - 1\right)\right]$$
(16)
$$\left\langle \frac{\operatorname{corr}_{\text{C},\text{T}}}{\partial t} \right\rangle = 87.95 + 12.03\left(\frac{T_{\text{cmb}} - 4000}{500}\right) - 7.08\left(\frac{T_{\text{cmb}} - 4000}{500}\right)^2 - 20.71\left(n_{\text{craton}} - 1\right) + 22.81\left(\ln\left(\frac{10^{21}}{\eta_0}\right) - 1\right) + 7.61\left(\frac{H}{2.72 \cdot 10^{-12}}\right)$$
(17)

Fig. 8 represents the correlations obtained using our regression (Eq. 16). The im-699 pact of initial core temperature on the correlation is represented for an Earth-like range. 700 Initial core temperature in the Archean Earth was most probably higher than the present-701 day value which is considered to be close to 4000 K. We show how the correlation decreases 702 with core temperature. Fig. 8 also shows that increasing the viscosity by a factor 2 adds 703 5-15 K to the temperature anomalies below continents. Suppressing internal heating in-704 creases the correlation by 10-30 K. Considering 2 cratons instead of 1 supercontinent only 705 decreases the temperature anomalies by few K. Again one should keep in mind that these 706 absolute values are an average of the low degrees which are potentially locally additive. 707

Eq. 17 shows that a large core temperature tends to make the correlation very timedependent. On the contrary, a low core temperature generates larger correlations subject to slower evolutions. Increasing the viscosity by a factor 2 or removing internal heating slows down the oscillations by a factor 2 for the reference case represented in Fig. 8.

- Finally, considering 2 cratons instead of 1 tends to slightly slow down the evolution al-
- ⁷¹³ though it decreases the correlation itself.



Figure 8. Illustration of the empirical regressions: Continent-temperature correlations as a function of initial core temperature. The set of parameters representing the reference case is: $\eta_0 = 10^{20} \text{ Pa} \cdot \text{s}, H = 3 \cdot 10^{-12} \text{ W/kg}, 1 \text{ craton and } T_{\text{cmb}} = 4000 \text{ K}.$

4.4 Implications of our Results

Even though our global models are rather simplified when compared to the real Earth,
they help us understand and make general remarks on the long-term thermal and mechanical influence of continents on the underlying mantle and vice versa. In this section,
we illustrate the significance of our results and support them by comparing them to geological and geophysical observations as well as previous numerical studies.

723

4.4.1 Previous Work, Model Parameters and Seismic Observations

Our models show that continents are capable of trapping heat in the underlying 724 mantle causing subcontinental mantle warming. The amplitude of this warming changes 725 with continental extent, CMB temperature, reference viscosity and internal heating. A 726 higher amplitude is observed with a supercontinent (up to 237 K, see Fig 3a) and it de-727 creases with smaller extent of the continents. This finding agrees with the previous re-728 sults of Coltice et al. (2007); Lenardic et al. (2011); O'Neill et al. (2009); B. R. Phillips 729 and Coltice (2010); Rolf et al. (2012) all of whom reported elevated temperatures be-730 low continents in their numerical studies. Furthermore, our models show that such ther-731 mal anomalies in the subcontinental mantle can persist for hundreds of millions of years 732 and even when the continents are mobile. In all our models, the development of subduc-733 tion zones along continental margins helps in enhancing the thermal contrast between 734 subcontinental and suboceanic mantle. Similar behavior has been observed in the prior 735 work of Heron and Lowman (2011); Heron, Lowman, and Stein (2015); Lenardic et al. 736 (2011); O'Neill et al. (2009). 737

We have tested the impact of basal heating on correlation by initializing our models with different CMB temperature at the bottom boundary. The need to test this arises due to the uncertain nature and contribution of CMB heat flow towards mantle dynamics. Continental motion is attributed to the viscous stresses imparted by the convect-

ing mantle and the extent of this motion depends on the heat budget of the mantle. CMB 742 heat flow, internal heating from decay of radioactive elements in the mantle, and sec-743 ular mantle cooling contribute to this heat budget. Recent indications that the core's 744 thermal conductivity may be three times higher than previously inferred mineral physics 745 estimates (de Koker, Steinle-Neumann, & Vlcek, 2012; Gomi et al., 2013; Pozzo, Davies, 746 Gubbins, & Alfè, 2013) and the inclusion of the post-perovskite phase change in the lower 747 mantle (Hernlund, Thomas, & Tackley, 2005) constrain the heat flow from the core to 748 be in the range of 10-16 TW (Hernlund, 2010; Lay, Hernlund, & Buffett, 2008; Lay, Hern-749 lund, Garnero, & Thorne, 2006; van der Hilst et al., 2007) (although a lower core ther-750 mal conductivity has been advocated by Zhang, Cohen, and Haule (2015)). Some man-751 tle convection models (Leng & Zhong, 2008; Mittelstaedt & Tackley, 2006; S. J. Zhong, 752 2006) have shown that plume heat flux can account for a significant fraction of the CMB heat flux and plume heat flux decreases by as much as a factor of 3 as the plumes as-754 cend to the upper mantle, implying that mantle plumes should be considered when study-755 ing mantle dynamics coupled with continents. 756

Table 4 gives the CMB heat flow and $v_{\rm RMS}$ of the whole mantle for all the cases 757 featuring incompressible convection averaged over their simulation time. Cases with $T_{\rm cmb} =$ 758 $3000\,K$ give CMB heat flow and $v_{\rm RMS}$ of the order of 11-13 TW and 0.25-0.45 cm/yr 759 respectively. The heat flow values obtained from these models are in agreement with the 760 recent heat flow estimates as discussed above and the low root-mean-square velocity of 761 the whole mantle can be attributed to the lack of internal heating. Our models without 762 internal heating show a general trend of decreasing correlation with increasing $T_{\rm cmb}$. Com-763 paring the CMB heat flow from these models with the recent heat flow estimates, we ar-764 gue that CMB temperatures of 2000 K or 4000 K are not realistic values in an incom-765 pressible convection setup. Moreover, it should be noted that in an incompressible con-766 vection model with $T_{\rm surf}$ = 300 K and $T_{\rm cmb}$ = 3000 K, the entire 2700 K superadia-767 batic temperature difference will drive convection whereas in a compressible convection 768 model, around 1000-1200 K of the difference between the CMB and surface temperatures 769 will be taken up by an adiabatic temperature increase and only the remaining $1500-1700 \,\mathrm{K}$ 770 will drive convection. This implies that a given $T_{\rm cmb}$ in an incompressible convection 771 model will give similar behavior (e.g. in terms of plumes excess temperature) to one about 772 1000-1200 K higher in a compressible convection model. 773

When included, internal heating increases the effective convective vigor of the man-774 tle and makes for a drastic change in the style of mantle dynamics. The internal tem-775 perature is higher and a decrease in the number of slabs stagnating at the lower bound-776 ary is observed. The more effective mantle mixing lowers the thermal isolation between 777 the subcontinental and the suboceanic mantle. Compared to the models with only basal 778 heating, the amplitude of degree-1 decreases (Fig. 3d and A.2s3) and for cases with low 779 reference viscosity, no correlation is observed. This is in agreement with the main find-780 ings of Heron and Lowman (2014) who also report a decreasing influence of continen-781 tal insulation on subcontinental warming with increasing Ra. 782

Numerous seismic tomographic studies (e.g., Grand, 2002; Houser, Masters, Shearer, 783 & Laske, 2008; Li & Romanowicz, 1996; Masters, Laske, Bolton, & Dziewonski, 2000; 784 Panning & Romanowicz, 2006; Ritsema, Deuss, van Heijst, & Woodhouse, 2011; Ritsema, 785 van Heijst, & Woodhouse, 1999; Su & Dziewonski, 1997; Su, Woodward, & Dziewonski, 786 1994; van der Hilst, Widiyantoro, & Engdahl, 1997; Zhao, 2004) have unanimously ob-787 served slow S-wave velocity anomalies beneath present-day Africa and South Pacific, in-788 dicating a degree-2 structure for the Earth's mantle. Though our models only show a 789 dominant degree-1 structure with a supercontinent (Fig. 2a and 3a) and degree-2 with 790 2 continents (Fig. 2b and 3b), these qualitative observations from our models might have 791 been relevant in early geological history. 792

4.4.2 Continental Rifting and Flood Basalts

793

It has been suggested that mantle plumes can cause intense magmatic activity while
emplacing continental flood basalts (CFB) followed by continental rifting and fragmentation (Campbell & Griffiths, 1990; Condie, 2004; Morgan, 1972; Richards et al., 1989;
Scrutton, 1973; White & McKenzie, 1989). Studies have also shown the propensity of
plumes to rise and concentrate under the relatively hotter subcontinental mantle (e.g.,
Guillou & Jaupart, 1995; Gurnis, 1988; Lowman & Jarvis, 1993, 1996; B. Phillips & Bunge,
2005; S. Zhong & Gurnis, 1993).

Flood basalts are large accumulation of basaltic lava formed in a series of large erup-801 tions lasting for about 1-10 Myr (V. E. Courtillot & Renne, 2003) and covering stretches 802 of continents or oceanic floor. Prominent examples of CFB include the 65 Ma Deccan 803 Traps in India that coincide with the opening of the NW Indian Ocean (V. Courtillot 804 et al., 1986, 1988), the 200 Ma Central Atlantic Margin Province (CAMP) flood basalts 805 that coincide with the opening of the Central Atlantic Ocean (V. Courtillot, Jaupart, 806 Manighetti, Tapponnier, & Besse, 1999) and the 250 Ma Siberian Traps (Wooden et al., 807 1993). Examples of flood basalts that were emplaced without continental rifting are the 808 Ontong Java Plateau (Neal, Mahoney, Kroenke, Duncan, & Petterson, 1997) and Columbia 809 River basalts (Hooper, Camp, Reidel, & Ross, 2007; Rampino & Stothers, 1988). 810

Anderson (1982) proposed that continental assembly would cause subcontinental mantle warming and the breakup of Pangea, thereby offering an alternative source of CFB. The purely internally-heated models of Coltice et al. (2009, 2007) supported and quantified this proposal without the involvement of mantle plumes. They showed continentalaggregation induced elevated subcontinental mantle temperatures and large-scale melting events might have caused the emplacement of CAMP flood basalts following Pangea's breakup.

Our model featuring compressibility with melting and crustal production presented 818 in Fig. 5b favors the mantle plume origin for the origin of continental flood basalts. The 819 plumes that rise up to the upper mantle result in voluminous magmatism, producing a 820 basaltic crust. This basaltic material transforms into denser eclogite at a depth of 60 km 821 and starts to sink into the mantle, generating a return mantle flow. The eclogitic crust 822 combined with the return mantle flow induce continental rifting and breakup. This sce-823 nario represents a mix of both passive (lithospheric extension by plate forces) and ac-824 tive (mantle plume) rifting volcanism as proposed by Sengör and Burke (1978). These 825 results are in contrast to the findings of O'Neill et al. (2009) who did not observe any 826 voluminous volcanism and supercontinent breakup in their simulations. These volumi-827 nous basalt generating events in our model can be likened to the emplacement of CAMP 828 continental flood basalts following the breakup of Pangea. To summarize, MCP plays 829 a vital role in the evolution of continent-temperature correlation in two different ways. 830 It increases the correlation by consuming latent heat and effectively cooling the subo-831 ceanic mantle. It decreases the correlation as decompression melting underneath the con-832 tinents result in voluminous magmatism, which is followed by continental rifting and breakup. 833 Moreover, the development of small-scale sublithospheric convection cells reduces the ther-834 mal contrast between the subcontinental and suboceanic mantle, which is in alignment 835 with the findings of O'Neill et al. (2009). 836

Geological evidence also points towards the eruption of ultramafic mantle-derived
volcanic rocks such as komatiites (Nisbet, 1982) above Archean greenstone belts (primordial continents), for example in the Yilgarn craton of Western Australia (Mole et al.,
2014; Wang, Schi tte, & Campbell, 1996) and the Dharwar craton of Southern India (Jayananda,
Kano, Peucat, & Channabasappa, 2008). Our models with MCP can also be applied to
such scenarios.

In the past, many studies of models featuring varying complexity have tried to an-843 swer the question of whether continents warm up the subcontinental mantle. We con-844 tribute to this discussion by offering qualitative observations from 2D mantle convection 845 simulations with mobile continents. Furthermore, we provide numbers quantifying the 846 magnitude of this continent-temperature correlation and its time-dependence by employ-847 ing simple empirical regressions. Starting with simple incompressible convection mod-848 els, we show that the dominant degree of correlation changes with continental distribu-849 tion and subcontinental temperature amplitude can reach up to 200 K, depending on the 850 extent of the continents. It should be noted that this result was obtained over long time 851 scales and with a convective vigor much less compared to the real Earth. We also show 852 that this correlation decreases with increasing core temperature, number of continents, 853 radiogenic heat production, or decreasing reference viscosity. These results reaffirm the 854 previous findings of Heron and Lowman (2014); Lenardic et al. (2011); O'Neill et al. (2009); 855 B. R. Phillips and Coltice (2010); Rolf et al. (2012). When using a more realistic setup 856 with compressible convection, core cooling and MCP, our models demonstrate the im-857 pact of magmatism on the dynamics of continents. We observe that decompression melt-858 ing in the mantle as a result of a mantle plume or small-scale sublithospheric convection 859 leads to voluminous volcanism. The emplacement of dense-eclogite material at the sur-860 face breaks the continents apart and drastically reduces this correlation (amplitude of 861 tens of K). 862

These models have, however, some limitations, which should be addressed in fu-863 ture studies. Continents do not break in our incompressible convection models because 864 they have a higher yield stress and higher viscosity than non-continental material. Ac-865 cordingly, the reader should not make inferences about the timings and the related ef-866 fects of supercontinent assembly or breakup from these models. When supercontinents 867 do rift owing to magmatism in compressible convection simulations with MCP, the du-868 ration of this rifting depends on the initial core temperature. If these models were mi-869 grated to three dimensions, then the expected diminished effects of plumes in the up-870 per mantle and subducting slabs in the lower mantle would likely result in more homoge-871 nous mantle temperature profiles and lower correlation amplitudes. Further modeling 872 efforts should also include real continental growth by differentiation of the mantle, in-873 stead of using prescribed continents. In this study, we considered fully eruptive magma-874 tism. In the future, the influence of plutonism on this correlation should be explored as 875 it has been to shown to play an important role in shaping the Earth's lithosphere (Ca-876 wood, Hawkesworth, & Dhuime, 2013; Crisp, 1984; Rozel, Golabek, Jain, Tackley, & Gerya, 877 2017).878

⁸⁷⁹ 5 Conclusions

We present new tools to quantify the time-dependent correlation between continents and the underlying mantle, then use them to advance our understanding of the magnitude and causes of this correlation and its time-dependence, compared to the more qualitative findings of previous modeling studies.

We first apply them to incompressible models with a complexity very similar to that 884 considered in the large body of published literature on the influence of continents on man-885 tle convection. We demonstrate that the correlation between continents and the under-886 lying mantle is systematic, predictable and quantifiable using the tools presented in this 887 study. Furthermore we show that an analytical fit to both the time-averaged value and 888 the time rate of change of this correlation is possible, and give the mathematical form 889 and best-fitting coefficients. The correlation between continents and the underlying man-890 the is almost always positive, with a magnitude that decreases with increasing core tem-891 perature, number of continents, radiogenic heat production, and decreasing reference vis-892 cosity. The time rate of change of the correlation increases with increasing number of 893

continents, initial core temperature or internal heating rate, or decreasing reference viscosity.

With the aid of heat flow time-series, we show that the incompressible convection models rapidly reach statistically steady-state and therefore the long-term statistical behavior is not influenced by the initial conditions.

We then apply the tools to a model setup more realistic than previously used in 899 any studies of mantle convection with continents, one that incorporates compressibility, 900 melting-induced crustal production, and core cooling. The above conclusions about cor-901 relations still apply to these models but they produce correlations that are much smaller 902 in amplitude than the simpler, incompressible setup, a finding that points the way to-903 wards needed future research. These compressible convection models also exhibit con-904 tinental rifting and breakup, thereby supporting the mantle plume origin of continen-905 tal flood basalts. 906



907 A Additional figures



⁹¹¹ introduced in the mid-mantle at 3 o'clock in all these models.

922 Acknowledgments

⁹²³ We thank Adrian Lenardic, Allen McNamara, and two anonymous reviewers for their

₉₂₄ constructive reviews that helped improve the manuscript, and Thorsten Becker for his



Figure A.2. (left) Spectrogram of the additional cases s_{1} - s_{3} featuring incompressibility and without MCP, where positive (red to yellow) and negative (shades of blue) values indicate correlation and anti-correlation between continental material at the surface and elevated temperatures underneath respectively (using temperature correlation window w_{T1}). Also shown are the minimum and maximum temperature contrasts obtained from the models. (right) Initial state of the models with continents (white).

editorial work. C. Jain and A.B. Rozel received funding from the European Research Council under the European Union's Seventh Framework Programme (FP/2007-2013)/ERC Grant Agreement number 320639 project iGEO. The raw data from the calculations, which are visualized and analyzed in this manuscript appear in the tables found in the supporting information. Further detail is available by contacting the corresponding author.

930 References

- Amestoy, P. R., Duff, I. S., & L'Excellent, J. Y. (2000). Multifrontal parallel dis tributed symmetric and unsymmetric solvers. Computer Methods in Applied
 Mechanics and Engineering, 184 (2-4), 501-520.
- Ammann, M. W., Brodholt, J. P., Wookey, J., & Dobson, D. P. (2010, May). First principles constraints on diffusion in lower-mantle minerals and a weak D"
 layer. Nature, 465(7297), 462–465.
- Anderson, D. L. (1982). Hotspots, Polar Wander, Mesozoic Convection and the
 Geoid. Nature, 297(5865), 391–393.
- Ballmer, M. D., van Hunen, J., Ito, G., Tackley, P. J., & Bianco, T. A. (2007,
 December). Non-hotspot volcano chains originating from small-scale sublithospheric convection. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 34(23), n/a-n/a.



Figure A.3. Time series of heat flow at the core-mantle boundary $Q_{\rm cmb}$ and at the surface $Q_{\rm surf}$ on the left y-axis for the additional cases s1-s3 featuring incompressibility and without MCP. Also shown, on the right-axis is the fraction of internal heating $(Q_{\rm surf} - Q_{\rm cmb})/Q_{\rm surf}$ as a function of time.

| 942 | Bonatti, E., & Harrison, C. G. A. (1976, September). Hot lines in the Earth's man- |
|-----|--|
| 943 | tle. <i>Nature</i> , 263(5576), 402–404. |
| 944 | Boyd, F. R. (1987). High-and low-temperature garnet peridotite xenoliths and their |
| 945 | possible relation to the lithosphere-asthenosphere boundary beneath Africa. In |
| 946 | P. H. Nixon (Ed.), Mantle xenolith (pp. 403–412). John Wiley & Sons Ltd. |
| 947 | Boyd, F. R. (1989, December). Compositional distinction between oceanic and cra- |
| 948 | tonic lithosphere. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 96(1-2), 15–26. |
| 949 | Buck, W. R., & Parmentier, E. M. (1986). Convection beneath young oceanic litho- |
| 950 | sphere: Implications for thermal structure and gravity. Journal of Geophysical |
| 951 | Research, 91 (B2), 1961-1974. |
| 952 | Buffett, B. A., Huppert, H. E., Lister, J. R., & Woods, A. W. (1992). Analytical |
| 953 | Model for Solidification of the Earths Core. Nature, 356(6367), 329–331. |
| 954 | Buffett, B. A., Huppert, H. E., Lister, J. R., & Woods, A. W. (1996, April). On |
| 955 | the thermal evolution of the Earth's core. Journal of Geophysical Research, |
| 956 | 101(B4), 7989-8006. |
| 957 | Campbell, I. H., & Griffiths, R. W. (1990, July). Implications of mantle plume |
| | |

- structure for the evolution of flood basalts. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 99(1-2), 79-93.
- Cawood, P. A., Hawkesworth, C. J., & Dhuime, B. (2013). The continental record

| 961 | and the generation of continental crust. Geological Society of America Bulletin, |
|--|--|
| 962 | I220(1-2), 14-32. |
| 963 | Chandrasekhar, S. (1961). Hydrodynamic and Hydromagnetic Stability. New York: |
| 964 | Oxiord University Press. |
| 965 | Christensen, U. R., & Hormann, A. W. (1994). Segregation of subducted oceanic |
| 966 | crust in the convecting mantle. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solia Earth |
| 967 | (1978-2012), 99(B10), 19807-19884. |
| 968 | Cizkova, H., van den Berg, A. P., Spakman, W., & Matyska, C. (2012, June). The |
| 969 | viscosity of Earth's lower mantle inferred from sinking speed of subducted |
| 970 | Introsphere. Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors, 200-201, 50-62. |
| 971 | Coltice, N., Bertrand, H., Rey, P., Jourdan, F., Phillips, B. R., & Ricard, Y. (2009, |
| 972 | June). Global warming of the mantle beneath continents back to the Ar- |
| 973 | Chaean. Gondwana Research, 15(3-4), 254–200. |
| 974 | Coltice, N., Phillips, B. R., Bertrand, H., Ricard, Y., & Rey, P. (2007). Global |
| 975 | warming of the mantle at the origin of flood basalts over supercontinents. Ge^{-1} |
| 976 | Ology, 35(5), 391. |
| 977 | Coltice, N., Rolf, I., Tackley, P. J., & Labrosse, S. (2012, April). Dynamic Causes |
| 978 | of the Relation Between Area and Age of the Ocean Floor. Science, 330(6079), |
| 979 | 335-338. |
| 980 | Condie, K. C. (2004). Supercontinents and superplume events: distinguishing signals |
| 981 | in the geologic record. <i>Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors</i> , 146(1-2), |
| 982 | 319-332. |
| 983 | Cooper, C. M., Lenardic, A., & Moresi, L. (2006). Effects of continental insulation |
| 984 | and the partitioning of heat producing elements on the Earth's heat loss. Geo- |
| 985 | physical Research Letters, 33(13), 4741. |
| 986 | Cooper, C. M., Moresi, L. N., & Lenardic, A. (2013, June). Effects of continental |
| 987 | configuration on mantle heat loss. Geophysical Research Letters, 40(11), 2647– |
| 988 | 2651. |
| 989 | Courtillot V Besse I Vandamme D Montigny B Jaeger L-1 & Cannetta H |
| | Courtinot, V., Desse, S., Vandamine, D., Montegny, R., Saeger, S.S., & Cappetra, H. |
| 990 | (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? |
| 990 991 | (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 80(3-4), 361–374. |
| 990 991 992 | (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 80(3-4), 361–374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, |
| 990 991 992 993 | (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 80(3-4), 361–374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, J. (1988, June). Deccan flood basalts and the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary. |
| 990 991 992 993 994 | Courtillot, V., Besse, S., Valualinie, D., Monighy, R., Saeger, S.S., & Cappetta, H. (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 80(3-4), 361–374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, J. (1988, June). Deccan flood basalts and the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary. <i>Nature</i>, 333(6176), 843–846. |
| 990 991 992 993 994 995 | Courtillot, V., Besse, S., Valualinite, D., Monigly, R., Saeger, S.S., & Cappetta, H. (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 80(3-4), 361–374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, J. (1988, June). Deccan flood basalts and the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary. <i>Nature</i>, 333(6176), 843–846. Courtillot, V., Jaupart, C., Manighetti, I., Tapponnier, P., & Besse, J. (1999, M. 1999). |
| 990 991 992 993 994 995 996 | Courtillot, V., Desse, S., Valualinite, D., Montigity, R., Saeger, S.S., & Cappetta, H. (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 80(3-4), 361–374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, J. (1988, June). Deccan flood basalts and the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary. <i>Nature</i>, 333(6176), 843–846. Courtillot, V., Jaupart, C., Manighetti, I., Tapponnier, P., & Besse, J. (1999, March). On causal links between flood basalts and continental breakup. <i>Earth</i> |
| 990 991 992 993 994 995 996 997 | Courtillot, V., Besse, S., Validalinie, D., Mohlighy, R., Saeger, S.S., & Cappetta, H. (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 80(3-4), 361–374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, J. (1988, June). Deccan flood basalts and the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary. <i>Nature</i>, 333(6176), 843–846. Courtillot, V., Jaupart, C., Manighetti, I., Tapponnier, P., & Besse, J. (1999, March). On causal links between flood basalts and continental breakup. <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 166(3-4), 177–195. |
| 990 991 992 993 994 995 995 996 997 998 | Courtillot, V., Desse, S., Validalinie, D., Mohlighy, R., Saeger, S.S., & Cappetta, H. (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 80(3-4), 361–374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, J. (1988, June). Deccan flood basalts and the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary. <i>Nature</i>, 333(6176), 843–846. Courtillot, V., Jaupart, C., Manighetti, I., Tapponnier, P., & Besse, J. (1999, March). On causal links between flood basalts and continental breakup. <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 166(3-4), 177–195. Courtillot, V. E., & Renne, P. R. (2003, January). On the ages of flood basalt |
| 990 991 992 993 994 995 996 997 998 999 | Courtillot, V., Desse, S., Validalinie, D., Mohlighy, R., Saeger, S.S., & Cappetta, H. (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 80(3-4), 361–374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, J. (1988, June). Deccan flood basalts and the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary. <i>Nature</i>, 333(6176), 843–846. Courtillot, V., Jaupart, C., Manighetti, I., Tapponnier, P., & Besse, J. (1999, March). On causal links between flood basalts and continental breakup. <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 166(3-4), 177–195. Courtillot, V. E., & Renne, P. R. (2003, January). On the ages of flood basalt events. <i>Comptes Rendus Geoscience</i>, 335(1), 113–140. |
| 990 991 992 993 994 995 996 996 997 998 999 | Courtillot, V., Besse, S., Validalinie, D., Mohlighy, R., Saeger, S.S., & Cappetta, H. (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 80(3-4), 361–374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, J. (1988, June). Deccan flood basalts and the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary. <i>Nature</i>, 333(6176), 843–846. Courtillot, V., Jaupart, C., Manighetti, I., Tapponnier, P., & Besse, J. (1999, March). On causal links between flood basalts and continental breakup. <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 166(3-4), 177–195. Courtillot, V. E., & Renne, P. R. (2003, January). On the ages of flood basalt events. <i>Comptes Rendus Geoscience</i>, 335(1), 113–140. Crisp, J. A. (1984). Rates of Magma Emplacement and Volcanic Output. <i>Journal of Magma Emplacement</i>, 20(0, 4), 127–011. |
| 990 991 992 993 994 995 996 997 998 999 1000 | Courtillot, V., Desse, S., Validalinie, D., Mohlighy, R., Saeger, S.S., & Cappetta, H. (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 80(3-4), 361–374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, J. (1988, June). Deccan flood basalts and the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary. <i>Nature</i>, 333(6176), 843–846. Courtillot, V., Jaupart, C., Manighetti, I., Tapponnier, P., & Besse, J. (1999, March). On causal links between flood basalts and continental breakup. <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 166(3-4), 177–195. Courtillot, V. E., & Renne, P. R. (2003, January). On the ages of flood basalt events. <i>Comptes Rendus Geoscience</i>, 335(1), 113–140. Crisp, J. A. (1984). Rates of Magma Emplacement and Volcanic Output. <i>Journal of Volcanology and Geothermal Research</i>, 20(3-4), 177–211. |
| 990 991 992 993 994 995 996 997 998 999 1000 1001 | Courtillot, V., Desse, S., Validannie, D., Mohlighy, R., Saeger, S.S., & Cappetta, H. (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 80(3-4), 361–374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, J. (1988, June). Deccan flood basalts and the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary. <i>Nature</i>, 333(6176), 843–846. Courtillot, V., Jaupart, C., Manighetti, I., Tapponnier, P., & Besse, J. (1999, March). On causal links between flood basalts and continental breakup. <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 166(3-4), 177–195. Courtillot, V. E., & Renne, P. R. (2003, January). On the ages of flood basalt events. <i>Comptes Rendus Geoscience</i>, 335(1), 113–140. Crisp, J. A. (1984). Rates of Magma Emplacement and Volcanic Output. <i>Journal of Volcanology and Geothermal Research</i>, 20(3-4), 177–211. Davies, G. (2007). Thermal Evolution of the Mantle. In <i>Volume 9: Evolution of the Volcanology</i>. |
| 990 991 992 993 994 995 996 997 998 999 1000 1001 1002 1003 | Courtillot, V., Desse, J., Validannie, D., Mohlighy, R., Jaeger, JJ., & Cappetta, H. (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 80(3-4), 361-374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, J. (1988, June). Deccan flood basalts and the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary. <i>Nature</i>, 333(6176), 843-846. Courtillot, V., Jaupart, C., Manighetti, I., Tapponnier, P., & Besse, J. (1999, March). On causal links between flood basalts and continental breakup. <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 166(3-4), 177-195. Courtillot, V. E., & Renne, P. R. (2003, January). On the ages of flood basalt events. <i>Comptes Rendus Geoscience</i>, 335(1), 113-140. Crisp, J. A. (1984). Rates of Magma Emplacement and Volcanic Output. <i>Journal of Volcanology and Geothermal Research</i>, 20(3-4), 177-211. Davies, G. (2007). Thermal Evolution of the Mantle. In <i>Volume 9: Evolution of the earth</i> (pp. 197-216). Elsevier. |
| 990 991 992 993 994 995 996 997 998 999 1000 1001 1002 1002 1003 1004 | Courtillot, V., Desse, J., Validalinie, D., Mohlighy, R., Jaeger, JS., & Cappetta, H. (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 80(3-4), 361-374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, J. (1988, June). Deccan flood basalts and the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary. <i>Nature</i>, 333(6176), 843-846. Courtillot, V., Jaupart, C., Manighetti, I., Tapponnier, P., & Besse, J. (1999, March). On causal links between flood basalts and continental breakup. <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 166(3-4), 177-195. Courtillot, V. E., & Renne, P. R. (2003, January). On the ages of flood basalt events. <i>Comptes Rendus Geoscience</i>, 335(1), 113-140. Crisp, J. A. (1984). Rates of Magma Emplacement and Volcanic Output. <i>Journal of Volcanology and Geothermal Research</i>, 20(3-4), 177-211. Davies, G. (2007). Thermal Evolution of the Mantle. In <i>Volume 9: Evolution of the earth</i> (pp. 197-216). Elsevier. de Koker, N., Steinle-Neumann, G., & Vlcek, V. (2012, March). Electrical resistivity |
| 990 991 992 993 994 995 996 997 998 999 1000 1001 1002 1003 1004 1005 | Courtillot, V., Besse, S., Valdamine, D., Moningry, R., Saeger, S.S., & Cappetta, H. (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 80(3-4), 361–374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, J. (1988, June). Deccan flood basalts and the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary. <i>Nature</i>, 333(6176), 843–846. Courtillot, V., Jaupart, C., Manighetti, I., Tapponnier, P., & Besse, J. (1999, March). On causal links between flood basalts and continental breakup. <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 166(3-4), 177–195. Courtillot, V. E., & Renne, P. R. (2003, January). On the ages of flood basalt events. <i>Comptes Rendus Geoscience</i>, 335(1), 113–140. Crisp, J. A. (1984). Rates of Magma Emplacement and Volcanic Output. <i>Journal of Volcanology and Geothermal Research</i>, 20(3-4), 177–211. Davies, G. (2007). Thermal Evolution of the Mantle. In <i>Volume 9: Evolution of the earth</i> (pp. 197–216). Elsevier. de Koker, N., Steinle-Neumann, G., & Vlcek, V. (2012, March). Electrical resistivity and thermal conductivity of liquid Fe alloys at high P and T, and heat flux |
| 990 991 992 993 994 995 996 997 998 999 1000 1001 1002 1003 1004 1005 1006 | Courtinot, V., Besse, S., Vandamine, D., Monteigh, R., Saeger, S.S., & Cappetta, R. (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 80(3-4), 361–374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, J. (1988, June). Deccan flood basalts and the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary. <i>Nature</i>, 333(6176), 843–846. Courtillot, V., Jaupart, C., Manighetti, I., Tapponnier, P., & Besse, J. (1999, March). On causal links between flood basalts and continental breakup. <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 166(3-4), 177–195. Courtillot, V. E., & Renne, P. R. (2003, January). On the ages of flood basalt events. <i>Comptes Rendus Geoscience</i>, 335(1), 113–140. Crisp, J. A. (1984). Rates of Magma Emplacement and Volcanic Output. <i>Journal of Volcanology and Geothermal Research</i>, 20(3-4), 177–211. Davies, G. (2007). Thermal Evolution of the Mantle. In <i>Volume 9: Evolution of the earth</i> (pp. 197–216). Elsevier. de Koker, N., Steinle-Neumann, G., & Vlcek, V. (2012, March). Electrical resistivity and thermal conductivity of liquid Fe alloys at high P and T, and heat flux in Earth's core. <i>Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences</i>, 109(11), |
| 990 991 992 993 994 995 996 997 998 999 1000 1001 1002 1003 1004 1005 1006 | Courtillot, V., Besse, S., Valualinite, D., Montagay, R., Saeger, SS., & Cappetta, R. (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 80(3-4), 361–374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, J. (1988, June). Deccan flood basalts and the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary. <i>Nature</i>, 333(6176), 843–846. Courtillot, V., Jaupart, C., Manighetti, I., Tapponnier, P., & Besse, J. (1999, March). On causal links between flood basalts and continental breakup. <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 166(3-4), 177–195. Courtillot, V. E., & Renne, P. R. (2003, January). On the ages of flood basalt events. <i>Comptes Rendus Geoscience</i>, 335(1), 113–140. Crisp, J. A. (1984). Rates of Magma Emplacement and Volcanic Output. <i>Journal of Volcanology and Geothermal Research</i>, 20(3-4), 177–211. Davies, G. (2007). Thermal Evolution of the Mantle. In <i>Volume 9: Evolution of the earth</i> (pp. 197–216). Elsevier. de Koker, N., Steinle-Neumann, G., & Vlcek, V. (2012, March). Electrical resistivity and thermal conductivity of liquid Fe alloys at high P and T, and heat flux in Earth's core. <i>Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences</i>, 109(11), 4070–4073. |
| 990 991 992 993 994 995 996 997 998 999 1000 1001 1002 1003 1004 1005 1006 | Courtillot, V., Besse, S., Valdamine, D., Montghy, R., Saeger, S.M., & Cappetta, R. (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 80(3-4), 361–374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, J. (1988, June). Deccan flood basalts and the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary. <i>Nature</i>, 333 (6176), 843–846. Courtillot, V., Jaupart, C., Manighetti, I., Tapponnier, P., & Besse, J. (1999, March). On causal links between flood basalts and continental breakup. <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 166 (3-4), 177–195. Courtillot, V. E., & Renne, P. R. (2003, January). On the ages of flood basalt events. <i>Comptes Rendus Geoscience</i>, 335 (1), 113–140. Crisp, J. A. (1984). Rates of Magma Emplacement and Volcanic Output. <i>Journal of Volcanology and Geothermal Research</i>, 20(3-4), 177–211. Davies, G. (2007). Thermal Evolution of the Mantle. In <i>Volume 9: Evolution of the earth</i> (pp. 197–216). Elsevier. de Koker, N., Steinle-Neumann, G., & Vlcek, V. (2012, March). Electrical resistivity and thermal conductivity of liquid Fe alloys at high P and T, and heat flux in Earth's core. <i>Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences</i>, 109(11), 4070–4073. Gomi, H., Ohta, K., Hirose, K., Labrosse, S., Caracas, R., Verstraete, M. J., & Hern-March. 2012 (2012). |
| 990 991 992 993 994 995 996 997 998 999 1000 1001 1002 1003 1004 1005 1006 1007 | Courtillot, V., Besse, S., Valdamine, D., Mohtighy, R., Saegel, JM., & Cappetta, R. (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 80(3-4), 361–374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, J. (1988, June). Deccan flood basalts and the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary. <i>Nature</i>, 333(6176), 843–846. Courtillot, V., Jaupart, C., Manighetti, I., Tapponnier, P., & Besse, J. (1999, March). On causal links between flood basalts and continental breakup. <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 166(3-4), 177–195. Courtillot, V. E., & Renne, P. R. (2003, January). On the ages of flood basalt events. <i>Comptes Rendus Geoscience</i>, 335(1), 113–140. Crisp, J. A. (1984). Rates of Magma Emplacement and Volcanic Output. <i>Journal of Volcanology and Geothermal Research</i>, 20(3-4), 177–211. Davies, G. (2007). Thermal Evolution of the Mantle. In <i>Volume 9: Evolution of the earth</i> (pp. 197–216). Elsevier. de Koker, N., Steinle-Neumann, G., & Vlcek, V. (2012, March). Electrical resistivity and thermal conductivity of liquid Fe alloys at high P and T, and heat flux in Earth's core. <i>Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences</i>, 109(11), 4070–4073. Gomi, H., Ohta, K., Hirose, K., Labrosse, S., Caracas, R., Verstraete, M. J., & Hernlund, J. W. (2013, November). The high conductivity of iron and thermal level. |
| 990 991 992 993 994 995 996 997 998 999 1000 1001 1002 1003 1004 1005 1006 1007 1008 | Courtinoti, V., Besse, S., Valuannic, D., Mohtgiry, R., Jacger, JS., & Cappetta, R. (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 80(3-4), 361–374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, J. (1988, June). Deccan flood basalts and the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary. <i>Nature</i>, 333 (6176), 843–846. Courtillot, V., Jaupart, C., Manighetti, I., Tapponnier, P., & Besse, J. (1999, March). On causal links between flood basalts and continental breakup. <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 166 (3-4), 177–195. Courtillot, V. E., & Renne, P. R. (2003, January). On the ages of flood basalt events. <i>Comptes Rendus Geoscience</i>, 335 (1), 113–140. Crisp, J. A. (1984). Rates of Magma Emplacement and Volcanic Output. <i>Journal of Volcanology and Geothermal Research</i>, 20 (3-4), 177–211. Davies, G. (2007). Thermal Evolution of the Mantle. In <i>Volume 9: Evolution of the earth</i> (pp. 197–216). Elsevier. de Koker, N., Steinle-Neumann, G., & Vlcek, V. (2012, March). Electrical resistivity and thermal conductivity of liquid Fe alloys at high P and T, and heat flux in Earth's core. <i>Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences</i>, 109(11), 4070–4073. Gonni, H., Ohta, K., Hirose, K., Labrosse, S., Caracas, R., Verstraete, M. J., & Hernlund, J. W. (2013, November). The high conductivity of iron and thermal evolution of the Earth's core. <i>Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors</i>, 204(2), 204 (201). |
| 990 991 992 993 994 995 996 997 998 999 1000 1001 1002 1003 1004 1005 1006 1007 1008 | Contribut, V., Desse, S., Valtamine, D., Montgry, R., Saeger, J.J., & Cappetta, R. (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 80(3-4), 361–374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, J. (1988, June). Deccan flood basalts and the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary. <i>Nature</i>, 333(6176), 843–846. Courtillot, V., Jaupart, C., Manighetti, I., Tapponnier, P., & Besse, J. (1999, March). On causal links between flood basalts and continental breakup. <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 166(3-4), 177–195. Courtillot, V. E., & Renne, P. R. (2003, January). On the ages of flood basalt events. <i>Comptes Rendus Geoscience</i>, 335(1), 113–140. Crisp, J. A. (1984). Rates of Magma Emplacement and Volcanic Output. <i>Journal of Volcanology and Geothermal Research</i>, 20(3-4), 177–211. Davies, G. (2007). Thermal Evolution of the Mantle. In <i>Volume 9: Evolution of the earth</i> (pp. 197–216). Elsevier. de Koker, N., Steinle-Neumann, G., & Vlcek, V. (2012, March). Electrical resistivity and thermal conductivity of liquid Fe alloys at high P and T, and heat flux in Earth's core. <i>Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences</i>, 109(11), 4070–4073. Gomi, H., Ohta, K., Hirose, K., Labrosse, S., Caracas, R., Verstraete, M. J., & Hernlund, J. W. (2013, November). The high conductivity of iron and thermal evolution of the Earth's core. <i>Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors</i>, 224(C), 88–103. |
| 990 991 992 993 994 995 996 997 998 999 1000 1001 1002 1003 1004 1005 1006 1007 1008 1009 1010 | Contribut, V., Besse, S., Vandamine, D., Mohtgiff, R., Sager, SS., & Cappetra, R. (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 80(3-4), 361-374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, J. (1988, June). Deccan flood basalts and the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary. <i>Nature</i>, 333(6176), 843-846. Courtillot, V., Jaupart, C., Manighetti, I., Tapponnier, P., & Besse, J. (1999, March). On causal links between flood basalts and continental breakup. <i>Earth and Planetary Science Letters</i>, 166(3-4), 177-195. Courtillot, V. E., & Renne, P. R. (2003, January). On the ages of flood basalt events. <i>Comptes Rendus Geoscience</i>, 335(1), 113-140. Crisp, J. A. (1984). Rates of Magma Emplacement and Volcanic Output. <i>Journal of Volcanology and Geothermal Research</i>, 20(3-4), 177-211. Davies, G. (2007). Thermal Evolution of the Mantle. In <i>Volume 9: Evolution of the earth</i> (pp. 197-216). Elsevier. de Koker, N., Steinle-Neumann, G., & Vlcek, V. (2012, March). Electrical resistivity and thermal conductivity of liquid Fe alloys at high P and T, and heat flux in Earth's core. <i>Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences</i>, 109(11), 4070-4073. Gomi, H., Ohta, K., Hirose, K., Labrosse, S., Caracas, R., Verstraete, M. J., & Hernlund, J. W. (2013, November). The high conductivity of iron and thermal evolution of the Earth's core. <i>Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors</i>, 224(C), 88-103. Grand, S. P. (2002). Mantle shear-wave tomography and the fate of subducted else and submer and |
| 990 991 992 993 994 995 996 997 998 999 1000 1001 1002 1003 1004 1005 1006 1007 1008 1009 1010 1011 | Courtillot, V., Besse, S., Vandamine, D., Mohrighy, R., Sager, SS., & Cappetra, R. (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 80(3-4), 361-374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, J. (1988, June). Deccan flood basalts and the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary. Nature, 333(6176), 843-846. Courtillot, V., Jaupart, C., Manighetti, I., Tapponnier, P., & Besse, J. (1999, March). On causal links between flood basalts and continental breakup. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 166(3-4), 177-195. Courtillot, V. E., & Renne, P. R. (2003, January). On the ages of flood basalt events. Comptes Rendus Geoscience, 335(1), 113-140. Crisp, J. A. (1984). Rates of Magma Emplacement and Volcanic Output. Journal of Volcanology and Geothermal Research, 20(3-4), 177-211. Davies, G. (2007). Thermal Evolution of the Mantle. In Volume 9: Evolution of the earth (pp. 197-216). Elsevier. de Koker, N., Steinle-Neumann, G., & Vlcek, V. (2012, March). Electrical resistivity and thermal conductivity of liquid Fe alloys at high P and T, and heat flux in Earth's core. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 109(11), 4070-4073. Gomi, H., Ohta, K., Hirose, K., Labrosse, S., Caracas, R., Verstraete, M. J., & Hernlund, J. W. (2013, November). The high conductivity of iron and thermal evolution of the Earth's core. Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors, 224(C), 88-103. Grand, S. P. (2002). Mantle shear-wave tomography and the fate of subducted slabs. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London Series a-Mathier of Equipersonal descenters of the Royal Society of London Series a-Mathier of Equipersonal descenters of the Royal Society of London Series a-Mathier of the descenter of the Royal Society of London Series a-Mathier of the descenter of the Royal Society of London Series a-Mathier of the descenter of the Royal Society of Londo |
| 990 991 992 993 994 995 996 997 998 999 1000 1001 1002 1003 1004 1005 1006 1007 1008 1009 1010 1011 1012 1013 1014 | Contribut, V., Desse, S., Valuannie, D., Mohrighy, R., Jack, accus/Tertiary boundary? Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 80 (3-4), 361-374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, J. (1988, June). Deccan flood basalts and the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary. Nature, 333 (6176), 843-846. Courtillot, V., Jaupart, C., Manighetti, I., Tapponnier, P., & Besse, J. (1999, March). On causal links between flood basalts and continental breakup. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 166 (3-4), 177-195. Courtillot, V. E., & Renne, P. R. (2003, January). On the ages of flood basalt events. Comptes Rendus Geoscience, 335 (1), 113-140. Crisp, J. A. (1984). Rates of Magma Emplacement and Volcanic Output. Journal of Volcanology and Geothermal Research, 20 (3-4), 177-211. Davies, G. (2007). Thermal Evolution of the Mantle. In Volume 9: Evolution of the earth (pp. 197-216). Elsevier. de Koker, N., Steinle-Neumann, G., & Vlcek, V. (2012, March). Electrical resistivity and thermal conductivity of liquid Fe alloys at high P and T, and heat flux in Earth's core. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 109(11), 4070-4073. Gomi, H., Ohta, K., Hirose, K., Labrosse, S., Caracas, R., Verstraete, M. J., & Hern- lund, J. W. (2013, November). The high conductivity of iron and thermal evolution of the Earth's core. Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors, 224 (C), 88-103. Grand, S. P. (2002). Mantle shear-wave tomography and the fate of subducted slabs. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London Series a- Mathematical Physical and Engineering Sciences, 360 (1800), 2475-2491. |
| 990 991 992 993 994 995 996 997 998 999 1000 1001 1002 1003 1004 1005 1006 1007 1008 1009 1010 1011 1012 1013 | (1986, November). Deccan flood basalts at the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary? Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 80(3-4), 361-374. Courtillot, V., Féraud, G., Maluski, H., Vandamme, D., Moreau, M. G., & Besse, J. (1988, June). Deccan flood basalts and the Cretaceous/Tertiary boundary. Nature, 333(6176), 843-846. Courtillot, V., Jaupart, C., Manighetti, I., Tapponnier, P., & Besse, J. (1999, March). On causal links between flood basalts and continental breakup. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 166(3-4), 177-195. Courtillot, V. E., & Renne, P. R. (2003, January). On the ages of flood basalt events. Comptes Rendus Geoscience, 335(1), 113-140. Crisp, J. A. (1984). Rates of Magma Emplacement and Volcanic Output. Journal of Volcanology and Geothermal Research, 20(3-4), 177-211. Davies, G. (2007). Thermal Evolution of the Mantle. In Volume 9: Evolution of the earth (pp. 197-216). Elsevier. de Koker, N., Steinle-Neumann, G., & Vlcek, V. (2012, March). Electrical resistivity and thermal conductivity of liquid Fe alloys at high P and T, and heat flux in Earth's core. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 109(11), 4070-4073. Gomi, H., Ohta, K., Hirose, K., Labrosse, S., Caracas, R., Verstraete, M. J., & Hern- lund, J. W. (2013, November). The high conductivity of iron and thermal evolution of the Earth's core. Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors, 224 (C), 88-103. Grand, S. P. (2002). Mantle shear-wave tomography and the fate of subducted slabs. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London Series a- Mathematical Physical and Engineering Sciences, 360(1800), 2475-2491. Grigné, C., Labrosse, S., & Tackley, P. J. (2007, August). Convection under a |

| 1016 | lid of finite conductivity in wide aspect ratio models: Effect of continents on |
|------|---|
| 1017 | the wavelength of mantle flow. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth |
| 1018 | (1978-2012), 112(B8). |
| 1019 | Guillou, L., & Jaupart, C. (1995, December). On the effect of continents on man- |
| 1020 | tle convection. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth (1978–2012), |
| 1021 | 100(B12), 24217-24238. |
| 1022 | Gurnis, M. (1988, April). Large-scale mantle convection and the aggregation and |
| 1023 | dispersal of supercontinents. Nature, 332(6166), 695–699. |
| 1024 | Hawkesworth, C. J., & Kemp, A. I. S. (2006, October). Evolution of the continental |
| 1025 | crust. Nature, $443(7113)$, $811-817$. |
| 1026 | Haxby, W. F., & Weissel, J. K. (1986). Evidence for small-scale mantle convection |
| 1027 | from Seasat altimeter data. Journal of Geophysical Research, 91(B3), 3507- |
| 1028 | 3920. |
| 1029 | nermund, J. W. (2010, June). On the interaction of the geotherm with a post- |
| 1030 | eterm Interviewe 180(2.4) 222 224 |
| 1031 | Hamburd I W. & Tackley P. I. (2008 December) Modeling mentle convection in |
| 1032 | Thermulua, J. W., & Tackley, F. J. (2008, December). Woodening manue convection in the opherical appulse. <i>Physical of the Earth and Planetary Interiora</i> $171(1.4)$ |
| 1033 | AS 54 |
| 1034 | 40-04. Hernlund I W Thomas C & Teckley P I (2005 April) A doubling of the |
| 1035 | nost porovskite phase boundary and structure of the Earth's lowermost man |
| 1030 | the Nature $12/(7035)$ 882–886 |
| 1030 | Heron P I & Lowman I P (2010 November) Thermal response of the man- |
| 1030 | tle following the formation of a "super-plate" Geophysical Research Letters |
| 1040 | 37(22). |
| 1041 | Heron, P. J., & Lowman, J. P. (2011, September). The effects of supercontinent size |
| 1042 | and thermal insulation on the formation of mantle plumes. <i>Tectonophysics</i> , |
| 1043 | 510(1-2), 28–38. |
| 1044 | Heron, P. J., & Lowman, J. P. (2014, January). The impact of Rayleigh number on |
| 1045 | assessing the significance of supercontinent insulation. Journal of Geophysical |
| 1046 | Research: Solid Earth, 119(1), 711–733. |
| 1047 | Heron, P. J., Lowman, J. P., & Stein, C. (2015, May). Influences on the position- |
| 1048 | ing of mantle plumes following supercontinent formation. Journal of Geophysi- |
| 1049 | cal Research: Solid Earth, $120(5)$, $3628-3648$. |
| 1050 | Herzberg, C., Raterron, P., & Zhang, J. (2000). New experimental observations |
| 1051 | on the anhydrous solidus for peridotite KLB-1. Geochemistry, Geophysics, |
| 1052 | $Geosystems, \ 1(11), -n/a.$ |
| 1053 | Hirth, G., & Kohlstedt, D. L. (1996, October). Water in the oceanic upper mantle: |
| 1054 | implications for rheology, melt extraction and the evolution of the lithosphere. |
| 1055 | Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 144(1-2), 93–108. |
| 1056 | Hooper, P. R., Camp, V. E., Reidel, S. P., & Ross, M. E. (2007). The origin of the |
| 1057 | Columbia River flood basalt province: Plume versus nonplume models. In Spe- |
| 1058 | cial paper 430: Plates, plumes and planetary processes (pp. 635–668). Geologi- |
| 1059 | cal Society of America. |
| 1060 | Houser, C., Masters, G., Shearer, P., & Laske, G. (2008, July). Shear and com- |
| 1061 | pressional velocity models of the mantle from cluster analysis of long-period |
| 1062 | waveforms. Geophysical Journal International, 174(1), 195–212. |
| 1063 | Hunt, S. A., Weidner, D. J., Li, L., Wang, L., Walte, N. P., Brodnoit, J. P., & Dob- |
| 1064 | son, D. P. (2009, October). Weakening of calcium indate during its trans- |
| 1065 | iormation from perovskite to post-perovskite. <i>Nature Geoscience</i> , 2(11), |
| 1066 | 194-191. Irifund T & Ringwood A F (1002 May) Dhace Transformations in Cubducted |
| 1067 | Oceanic-Crust and Buoyancy Relationships at Dopths of 600 800 Km in the |
| 1060 | Mantle Earth and Planetary Science Letters $117(1-9)$ 101–110 |
| 1070 | Iavananda M Kano T Peucat I I & Channahasanna S (2008 April) 2.25. |
| 1010 | 5.50 manada appa, 5. (2000, April). 5.50 |

| 1071 | Ga komatiite volcanism in the western Dharwar craton, southern India: Con- |
|------|--|
| 1072 | straints from Nd isotopes and whole-rock geochemistry. Precambrian research, |
| 1073 | 162(1-2), 160-179. |
| 1074 | Jordan, T. H. (1978). Composition and development of the continental tectosphere. |
| 1075 | Nature, 274 (5671), 544–548. |
| 1076 | Jordan, T. H. (1979). Mineralogies, densities and seismic velocities of garnet lher- |
| 1077 | zolites and their geophysical implications. In The mantle sample: Inclusion in |
| 1078 | kimberlites and other volcanics (pp. 1–14). Washington, D. C.: American Geo- |
| 1079 | physical Union. $V = \{1, 0, 2, N\}$ Physical Union. |
| 1080 | Karato, S. I., & Wu, P. (1993, May). Rneology of the Upper Mantle: A Synthesis. |
| 1081 | Kolomon P R Hirth C Shimizu N Spioralman M & Dick H I (1007 Febru |
| 1082 | ary) A rayiou of molt migration processes in the adiabatically upwelling man |
| 1083 | tle beneath oceanic spreading ridges Philosophical Transactions of the Royal |
| 1085 | Society of London Series a-Mathematical Physical and Engineering Sciences |
| 1086 | 355(1723), 283–318. |
| 1087 | Lay, T., Hernlund, J., & Buffett, B. A. (2008). Core-mantle boundary heat flow. |
| 1088 | Nature Geoscience, $1(1)$, $25-32$. |
| 1089 | Lay, T., Hernlund, J., Garnero, E. J., & Thorne, M. S. (2006). A post-perovskite |
| 1090 | lens and D'' heat flux beneath the central Pacific. Science, 314 (5803), 1272– |
| 1091 | 1276. |
| 1092 | Lee, CT. A. (2003, September). Compositional variation of density and seismic |
| 1093 | velocities in natural peridotites at STP conditions: Implications for seismic |
| 1094 | imaging of compositional heterogeneities in the upper mantle. Journal of |
| 1095 | Geophysical Research, 108(B9), 589. |
| 1096 | Lenardic, A., & Moresi, L. (2001). Heat flow scaling for mantle convection below |
| 1097 | a conducting lid: Resolving seemingly inconsistent modeling results regarding |
| 1098 | Longridie A. Morosi I. Iollinok A. & Morosi M. (2005 June). Continental in |
| 1099 | sulation mantle cooling and the surface area of oceans and continents <i>Earth</i> |
| 1100 | and Planetary Science Letters, 234 (3-4), 317–333. |
| 1102 | Lenardic, A., Moresi, L., Jellinek, A. M., O'Neill, C. J., Cooper, C. M., & Lee, C. T. |
| 1103 | (2011, October). Continents, supercontinents, mantle thermal mixing, and |
| 1104 | mantle thermal isolation: Theory, numerical simulations, and laboratory exper- |
| 1105 | iments. Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems, $12(10)$. |
| 1106 | Leng, W., & Zhong, S. (2008). Controls on plume heat flux and plume excess tem- |
| 1107 | perature. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth, 113(B4). |
| 1108 | Li, X. D., & Romanowicz, B. (1996). Global mantle shear velocity model developed |
| 1109 | using nonlinear asymptotic coupling theory. Journal of Geophysical Research: |
| 1110 | Solid Earth, 101 (B10), 22245–22272. |
| 1111 | Lourenço, D. L., Rozel, A., & Tackley, P. J. (2016). Melting-induced crustal produc- |
| 1112 | tion helps plate tectonics on Earth-like planets. Earth and Planetary Science |
| 1113 | Letters, 439, 18–28. |
| 1114 | the following continental aggregation in 3D convection models. Coordinate Re- |
| 1115 | accord Latters 26(17) 2640 2652 |
| 1116 | Setter Letters, $20(17)$, $2049-2052$. |
| 1117 | due to continental collisions <i>Ceonhusical Research Letters</i> 20(10) 2087–2000 |
| 1118 | Lowman I P & Jarvis G T (1996 November) Continental collisions in wide |
| 1120 | aspect ratio and high Rayleigh number two-dimensional mantle convection |
| 1121 | models. Journal of Geophysical Research. 101 (B11). 25485–25497. |
| 1122 | Marquart, G., Schmeling, H., & Braun, A. (1999, September). Small-scale instabil- |
| 1123 | ities below the cooling oceanic lithosphere. Geophysical Journal International, |
| 1124 | 138(3), 655-666. |
| 1125 | Masters, G., Laske, G., Bolton, H., & Dziewonski, A. (2000). The Relative Behavior |
| | |

| 1126 1127 | of Shear Velocity, Bulk Sound Speed, and Compressional Velocity in the Man- tle: Implications for Chemical and Thermal Structure (Vol. 117). Washington, |
|--------------|---|
| 1128 | D. C.: American Geophysical Union. |
| 1129 | McKenzie, D., & Bickle, M. J. (1988, June). The Volume and Composition of Melt |
| 1130 | Generated by Extension of the Lithosphere. Journal of Petrology, $29(3)$, 625 – |
| 1131 | 679. |
| 1132 | Mittelstaedt, E., & Tackley, P. J. (2006, January). Plume heat flow is much lower |
| 1133 | than CMB heat flow. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 241(1-2), 202–210. |
| 1134 | Mole, D. R., Fiorentini, M. L., Thébaud, N., Cassidy, K. F., McCuaig, T. C., Kirk- |
| 1135 | land, C. L., Miller, J. (2014, July). Archean komatiite volcanism controlled |
| 1136 | by the evolution of early continents. Proceedings of the National Academy of |
| 1137 | Sciences, 111(28), 10083-10088. |
| 1138 | Moresi, L., & Solomatov, V. (1998). Mantle convection with a brittle lithosphere: |
| 1139 | thoughts on the global tectonic styles of the earth and venus. Geophysical |
| 1140 | Journal International, $133(3)$. |
| 1141 | Morgan, W. J. (1972). Plate Motions and Deep Mantle Convection. In R. Shagam et |
| 1142 | al. (Eds.), Studies in earth and space sciences. Geological Society of America. |
| 1143 | Nakagawa, T., & Tackley, P. J. (2004, March). Effects of thermo-chemical mantle |
| 1144 | convection on the thermal evolution of the Earth's core. Earth and Planetary |
| 1145 | Science Letters, 220(1-2), 107–119. |
| 1146 | Nakagawa, T., & Tackley, P. J. (2012). Influence of magmatism on mantle cooling, |
| 1147 | surface heat flow and Urey ratio. Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 329, 1- |
| 1148 | 10. |
| 1149 | Nakagawa, T., Tackley, P. J., Deschamps, F., & Connolly, J. A. D. (2010, August). |
| 1150 | Earth and Planetary Science Letters. Earth and Planetary Science Letters. |
| 1151 | 296(3-4), 403-412. |
| 1152 | Neal, C. R., Mahoney, J. J., Kroenke, L. W., Duncan, R. A., & Petterson, M. G. |
| 1153 | (1997, January). The Ontong Java plateau. In Large igneous provinces: Conti- |
| 1154 | nental, oceanic, and planetary flood volcanism (pp. 183–216). Washington, D. |
| 1155 | C.: American Geophysical Union. |
| 1156 | Nisbet, E. G. (1982). The tectonic setting and petrogenesis of komatilites. In |
| 1157 | N. T. Arndt & E. G. Nisbet (Eds.). <i>Komatilites</i> (pp. 501–520). George Allen & |
| 1158 | Unwin. |
| 1159 | Ogawa, M. (2014, March). Two-stage evolution of the Earth's mantle inferred |
| 1160 | from numerical simulation of coupled magmatism-mantle convection system |
| 1161 | with tectonic plates. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth, 119(3). |
| 1162 | 2462–2486. |
| 1163 | O'Neill, C., Lenardic, A., Jellinek, A. M., & Moresi, L. (2009, June). Influence of su- |
| 1164 | percontinents on deep mantle flow. Gondwana Research, 15(3-4), 276–287. |
| 1165 | Ono, S., Ito, E., & Katsura, T. (2001). Mineralogy of subducted basaltic crust |
| 1166 | (MORB) from 25 to 37 GPa, and chemical heterogeneity of the lower mantle. |
| 1167 | Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 190(1-2), 57–63. |
| 1168 | Panning, M., & Romanowicz, B. (2006, October). A three-dimensional radially |
| 1160 | anisotropic model of shear velocity in the whole mantle <i>Geophysical Journal</i> |
| 1170 | International $167(1)$ $361-379$ |
| 1171 | Pearson D G Parman S W & Nowell G M (2007) A link between large |
| 1172 | mantle melting events and continent growth seen in osmium isotopes Nature |
| 1172 | 1/29(7159) = 202-205 |
| 1173 | Phillips B & Bunge H (2005 April) Heterogeneity and time dependence in 3D |
| 1174 | spherical mantle convection models with continental drift <i>Earth and Planetary</i> |
| 1175 | Science Letters 233(1-2) 121–135 |
| 1177 | Phillips, B. R., & Coltice, N. (2010) Temperature beneath continents as a func- |
| 1178 | tion of continental cover and convective wavelength Iournal of Geophysical |
| 1170 | Research 115(B4) |
| 1180 | Pollack H N (1986 October) Cratonization and thermal evolution of the mantle |
| 1100 | roman, m. m. (1999, 990000). Oracomzation and thermal evolution of the mallitle. |

| 1181 | Earth and Planetary Science Letters, 80(1-2), 175–182. |
|------|--|
| 1182 | Pozzo, M., Davies, C., Gubbins, D., & Alfè, D. (2013, April). Thermal and electrical |
| 1183 | conductivity of iron at Earth's core conditions. <i>Nature</i> , 485(7398), 355–358. |
| 1184 | Rampino, M. R., & Stothers, R. B. (1988, August). Flood Basalt Volcanism During |
| 1185 | the Past 250 Million Years. Science, 241(4866), 663–668. |
| 1186 | Ricard, Y., Richards, M., Lithgow-Bertelloni, C., & Le Stunff, Y. (1993). A geody- |
| 1187 | namic model of mantle density heterogeneity. <i>Journal of Geophysical Research</i> . |
| 1188 | 98(B12), 21895–21909. |
| 1180 | Bicard Y Vigny C & Froidevaux C (1989 October) Mantle heterogeneities |
| 1100 | geoid and plate motion: A Monte Carlo inversion Journal of Geonbusical Re- |
| 1101 | search $0/(B10)$ 13739–13754 |
| 1191 | Bicharde M A Duncan B A & Courtillot V E (1080 October) Elood Basalte |
| 1192 | and Hot Spot Tracks: Dlumo Honds and Tails Science 2/6(4026) 102 107 |
| 1193 | Bitcomp I Douss A van Hoijst H I & Woodhouse I H (2011 December) |
| 1194 | S40PTS: a degree 40 shear velocity model for the mantle from new Payleigh |
| 1195 | successful the second s |
| 1196 | wave dispersion, teleseisnic traventine and normal-mode splitting function $m_{accurrent}$ (combusied formal intermediate $1.01/(2)$, 1922, 1926 |
| 1197 | Difference L and Heiler H L & Weedbarren L H (1000). Complete share shar |
| 1198 | Ritseina, J., van Heijst, H. J., & Woodhouse, J. H. (1999). Complex shear wave ve- |
| 1199 | locity structure imaged beneath Africa and Iceland. Science, 286 (5446), 1925– |
| 1200 | |
| 1201 | Rolf, T., Coltice, N., & Tackley, P. J. (2012, October). Linking continental drift, |
| 1202 | plate tectonics and the thermal state of the Earth's mantle. Earth and Plane- |
| 1203 | tary Science Letters, 351-352(C), 134–146. |
| 1204 | Rolf, T., & Tackley, P. J. (2011, September). Focussing of stress by continents in |
| 1205 | 3D spherical mantle convection with self-consistent plate tectonics. <i>Geophysical</i> |
| 1206 | Research Letters, $38(18)$. |
| 1207 | Rozel, A. B., Golabek, G. J., Jain, C., Tackley, P. J., & Gerya, T. (2017, May). |
| 1208 | Continental crust formation on early Earth controlled by intrusive magmatism. |
| 1209 | Nature, 545 (7654), 332 - 335. |
| 1210 | Rudnick, R. L., & Gao, S. (2003). Composition of the Continental Crust. In Treatise |
| 1211 | on geochemistry (pp. 1–64). Elsevier. |
| 1212 | Schubert, G., Turcotte, D. L., & Olson, P. (2001). Mantle Convection in the Earth |
| 1213 | and Planets. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. |
| 1214 | Schutt, D. L., & Lesher, C. E. (2006, May). Effects of melt depletion on the density |
| 1215 | and seismic velocity of garnet and spinel lherzolite. Journal of Geophysical Re- |
| 1216 | search, 111(B5). |
| 1217 | Scrutton, R. A. (1973). The age relationship of igneous activity and continental |
| 1218 | break-up. Geological Magazine, 110(03), 227–234. |
| 1219 | Sengör, A. M. C., & Burke, K. (1978, January). Relative timing of rifting and vol- |
| 1220 | canism on Earth and its tectonic implications. Geophysical Research Letters, |
| 1221 | 5(6), 419–421. |
| 1222 | Solomatov, V. S. (1995, February). Scaling of Temperature-Dependent and Stress- |
| 1223 | Dependent Viscosity Convection. <i>Physics of Fluids</i> , 7(2), 266–274. |
| 1224 | Stevenson, D. J. (1990). Fluid dynamics of core formation. In Origin of the earth |
| 1225 | (pp 231–249) New York: Oxford University Press |
| 1225 | Su W. J. & Dziewonski A. M. (1997 March). Simultaneous inversion for 3-D vari- |
| 1220 | ations in shear and bulk velocity in the mantle Physics of the Earth and Plan- |
| 1227 | etary Interiore $100(1.4)$ 135–156 |
| 1228 | Su W I Woodward B I & Driowonski A M (1004) Dogroo 12 Model of Shear |
| 1229 | Velocity Hotorogonality in the Mantle Lowrad of Coenhusical Research: Colid |
| 1230 | F_{out} the $\rho_0(\mathbf{R}_4)$ 6045 6080 |
| 1231 | Tacklay P. J. (2008) December) Modelling compressible mentle connection with |
| 1232 | large vigeocity, contracts in a three dimensional spherical shell using the size |
| 1233 | range viscosity contrasts in a three-dimensional spherical shell using the yin- |
| 1234 | yang grid. <i>Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors</i> , 171(1-4), 7–18. |
| 1235 | Tackiey, r. J. (2008b, November). Self-consistent generation of tectonic plates in |
| | |
| | |

time-dependent, three-dimensional mantle convection simulations. Geochem-1236 istry, Geophysics, Geosystems, 1(8). 1237 Tackley, P. J., Ammann, M., Brodholt, J. P., Dobson, D. P., & Valencia, D. (2013)1238 July). Mantle dynamics in super-Earths: Post-perovskite rheology and self-1239 regulation of viscosity. *Icarus*, 225(1), 50–61. 1240 Tackley, P. J., & King, S. D. (2003, April). Testing the tracer ratio method for mod-1241 eling active compositional fields in mantle convection simulations. Geochem-1242 istry, Geophysics, Geosystems, 4(4). 1243 van der Hilst, R. D., de Hoop, M. V., Wang, P., Shim, S. H., Ma, P., & Tenorio, 1244 L. (2007, March). Seismostratigraphy and Thermal Structure of Earth's 1245 Core-Mantle Boundary Region. Science, 315(5820), 1813–1817. 1246 van der Hilst, R. D., Widiyantoro, S., & Engdahl, E. R. (1997, April). Evidence for 1247 deep mantle circulation from global tomography. Nature, 386(6625), 578–584. 1248 Wang, Q., Schi tte, L., & Campbell, I. H. (1996, August). Geochronological con-1249 straints on the age of komatiites and nickel mineralisation in the Lake John-1250 ston greenstone belt, Yilgarn Craton, Western Australia. Australian Journal of 1251 Earth Sciences, 43(4), 381-385. 1252 White, R., & McKenzie, D. (1989). Magmatism at rift zones: The generation of vol-1253 canic continental margins and flood basalts. Journal of Geophysical Research, 1254 94 (B6), 7685–7729. 1255 Wooden, J. L., Czamanske, G. K., Fedorenko, V. A., Arndt, N. T., Chauvel, C., 1256 Bouse, R. M., ... Siems, D. F. (1993, August). Isotopic and trace-element 1257 constraints on mantle and crustal contributions to Siberian continental flood 1258 GEOCHIMICA ET COSMOCHIMICA ACTA, basalts, Noril'sk area, Siberia. 1259 57(15), 3677-3704.1260 Xie, S., & Tackley, P. J. (2004a, September). Evolution of helium and argon isotopes 1261 in a convecting mantle. Physics of the Earth and Planetary Interiors, 146(3-1262 4), 417-439.1263 Xie, S., & Tackley, P. J. (2004b, November). Evolution of U-Pb and Sm-Nd systems 1264 in numerical models of mantle convection and plate tectonics. Journal of Geo-1265 physical Research, 109(B11). 1266 Xu, W., Lithgow-Bertelloni, C., Stixrude, L., & Ritsema, J. (2008, October). The 1267 effect of bulk composition and temperature on mantle seismic structure. Earth 1268 and Planetary Science Letters, 275(1-2), 70–79. 1269 Yamazaki, D., & Karato, S.-i. (2001, April). Some mineral physics constraints on the 1270 rheology and geothermal structure of Earth's lower mantle. American Mineral-1271 oqist, 86(4), 385-391.1272 Yoshida, M., Iwase, Y., & Honda, S. (1999, April). Generation of plumes under 1273 a localized high viscosity lid in 3-D spherical shell convection. Geophysical Re-1274 search Letters, 26(7), 947-950. 1275 Zerr, A., Diegeler, A., & Boehler, R. (1998, July). Solidus of Earth's deep mantle. 1276 Science, 281(5374), 243-246. 1277 Zhang, P., Cohen, R. E., & Haule, K. (2015, January). Effects of electron corre-1278 lations on transport properties of iron at Earth's core conditions. Nature. 1279 517(7536), 605-607.1280 Zhao, D. P. Global tomographic images of mantle plumes and subduct-(2004).1281 ing slabs: insight into deep Earth dynamics. Physics of the Earth and Plane-1282 tary Interiors, 146(1-2), 3-34. 1283 Zhong, S., & Gurnis, M. (1993, July). Dynamic feedback between a continentlike 1284 raft and thermal convection. Journal of Geophysical Research, 98(B7), 12219-12232.1286 Zhong, S., & Liu, X. (2016, January). The long-wavelength mantle structure 1287 and dynamics and implications for large-scale tectonics and volcanism in the 1288 Phanerozoic. Gondwana Research, 29(1), 83–104. 1289

¹²⁹⁰ Zhong, S., Zhang, N., Li, Z.-X., & Roberts, J. H. (2007). Supercontinent cycles, true

- polar wander, and very long-wavelength mantle convection. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 261 (3-4), 551–564.
- ¹²⁹³ Zhong, S. J. (2006). Constraints on thermochemical convection of the mantle from
 ¹²⁹⁴ plume heat flux, plume excess temperature, and upper mantle temperature.
 ¹²⁹⁵ Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth, 111(B4).