

Dear Author:

Thank you for publishing with AGU. Your proofs are attached. Following the annotation guidelines and returning the proofs quickly will allow prompt online posting of the final version of your paper.

We have added several new features to the journal Web sites and additional services that we want to bring to your attention. The online version of your paper is enhanced in several ways, and will now include "Altmetrics," which continually tracks and links to mentions in news outlets, twitter, blogs, and other social media. A link to scholarly citations is also provided. Papers are also available in a regular PDF and as a Readcube version, which includes the Altmetrics and dynamic links to references and figures.

Please follow our social media sites! Several of our journals have social media sites; these and other AGU sites are indexed <u>here</u>.

If you have not already, we encourage you to create an <u>ORCID</u> (Open Researcher and Contributor ID) so that your work can be uniquely tracked. Your ORCID can be created and linked through your GEMS account.

Finally, your feedback is important to us. If you have questions or comments regarding your AGU Publications experience, including information on production and proofs, please contact us at <u>publications@agu.org</u>. We will also be contacting you soon after your article is published with an author survey. Please take a few minutes to respond to this online survey; your input is important in improving the overall editorial and production process.

Thank you again for supporting AGU.

Sincerely,

R. Blak

Brooks Hanson Director, Publications AGU bhanson@agu.org

2000 Florida Avenue, NW, Washington, DC 20009-1277 Tel: 202.462.6900 Fax: +1 202.328.0566 www.agu.org



PUBLICATION FEE CONSENT FORM

Dear Author:

As documented on the Steps to Publications webpage, content accepted for publication in an AGU journal may be subject to publication fees. The current fee schedule for AGU journalsis available from the Author Resources webpage.

This consent form has been generated for you in accordance with this policy on the basis of the final word, table, and figure counts of your article. The word count is for the abstract, body text, and captions only. Please review the calculated publication fee below, complete any relevant fields necessary for us to process your final invoice, and return a signed copy of this form to the production editor with your proof corrections. A final invoice will be mailed to the named billing contact within a few weeks of your articles appearance online in edited format.

Please note: OnlineOpen, the open access option for AGU journals, must be purchased through the OnlineOpen order form (https://authorservices.wiley.com/bauthor/onlineopen_order.asp). If you elected OnlineOpen at any earlier phase of submission and have not already submitted your order online, please do so now. Authors who select OnlineOpen will not be charged any base publication fee, but excess length fees will still apply.

ARTICLE DETAILS

Journal: Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems

Article: Motoki, M. H., and M. D.Ballmer (2015), Intraplate volcanism due to convective instability of stagnant slabs in the mantle transition zone, *Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst.*, *16*, doi:10.1002/2014GC005608.

Words: 6,643	Publishing Units: 22
Figures: 7	Excess Publishing Units: 0
Tables: 2	Publication Fee: \$1000
OnlineOpen: No	
	BILLING DETAILS
Name:	Phone:
Address:	Email:
	Date
Signature:	

@AGU PUBLICATIONS

Geochemistry, Geophysics, Geosystems

RESEARCH ARTICLE

10.1002/2014GC005608

Kev Points:

- Slabs that stagnate at the base of the upper mantle can go convectively unstable
- Related upwellings may sustain decompression melting and intraplate volcanism
- Convective instability can disrupt the slab's compositional stratification

Correspondence to:

M. D. Ballmer, ballmer@elsi.jp

Citation:

Motoki, M. H., and M. D. Ballmer (2015), Intraplate volcanism due to convective instability of stagnant slabs in the mantle transition zone, Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst., 16, doi:10.1002/ 2014GC005608

Received 10 OCT 2014 Accepted 23 JAN 2015 Accepted article online 30 JAN 2015

Intraplate volcanism due to convective instability of stagnant slabs in the mantle transition zone

Matthew H. Motoki¹ and Maxim D. Ballmer^{1,2}

AQ8

3

4

7

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

Stage:

Page: 1

¹Department of Geology and Geophysics, School of Ocean and Earth Sciences and Technology, University of Hawaii at Manoa, Honolulu, Hawaii, USA, ²Earth-Life Science Institute, Tokyo Institute of Technology, Meguro, Tokyo, Japan

Abstract The study of volcanism can further our understanding of Earth's mantle processes and compo-5 sition. Continental intraplate volcanism commonly occurs above subducted slabs that stagnate in the Man-6 tle Transition Zone (MTZ), such as in Europe, eastern China, and western North America. Here, we use twodimensional numerical models to explore the evolution of stagnant slabs in the MTZ and their potential to 8 sustain mantle upwellings that can support volcanism. We find that weak slabs may go convectively unsta-9 10 ble within tens of million years. Upwellings rise out of the relatively warm underbelly of the slab, are entrained by ambient-mantle flow and reach the base of the lithosphere. The first and most vigorous upwel-11 lings rise adjacent to lateral heterogeneity within the slab. Ultimately, convective instability also acts to sep-12 arate the compositional components of the slab, harzburgite, and eclogite, from each other with 13 harzburgite rising into the upper mantle and eclogite sinking into the lower mantle. Such a physical filtering 14 process may sustain a long-term compositional gradient across the MTZ.

1. Introduction

Volcanism far away from tectonic-plate boundaries can inform about mantle processes and composition. Whereas the occurrence of age-progressive volcano chains with activity at localized hotspots is well explained by mantle plumes that rise from the lowermost mantle [Wilson, 1963; Morgan, 1972; Griffiths, 1986; Torsvik et al., 2006; Ballmer et al., 2013b], the origin of nonhotspot intraplate volcanism remains poorly understood and controversial. Mechanisms invoked for nonhotspot volcanism include (1) sublithospheric convective instability, (2) buoyant decompression melting, (3) shear-driven upwelling, and (4) lithospheric cracking. For example, sublithospheric instabilities (1) such as small-scale convection [Richter and Parsons, 1975; Bonatti and Harrison, 1976; Buck and Parmentier, 1986; Rabinowicz et al., 1993; Ballmer et al., 2007] (or delamination [Houseman et al., 1981; Gogus and Pysklywec, 2008]) induce passive upwelling and decompression melting in response to downwelling of the negatively buoyant, cool sublithospheric mantle (or lithosphere itself). Analogously, buoyant decompression melting (2) can cause active upwelling due to instability of a positively buoyant layer of preexisting partial melt [Tackley and Stevenson, 1993; Raddick et al., 2002; Hernlund et al., 2008]. In contrast, the energy sources for shear-driven upwelling (3) and lithospheric cracking (4) are independent of density inversions in the mantle: the former (3) requires horizontal shear-driven or pressure-driven asthenospheric flow to be vertically redirected along steps of lithospheric thickness and/ or mantle viscosity anomalies [Conrad et al., 2010; Bianco et al., 2011; Ballmer et al., 2013a]. The latter (4) invokes tectonic stresses to crack the plate [Sandwell et al., 1995; Hieronymus and Bercovici, 1999, 2000] and to allow extraction of preexisting melts that pond at the base of the lithosphere [e.g., Sakamaki et al., 2013]. In the absence of strong thermal anomalies (as would be related e.g., to a mantle plume), all these mechanisms call for mantle materials to be at ((2), (4)), or at least close to ((1), (3)) the solidus.

Analysis of the spatiotemporal patterns of nonhotspot intraplate volcanism can serve to distinguish its 39 dynamical origin. For example, ocean island chains with coeval volcanic activity over distances \geq 1500 km— 40 such as documented along the subparallel trends of the Marshalls and the Cook-Austral Islands—have been 41 42 explained by small-scale convection with active decompression melting along one (or multiple parallel) "hot line(s)" [Bonatti and Harrison, 1976; Ballmer et al., 2009, 2010]. Small volcanic provinces with short-lived 43 activity <10 Myrs such as the Marquesas Islands have instead been associated with buoyant decompression 44 melting [Raddick et al., 2002]. Finally, volcanic ridges that display some form of age progression, but lack the 45 specific features (in terms of direction and speed of progression) that are predicted for hotspot chains, have 46

10.1002/2014GC005608

47

48

58

59

60

61

62

63

64

65

66

67

68

69

70

71

72 73

74

75

76

77

78

79

93

94

AO1

been related to lithospheric cracking [Sandwell et al., 1995; Hieronymus and Bercovici, 2000; Cormier et al., 2011], or shear-driven upwelling [Bianco et al., 2011; Ballmer et al., 2013a].

On the global scale, intraplate nonhotspot volcanism tends to be regionally clustered. For example, basaltic 49 (i.e., presumably mantle-derived) intraplate volcanism on continents is focused in western North America 50 (www.navdat.org), eastern Australia [Wellman and McDougall, 1974; Johnson, 1989], eastern China [Zhou 51 and Armstrong, 1982; Lei and Zhao, 2005], and central Europe [Wilson and Downes, 2006; Lustrino and Wilson, 52 2007]. All these regions are underlain by subducted slabs (i.e., the Farallon, Pacific, and Alpine slabs, respec-53 tively) that stagnate in the MTZ [Piromallo and Faccenna, 2004; Sigloch et al., 2008; Fukao and Obayashi, 54 2013]. In many cases, volcanic activity has been specifically related to the toes of the slabs at the base of the upper mantle [Piromallo and Faccenna, 2004; Wilson and Downes, 2006; Faccenna et al., 2010; Lei, 2012] 56 or slab windows [Liu and Stegman, 2012]. 57

Volcanism directly above stagnant slabs or near their toes has commonly been related to upward mantle return flow in response to slab downwelling [Faccenna et al., 2010; Kameyama and Nishioka, 2012; Tang et al., 2014]. However, slabs that sink to stagnate at the base of the upper mantle do so typically by rolling back, and as such primarily induce toroidal flow (i.e., horizontal flow around their nearest edges) with relatively little potential for focused upwelling and decompression melting [Piromallo et al., 2006; Long and Silver, 2009]. For slab rollback, poloidal flow with upwelling in the backarc and near the tip of the slab is primarily important during the initial stages of rollback subduction [e.g., Jadamec and Billen, 2012], but declines as soon as the slab lies down to stagnate in the MTZ [Faccenna et al., 2010; Strak and Schellart, 2014].

As an alternative mechanism for upwelling and decompression melting above a stagnant slab, Richard and coworkers [Richard and Bercovici, 2009; Richard and Iwamori, 2010] have proposed convective instability of a buoyant hydrated layer directly overlying the slab. This mechanism has recently received increased attention, as seismic tomography has successfully imaged localized low-velocity anomalies that extend from the top of the slab to the base of the lithosphere, particularly beneath eastern Asia [Lei and Zhao, 2005; Lei et al., 2009; Zhao et al., 2009; Lei et al., 2013]. However, the thin hydrated layer, which results from sediment dehydration very close to the trench, is expected to become convectively stable before it reaches the MTZ (i.e. before \sim 10 Myr, cf. Goes et al. [2011]) due to progressive cooling of the layer by the directly underlying (coolest part of the) slab. More favorable conditions for convective instability of a hydrated layer occur in the mantle wedge, i.e. before progressive cooling occurred [see Gerya and Yuen, 2003; Gorczyk et al., 2007]. Whereas geochemical signatures of basaltic volcanism formed above the mantle wedge indeed display evidence for subduction-related fluids in the source [Iwamori, 1991; Wilson and Downes, 2006], such evidence is often absent for volcanism above the stagnant slab [Zou et al., 2008].

Another mechanism for mantle upwelling from (or near) stagnant slabs and decompression melting has so 80 far been largely ignored: convective instability of the slab itself. Though being cold and dense overall, a slab 81 at the base of the upper mantle may become unstable, as its upper part is both thermally (cool) and compo-82 sitionally (eclogite) denser than its underbelly (relatively warm harzburgite). Such instability may be 83 advanced by slab-core superplasticity, which is a potential legacy of the slab's passage through the 410 km 84 deep olivine-wadsleyite phase transition, where dynamic recrystallization is expected to causes significant 85 grain-size reduction [Vaughan and Coe, 1981; Rubie, 1984; Riedel and Karato, 1997; Yamazaki et al., 2005]. 86 The resulting microscale grain sizes may reduce the viscosity of the slab core by a couple of orders of mag-87 nitude in the deformation regime of diffusion creep [e.g., Karato et al., 2001]. 88

In this study, we use two-dimensional numerical models of upper mantle convection to systematically 89 explore buoyancy-driven instability of the stagnant slab's underbelly. We investigate the timescales of 90 development of this instability, assess its potential to drive upwelling that persists through the entire upper 91 mantle and to support sublithospheric melting, as well as discuss its consequences for the fate of slab mate-92 rials. These predictions will help to distinguish this mechanism from alternative forms of upwelling.

2. Methods

In this study, we analyze a suite of two-dimensional models by numerically solving the equations for conser-95 vation of mass, momentum, and energy using the finite element code CITCOM [Moresi et al., 1996]. Our 96

MOTOKI AND BALLMER

10.1002/2014GC005608



Figure 1. Conceptual three-dimensional visualization of convective instability rising out of a stagnant slab. The two-dimensional model represents a cross-section parallel to the trench. The distance of the model cross-section from the trench increases over time.

models are 1320 km wide, and 97 660 km deep, discretized by 1025 98 and 481 finite elements in the hori-99 zontal and vertical directions, 100 respectively. Horizontally, grid 101 spacing is uniform, but vertically, grid refinement allows improved 103 resolution (of \sim 0.89 km) near the 104 bottom of the computational box. All boundaries are closed to inflow 106 and outflow. The thermal boundary conditions on both sides are 108 reflective, while the top and bot-109

111

tom are held at a constant potential temperatures of $T_{top} = 0^{\circ}$ C and $T_{bottom} = T_0 = 1350^{\circ}$ C [Herzberg et al., 2007].

The model is designed to investigate the behavior of a subducted slab that stagnates at the base of the upper mantle. The two-dimensional model represents a cross section that runs parallel to the the two-dimensional model represents a cross section that runs parallel to the the two-dimensional model represents a cross section that runs parallel to the two-dimensional model represents a cross section that runs parallel to the two-dimensional model represents a cross section that runs parallel to the two-dimensional model represents a cross section that runs parallel to the two-dimensional model represents a cross section that runs parallel to the two-dimensional model represents a cross section that runs parallel to the two-dimensional model represents a cross section that runs parallel to the two-dimensional model represents a cross section that runs parallel to the two-dimensional model represents a cross section that runs parallel to the two-dimensional model represents a cross section that runs parallel to the two-dimensional model represents a cross section that runs parallel to the two-dimensional model represents a cross section that runs parallel to the two-dimensional model represents a cross section that runs parallel to the two-dimensional model represents a cross section that runs parallel to the two-dimensional model represents a cross section that runs parallel to the two-dimensional model represents a cross section that runs parallel to the two-dimensional model represents a cross section that runs parallel to the two-dimensional model represents a cross section that runs parallel to the two-dimensional model model runs parallel to the two-dimensional model runs parallel to two-dimensional model mo



Figure 2. Initial and boundary conditions of our numerical models. (a) Thermal and velocity (free slip on the sides and no slip at the top and bottom) boundary conditions are marked red. The imposed thermal lithosphere and stagnant slab are denoted gray. The horizontally uniform initial thermal condition is detailed in Figure 2b as vertical profiles, which are a function of the age of the oceanic lithosphere (i.e., 5 Myr in all of our models) at the time of subduction τ_{slab} .

113 trench of the subduction zone 114 (i.e., the trench is out-of-plane of 115 the two-dimensional model), and 116 is fixed to the stagnant slab (Fig-117 ure 1). Accordingly, distance of 118 F1 the model's cross section from 119 the trench conceptually increases 120 as model time increases (how-121 ever, not necessarily proportion-122 ally, depending on subduction 123 style). The fixture of the model to 124 the slab, as well as expectation 125 that convective instability both 126 within the transition zone and at 127 the base of the overriding litho-128 sphere organize as longitudinal 129 rolls in three dimensions [e.g., 130 Richter and Parsons, 1975] moti-131 vate the choice of a simplified two-dimensional geometry (see 133 Figure 2a for model setup). The 134 F2 initial thermal profile of the over-135 riding plate corresponds to that 136 of 5 Ma old oceanic lithosphere 137 (i.e., according to the half-space 138 cooling model), except for one 139 test case as detailed in the text 140 below. 141

To determine the initial temperature142profile of the subducted slab, we143assume that the slab's thermal pro-144file at the trench (i.e., just before145subduction) corresponds to that of146oceanic lithosphere of age τ_{slab} , and147that it takes 10 Myr for the slab to148sink to the base of the upper mantle149

MOTOKI AND BALLMER

Parameter	Description	Value; Range
E*	Activation energy	120 kJ/mol
g	Gravitational acceleration	9.8 m/s
To	Reference temperature	1350°C
κ	Thermal diffusivity	1.10 ⁶ m ² /s
ρ_0	Reference density	3300 kg/m ³
A	Thermal expansivity	$2.5 imes10^{-5}{ m K}^{-1}$ to $4.5 imes10^{-5}{ m K}^{-1a}$
η_0	Reference viscosity	$1.48 imes10^{19}$ Pa·s to $4.46 imes10^{19}$ Pa·s ^a
τ_{slab}	Plate age at trench	5–70 Ma ^a
$\Delta \rho_{\text{ECL}}$	Excess density of eclogite	91–150 kg/m ^{3b}
$\Delta \rho_{F}$	Density change due to depletion	-230 kg/m^3 to -100 kg/m^{3b}

10.1002/2014GC005608

[cf. Goes et al., 2011]. Further 150

assuming that sinking occurs	151
through an infinite space of	152
$T = 1350^{\circ}$ C, we calculate the	153
slab's thermal profile numeri-	154
cally using Fourier Series	155
expansion. We then position	156
the slab such that the	157
1282.5°C isotherm (i.e., the	158
0.95 isotherm nondimen-	159
sionally) at the underbelly of	160
the slab intersects the bot-	161
tom boundary. Using the	162
Crank-Nicholson scheme, we	163

168

170

169 T1

further allow the thermal profile to evolve (i.e., by diffusion) for another 1 Myr within the boundary conditions of the model (Figure 2b). The two-dimensional initial thermal conditions of the models are lateral extensions of these evolved profiles and further include a small thermal random noise (with amplitudes of $\pm 15^{\circ}$ C).

2.1. Rheology Parameterization

We use a Newtonian rheology with low activation energy ($E^* = 120 \text{ kJ/mol}$; see Table 1 for notations) to model flow in the upper mantle in general, and in the MTZ in particular:

$$\eta = \eta_0 \exp\left(\frac{E^*}{RT} - \frac{E^*}{RT_0}\right),\tag{1}$$

where η_0 is the reference viscosity, *R* the ideal gas constant, *T* potential temperature, and T_0 the reference temperature.

The low value for E* compared to experimental estimates for diffusion creep (~500 kJ/mol [Karato and Wu, 173 1993]) has been chosen to simulate the complex rheology of the upper mantle and transition zone. For 174 example, Christensen [1984] has shown that convection of a non-Newtonian liquid can be mimicked by 175 using a Newtonian rheology with an E* that is reduced by a factor of 2–3. Observations of seismic anisot-176 ropy in the MTZ and much of the upper mantle indicate that non-Newtonian dislocation creep is a domi-177 nant deformation mechanism [e.g., Yuan and Beghein, 2014], consistent with mineral-physics constraints 178 [e.g., Karato and Wu, 1993; Shimojuku et al., 2009]. As an additional complication, micrometer-scale grain 179 sizes are thought to be present in the cool slab core due to dynamic recrystallization of wadsleyite as the 180 slab crosses the 410 km discontinuity [Riedel and Karato, 1997; Karato et al., 2001] and slow grain growth 181 [Yamazaki et al., 2005]. Such small grain sizes have been proposed to reduce slab viscosity by orders of 182 magnitude in the deformation regime of diffusion creep to render the cool slab core less viscous than the 183 warm ambient mantle ("superplasticity"). Thus, cold temperatures may be associated with the lowest viscos-184 ities in the MTZ, something that is consistent with even a negative effective E*. In our choice of E*, however, 185 we do not explicitly account for superplasticity of the slab core. Accordingly, this choice remains a conserva-186 tive estimate. 187

2.2. Density Parameterization

Mantle buoyancy drives the flow and is affected by thermal and compositional density anomalies. We take mantle density ρ to be dependent on temperature, depletion of the peridotite matrix *F*, and the volume fraction of eclogite X_{ECL} :

$$\rho = \rho_0 - \alpha (T - T_0) + F \Delta \rho_F + X_{ECL} \Delta \rho_{ECL}, \qquad (2)$$

where ρ_0 is reference density, α is thermal expansivity, $\Delta \rho_F$ is the density change due to depletion, and192 $\Delta \rho_{ECL}$ is the excess density of eclogite. Parameters $\Delta \rho_{ECL}$ and $\Delta \rho_F$ are depth-dependent (parameterized193according to Xu et al. [2008]). At depths <300 km, $\Delta \rho_{ECL}$ and $\Delta \rho_F$ are set to 150 and -165 km/m³; between194300 and 410 km, they are fixed at 210 and -230 km/m³; and deeper than 410 km, they are 91 and195-100 km/m³, respectively.196

188

189

190

10.1002/2014GC005608



Figure 3. Time evolution (i.e., from top to bottom) of model results for reference case 13/E. (left column; a-d) Composition (colors) and velocity (arrows); (right column; e-h) Temperature (°C). Arrow length scale is the same in all plots (see Figure 3a).

3. Results

3.1. General Model Predictions

Figure 2b shows the initial thermal condition of the model as a one-dimensional vertical profile with a thin 199 top thermal boundary layer and a cool stagnant slab at the base of the model. We account for warming of 200 the slab during its passage through the upper mantle before the onset of the simulation. However, the 201 slab's core is cool compared to the ambient mantle, and hence anomalously dense. A thin but dense layer 202 of eclogite (i.e., the high-pressure polymorph of the basaltic oceanic crust) atop the slab further increases this density anomaly (Figure 3a). The effects of temperature and eclogite on density are somewhat offset by 204 F3 those of buoyant harzburgite within the slab. Harzburgite is the depleted residuum of previous mid-ocean 205 ridge melting, with depletion ranging from ${\sim}20\%$ just beneath the eclogite layer and steadily decreasing 206 with depth (Figure 3a). As thermal effects are dominant, however, the underbelly of the slab is buoyant 207 compared to the slab's core. Thus, the stagnant slab is potentially convectively unstable. 208

The evolution of density and viscosity over time controls the behavior of the slab. Although the slab initially 209 displays an unstable density configuration, convection does not immediately develop as being impeded by 210 the high viscosity of the slab. We find that heating the cool slab by the ambient mantle from below and 211 above ultimately drives convective instability. The most important consequence of conductive slab heating 212 is that the viscosity of the slab's core decreases and thus the local Rayleigh number increases with time. In 213

198

197

10.1002/2014GC005608

addition, the warm and less dense layer of mantle at the underbelly of the slab continuously grows (as the modeled mantle is heated from below), pushing up on the slab. Both effects eventually render convection a more efficient mode of heat transport than conduction. Consequently, convective instabilities rise out of the warm layer at the slab's underbelly at a given onset age (see also Appendix A). 217

Bottom heating, however, is not critical for convective instability to occur, as is demonstrated by an (albeit218unrealistic) test-case with reflective bottom thermal boundary conditions (i.e., zero heat flow from the lower219mantle to the base of the slab). In this test case, instability rising out of the slab is less vigorous and some-220what delayed (by 5~10 Myr) than in a similar case with bottom heating (i.e., case 13/E), but both cases are221analogous in general characteristics.222

Convective instability eventually causes disintegration of the slab. As the warm mantle below pushes 223 through the slab (Figure 3b), the instabilities start to form plume-like upwellings. These upwellings displace 224 the dense veneer of eclogite to the side (ultimately, most eclogite accumulates near the bottom boundary of the model; Figure 3d). Most of the buoyant harzburgite is instead entrained by the plumes (Figure 3c). 226 The plumes rise somewhat above the original depth of the top of the slab, but do not penetrate much fur-227 ther through the warmer (and therefore less dense) part of the upper mantle (Figures 3c and 3g). As the 228 plumes are cooler than the ambient mantle, the positive compositional buoyancy of the entrained harzbur-229 gite is at first insufficient to sustain plume ascent all the way to the base of the lithosphere. Accordingly, 230 convection is at first mostly restricted to the deep upper mantle. 231

In our models, passive mantle flow related to small-scale sublithospheric convection (SSC) ultimately drives 232 further ascent of materials that originate from the slab. As the overriding lithosphere is cooled from above, 233 the cool sublithospheric mantle slowly thickens. As soon as it reaches a critical layer thickness, the sublitho-234 spheric mantle undergoes instability to drive SSC in the asthenosphere (Figure 3c). SSC cells readily break 235 down into the lower upper mantle [Korenaga and Jordan, 2004] (Figure 3d). By this time, the slab-derived 236 upwellings have lost most of their negative thermal buoyancy due to thermal dissipation (i.e., diffusion). 237 SSC stirs up slab material and transports harzburgite to the base of the lithosphere. To minimize any interac-238 tion between SSC and the instability rising out of the slab, we tune our models such that the former devel-239 ops much later than the latter (initial age of the overriding plate of only 5 Ma delays SSC). However, in 240 nature both processes are expected to occur coevally in order to allow upwellings to ascend more quickly 241 through the entire upper mantle and to the base of the lithosphere, as is demonstrated by a test case with 242 an initial age of the overriding plate of 70 Myr (i.e. close to the critical age for onset of SSC). In this test case, 243 slab-derived upwellings reach the base of the lithosphere \sim 5 Myr sooner than in a similar case (i.e., case K; 244 see Table 2). 245 T2

3.2. Parameter Study

We vary key model parameters to study their effects on the onset time τ_{onset} and wavelength of convective 247 instability of the slab λ (Table 2). The parameters we investigate are the slab age at trench, which defines 248 the thermal structure of the subducted slab (Figure 2b), mantle viscosity, and thermal expansivity (Tables 1 249 and 2). Mantle viscosity controls both thermal and compositional convection, whereas thermal expansivity 250 affects thermal convection only. We use the root mean square (RMS) of the vertical velocity component at a 251 depth of 606 km ($v_{rms,606}$) to define a criterion for τ_{onset} . At τ_{onset} , $v_{rms,606}$ reaches and surpasses 0.05($v_{max,606}$) 252 $-v_{start,606}$ + $v_{start,606}$ for the first time, where $v_{start,606}$ and $v_{max,606}$ are the initial and maximum RMS vertical 253 velocity measured. Time evolution of $v_{rms,606}$ for select parameter suites are shown in Figure 4. 254 F4

We find that model results strongly depend on the slab age at trench τ_{slab} . As the effective thermal age of 255 oceanic plates is limited by SSC to \sim 70 Ma [e.g., Doin and Fleitout, 1996], we explore τ_{slab} in the range of 5 256 and 70 Ma (Cases A–O in Table 2), keeping all other parameters fixed. τ_{slab} defines the initial condition of 257 the model (Figure 2b). Old plates have developed a thicker thermal boundary layer than young plates as 258 they are subducted, and hence sustain a thicker and cooler thermal anomaly as they enter the MTZ. For 259 such old and thick plates, the slab's eclogite layer (i.e., formerly oceanic crust) is also initially positioned shal-260 lower. The net effect of these differences in initial condition as a function of τ_{slab} is that τ_{onset} and λ gener-261 ally increase with increasing τ_{slab} (In contrast, peak plume rise speeds do not show a clear trend with τ_{slab} ; 262 see peaks of curves in Figures 4a and 4b). The key parameter controlling λ is the thickness of the layer that 263 goes unstable (i.e., the slab and its underbelly). In contrast, key to control au_{onset} is the initial temperature 264 minimum of the slab's core, which defines the effective viscosity of the slab. The increase of τ_{onset} with τ_{slab} 265

10.1002/2014GC005608

	Case	$\tau_{\textit{slab}}$ (Ma)	η ₀ (Pa·s)	α (K ⁻¹)	τ_{onset} (Myr)	v _{max,606} (cm/yr)	λ (km)
Plate age at trench	А	5	$2.98 imes 10^{19}$	3.5×10^{-5}	8.15	0.76	113
	B* (5)	10	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	10.79	0.86	120
	С	15	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes10^{-5}$	14.07	0.84	140
	D	20	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes10^{-5}$	18.59	0.88	145
	E* (13, γ)	25	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes10^{-5}$	20.45	0.86	159
	F	30	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	25.70	0.77	162
	G	35	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	23.43	0.90	181
	Н	40	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	27.66	0.93	180
	J	45	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	32.23	0.95	207
	К	50	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	31.05	0.87	186
	L* (III)	55	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	34.80	0.99	215
	Μ	60	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	39.89	1.02	223
	Ν	65	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	35.34	0.97	250
	O* (21)	70	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes10^{-5}$	33.21	0.99	266
Reference viscosity	1	10	$1.48 imes 10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	5.84	1.41	119
	2	10	$1.99 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	6.88	1.23	120
	3	10	$2.23 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	8.38	1.05	120
	4	10	$2.55 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	9.45	0.95	120
	5* (B)	10	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	10.79	0.86	120
	6	10	$3.57 imes 10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	12.53	0.76	121
	7	10	$4.46 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	15.03	0.65	137
	8	25	$1.48 imes 10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	11.55	1.50	158
	9	25	$1.79 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	13.53	1.31	159
	10	25	$1.99 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	14.83	1.19	159
	11	25	$2.23 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	16.38	1.09	158
	12	25	$2.55 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	18.20	0.98	144
	13* (E, γ)	25	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	20.45	0.86	145
	14	25	$3.57 imes 10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	23.46	0.76	149
	15	25	$4.46 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	27.56	0.65	145
	16	75	$1.48 imes 10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	21.04	1.85	249
	17	75	$1.79 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	24.04	1.6	248
	18	75	$1.99 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	25.95	1.46	254
	19	75	$2.23 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	28.46	1.31	256
	20	75	$2.55 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	32.49	1.19	258
	21* (O)	75	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	37.20	1.09	257
	22	75	$3.57 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	43.74	0.96	255
	23	75	$4.46 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	51.77	0.79	254
α	I.	55	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$2.5 imes 10^{-5}$	31.00	0.95	214
	П	55	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$3.0 imes 10^{-5}$	33.60	0.98	215
	III* (L)	55	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes 10^{-5}$	34.80	0.99	215
	IV	55	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$4.0 imes 10^{-5}$	36.15	1.02	217
	V	55	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$4.5 imes10^{-5}$	37.71	1.03	218
Fracture zone	α	25, 15	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes10^{-5}$	9.33	0.44	189
	β	25, 20	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes10^{-5}$	11.98	0.69	201
	γ* (13,E)	25, 25	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes10^{-5}$	20.48	0.86	159
	δ	25, 27	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes10^{-5}$	14.92	0.74	179
	3	25, 30	$2.98 imes10^{19}$	$3.5 imes10^{-5}$	12.43	0.68	213
	ζ	25, 35	$2.98 imes 10^{19}$	3.5×10^{-5}	11.35	0.57	213

^aCase identifiers are given in the second column, parameters varied between cases of one suite in the first column. (*) A subset of cases are listed more than once; the equivalent case identifier(s) are reported in parentheses. For determination of onset ages τ_{onset} and maximum amplitudes $v_{max,606}$ of convective instability, see text (section 3.2). Wavelengths λ are determined at τ_{onset} as the weighted average of the three most dominant wavelengths of the vertical velocities at 606 km depth. We choose to consider the three most dominant wavelengths as the box width is often not a multiple of the preferred wavelength.

agrees well with the predictions of a semianalytical solution (see Appendix A). However, au_{onset} only steadily 266 increases with τ_{slab} at low τ_{slab} , but not at high $\tau_{slab} > 50$ Myr. For high τ_{slab} , τ_{onset} rather tends to scatter around 50 Myr (Figure 4b). This scattering is due to a limitation in terms of permitted λ in a model box of finite width. Convective instability is artificially delayed as long as its preferred wavelength is not exactly a natural fraction of twice the model box width (see Appendix A).

Another key parameter is reference mantle viscosity η_0 , η_0 is a source of great uncertainty for our under-271 standing of mantle dynamics, both due to the lack of good constraints for this parameter and due to its 272 huge influence on the mobility of mantle rocks. Along these lines, we run three suites of calculations vary-273 ing η_0 between 1.48 \times 10¹⁹ and 4.46 \times 10¹⁹ Pa·s; each suite uses a constant value of τ_{slab} of 10, 25, or 75 274

10.1002/2014GC005608



Figure 4. Vigor of convective instability over time. For four parameter suites (see legends), colored curves show the time evolution of $v_{rms,606}$ (i.e., the root mean square of the vertical velocity component at 606 km depth). Typical plume rise speeds are proportional to $v_{rms,606}$. Cases shown are (a) A–G, (b) H–O, (c) 10–15, and (d) I–V. Black crosses mark the onset times picked for each case.

Ma and all other parameters are fixed (Cases 1–23 in Table 2). We find that τ_{onset} systematically increases with increasing η_0 (Figure 4c). Furthermore, λ as well as peak plume rise speeds steadily decrease with increasing η_0 in our models. 277

In contrast to the controlling parameters τ_{slab} and η_0 , we find that thermal expansivity does not appreciably affect convective instability. We vary thermal expansivity α between 2.5×10^{-5} and 4.5×10^{-5} K⁻¹, while keeping all other parameters fixed (Cases I–VI in Table 2). We find that onset ages (as well as peak plume rise speeds) increase with increasing α , albeit just within a narrow range of about 31–38 Myr (and 1.95– 2.15 cm/yr). While these findings generally confirm the important role of thermal buoyancy in driving convective instability of the slab, they also document the secondary role of α within the experimental uncertainties for this parameter [*Inoue et al.*, 2004; *Katsura et al.*, 2004; *Ye et al.*, 2012].

3.3. The Effects of Heterogeneity

We also explore the effects of lateral density heterogeneity on convective instability of a stagnant slab. As 286 an example for density heterogeneity, we model a subducted fracture zone by juxtaposing two slab seg-287 ments with different au_{slab} (Figure 5a). The subducted fracture zone is positioned near the center of the com-288 F5 putational box (i.e., at x = 742.5 km). The initial thermal condition, however, does not just involve a simple 289 step function at the fracture zone; the transition between the two sides of the slab is rather smoothed line-290 arly over 66 km (i.e., 5% of the width of the box). We note that the old slab segment is initially thicker and 291 denser than the young segment. Thus, the slab's coolest core is initially positioned shallower on the old 292 side than on the young side. This is a direct consequence of our initial thermal condition, for which the 293 depth of the temperature minimum decreases with increasing au_{slab} (see Figure 2b), and generally consistent 294with isostatic compensation of slab segments of different thickness by the phase change at 660 km depth. 295

The consequence of this initial condition is that the cooler and denser old slab segment tends to slowly 296 sink as a whole to establish equilibrium between the two sides. This initial disequilibrium drives box-wide 297 clockwise rotation, an artifact of our model setup that causes nonzero v_{start,606} for all fracture-zone models. 298 Beyond this artifact, we observe that instabilities develop sooner and with a larger vigor in cases with than 299 in cases without a fracture zone. Onset ages systematically decrease with the age difference between the 300 two sides of the slab, and thus with the amplitude of initial heterogeneity. The first plumes form near the 301 fracture zone on the young slab segment (Figures 5a and 5b). About 15 Myrs thereafter, plumes develop all 302 over the young segment (Figure 5c), and ultimately also on the old slab segment (not shown). 303

10.1002/2014GC005608



Figure 5. Convective instability rising out of a heterogenous slab. For case ζ , snapshots of composition and velocity at (a) 0 Myr, (b) 14.7 Myr, and (c) 22.6 Myr. Arrow length scale is the same in all plots (see Figure 5a). τ_{slab} is 25 Ma for the left slab segment and 35 Ma for the right segment. The color scale for composition is the same as Figure 3. Analogous to Figure 4, Figure 5d shows the time evolution of $v_{rm_{5,606}}$ for a suite of cases with τ_{slab} varied for one slab segment (see legend) and fixed at 25 Ma for the other segment (i.e., for cases α - ζ). Black crosses mark onset times.

4. Discussion

We find in our numerical models that slabs which stagnate in the MTZ can go convectively unstable to 305 spawn plume-like upwellings that rise out of the warm underbelly of the slab. Convection is at first limited 306 to within the deep upper mantle, but upwellings are eventually entrained by ambient-mantle flow to reach 307 the base of the overriding lithosphere. For a range of parameters, we find timescales for the onset of the 308 instability of tens of million years. Onset ages are primarily controlled by (and increase with increasing) 309 slab-core viscosity, which itself is a function of MTZ rheology and the age of the subducted slab (see also 310 Appendix A). Since we neglect the effects of grain-size reduction that is thought to occur as the slab enters 311 the MTZ; however, slab-core viscosities as well as onset ages of convective instability are most likely overes-312 timates [Vaughan and Coe, 1981; Rubie, 1984; Riedel and Karato, 1997; Karato et al., 2001; Yamazaki et al., 313 2005]. Future efforts to constrain onset ages, perhaps by seismic illumination of the shape of the slab's eclo-314 gite layer that gets unstable, may improve our understanding of MTZ rheology. 315

We also find that heterogeneity within the slab, such as subducted fracture zones, reduces onset ages. Simi- 316 larly, any thermal or compositional variations beneath the slab are expected to promote convective instabil-317 ity. Instability is expected to be even more so promoted along the edges of the stagnant slab, where 318 arguably the strongest lateral density heterogeneity in the MTZ occurs (i.e., slab versus no slab). These pre-319 dictions are analogous to previous findings for top-down driven small-scale convective instability (SSC), 320 which can be triggered by the presence of heterogeneity such as fracture zones [Huang et al., 2003; Dumou-321 lin et al., 2005], and even more so along larger steps of lithospheric thickness (i.e., a variant of SSC that has 322 been dubbed edge-driven convection [King and Anderson, 1998; King and Ritsema, 2000]). Along these lines, 323 we hypothesize the first and most vigorous upwellings to rise adjacent to the stagnant slab's toe as well as 324 through slab gaps. 325

Once the upwellings reach the base of the lithosphere, they potentially undergo decompression melting to 326 sustain intraplate volcanism at a given distance inland from the trench. As our models predict upwellings to 327 be somewhat cooler than the ambient mantle, however, any such decompression melting would have to 328 be sustained by compositional (i.e., fertile) anomalies. Candidate fertile lithologies involve eclogite and 329 hydrated peridotite. Dense eclogite originating from the top of the slab (i.e., formerly oceanic crust) is 330 indeed predicted to be entrained by upwelling plumes to reach the base of the lithosphere, albeit to small 331 extents on the order of \sim 0.1% only (Figure 6). A layer of hydrated peridotite atop the eclogite layer (which 332 F6 originally formed close to the trench due to dehydration of subducted sediments) is an alternative fertile 333 source lithology. While this layer is expected to become convectively unstable before the slab reaches the 334

10.1002/2014GC005608



Figure 6. Evolution of the average volume fraction of (a) harzburgite and (b) eclogite with depth for case 13/E. The cutoff at the lower end of the colorscales (blue versus white) is at 0.01%.

MTZ [*Gerya and Yuen*, 2003; *Gorczyk et al.*, 2007], some hydrated peridotite may survive the passage through the upper mantle and be passively entrained by convective instability rising out of the slab.

Along these lines, geochemical signatures of associated intraplate volcanism should be controlled by man-337 tle melting of eclogite and perhaps hydrated peridotite, in addition to continental contamination. A signa-338 ture of eclogite melting has indeed been identified for intraplate lavas in eastern China [Sakuyama et al., 339 2013]. A contribution from melting the relatively dry peridotite matrix is only expected as long as upwel-340 lings are warmer than, or at least as warm as, the ambient mantle. This requirement may be met by upwel-341 lings rising through slab windows or adjacent to slab toes (not explicitly modeled here), which should be 342 warmer than those rising out of the slab's underbelly, particularly for a superadiabatic lower mantle. Some-343 what higher potential temperatures in the lower than in the upper mantle may be the consequence of 344 long-term moderated mass transfer across the MTZ [e.g., Christensen, 1995], a situation for which slab stag-345 nation itself provides some good evidence. Future models of slab-derived upwellings should indeed include 346 melting parameterizations for various lithologies. 347

Decompression melting induced by slab-derived upwellings can provide an explanation for intraplate volca- 348 nism in Europe, eastern China, and western North America. These regions display volcanic activity and are 349 underlain by slabs that stagnate in the MTZ. Volcanism is usually relative low-volume and somewhat spo-350 radic, as is consistent with the low extents of fertile lithologies transported to the base of the lithosphere by 351 slab-derived upwelling (cf. Figure 6b). Volcanoes typically form about 1000–2000 km away from the trench, 352 a distance that implies timescales for convective instability rising out of the slab of about 15–30 Myr, i.e., 353 quite a bit smaller than those predicted by our models without heterogeneity (and with simplified rheol-354 ogy). However, volcanoes are commonly underlain by a slab window (e.g., Changbaishan) or close to the 355 slab toe (e.g., Datong, western US volcanism [www.navdat.org], Eifel, Auvergne) [Faccenna et al., 2010; Lei 356 et al., 2013]. Such settings provide lateral heterogeneity much larger than that across a fracture zone, and 357 are thus expected to allow for vigorous slab-derived upwellings with a significantly earlier onset ages (cf. 358 section 3.3). Intraplate volcanism in Europe and China has often been associated to plumes/upwellings that 359 rise from a thermal boundary layer in the mid mantle [*Lustrino and Wilson*, 2007; *Lei et al.*, 2013]. Our work 360 implies that this thermal boundary layer may in fact be positioned at the underside of the slab. 361

In contrast to individual plume-like upwellings ascending through slab gaps or along slab toes, convective 362 instability rising out of the slab's underbelly potentially disrupts the slab's integrity. According to our mod-363 els, this disruption would occur quite a bit later than the rise of these first individual upwellings. Potential 364 consequences involve eradication of the slab's compositional stratification as well as impairment of slab 365 seismic visibility. For example, our reference case 13/E predicts the slab's compositional stratification to be 366 distorted starting at \sim 30 Myrs (Figure 3e). As convection is mostly restricted to the deep upper mantle, 367 however, the slab's overall thermal structure remains coherent until 50–90 Myrs (Figures 3f and 3h). Accord-368 ingly, a slab that undergoes instability should soon appear blurred in seismic images, but continue to 369 appear as one whole anomaly for relatively long timescales, consistent with observations [van der Meer 370 et al., 2010]. Persistent slab seismic visibility may perhaps further be advanced by an eventual slowdown or 371 even shutdown of convective instability due to an increase of slab viscosity. Such an increase could be sus-372 tained by grain growth within the stagnant slab (albeit inferred to be slow [Yamazaki et al., 2005]), or an 373

10.1002/2014GC005608

entering of the slab into the lower mantle. On the other hand, our results suggest the intriguing possibility of complete stagnant slab disintegration (and seismic invisibility) on long timescales, the rheological conditions for which are yet to be constrained by observations. 376

The disruption of the integrity of the slab by convective instability further acts to separate eclogite from 377 harzburgite, and thus has important long-term consequences for the compositions of the upper and lower 378 mantles. As shown in Figure 6, our models predict harzburgite to be ultimately mixed in with the upper 379 mantle, whereas they predict eclogite to accumulate at the bottom of the MTZ (i.e., the bottom of the box). 380 In nature, an eclogitic layer at the bottom of the MTZ may be supported by a density crossover between 381 eclogite and ambient-mantle materials in the uppermost lower mantle [Hirose et al., 1999], where eclogite 382 becomes buoyant. In the long-term, however, eclogite accumulations at \sim 660 km depth are expected to 383 enter the lower mantle despite this support (e.g., due to entrainment), particularly once they reach a layer 384 thickness similar to that of the depth range, over which the density overturn occurs (i.e., ~80 km). Along 385 these lines, convective instability of stagnant slabs can act to filter mantle heterogeneity in order to sustain 386 a compositional difference between a somewhat more harzburgitic upper mantle and a somewhat more 387 "eclogitic" lower mantle (accounting for the relevant phase transitions i.e., a dominantly perovskitic lower 388 mantle) over large geologic timescales. Such a difference has indeed been proposed based on comparison 389 of geophysical constraints with mineral-physics estimates of lower-mantle rock properties [e.g., Cobden 390 et al., 2009; Murakami et al., 2012]. A perovskitic lower mantle may further reconcile chondrite models for 391 bulk-Earth compositions. Understanding the separation of eclogite and harzburgite within stagnant slabs is 392 vital to constrain heat and material fluxes through the mantle. 393

5. Conclusions

To study the origin of intraplate volcanism, we explore the behavior of stagnant slabs in the MTZ. We show 395 that weak slabs that stagnate in the MTZ can go convectively unstable within tens of Myr, or less. Upwel-396 lings rising out of the slab's underbelly are relatively cool and thus do not actively rise through the upper 397 mantle at first, but are ultimately entrained by ambient-mantle flow to reach the base of the lithosphere 398 and undergo decompression melting. The soonest, warmest, and most vigorous upwellings are likely to rise 399 along slab edges, and adjacent to heterogeneity within or below the slab. They entrain a small fraction of 400 fertile eclogite and may thus be subject to decompression melting. Continental intraplate volcanism indeed 401 often occurs above stagnant slabs, particularly above slab toes or slab windows. We further show that con-402 vective instability of a stagnant slab can result in slab disintegration and separation of harzburgite from 403 eclogite with the destinations of these materials the upper and lower mantles, respectively. Such a separa-404 tion may sustain a compositional gradient across the MTZ over large geologic timescales, perhaps over bil-405 lions of years. 406

Appendix A

ID: vedhanaravanan.m

To benchmark the results of our numerical experiments, we compare model onset ages with a semianalytical solution. We estimate semianalytical onset ages by computing local thermal Rayleigh numbers Ra_{loc} of the layer that potentially goes convectively unstable. This layer of unstable thermal stratification ranges from 660 km depth to the core of the slab, where the temperature minimum occurs (Figure 2b). As the slab gets heated from below and above, Ra_{loc} evolves. We compute thermal evolution of the slab numerically using Fourier series expansion. The thickness of the layer of unstable stratification h, the temperature difference across it, as well as the relevant viscosity at the top of the layer η_{loc} evolve with time and thus control evolution of Ra_{loc} :

$$Ra_{loc} = \frac{\alpha (T_0 - T_{loc}) \rho_0 g h^3}{\kappa \eta_{loc}},$$
(A1)

where T_{loc} is the minimum temperature of the slab. η_{loc} is calculated from T_{loc} and equation (1).

Time: 13:42 I Path: N:/3b2/GGGE/Vol00000/150015/APPFile/JW-GGGE150015

In solving equation (A1), we find that T_{loc} as well as h monotonically increase, and η_{loc} monotonically 417 decreases with time. As the decrease of η_{loc} (i.e., a function of T_{loc}) is much stronger than the increase of T_{loc} 418 (see equation (1)), the net effect is that Ra_{loc} monotonically increases with time. As soon as Ra_{loc} exceeds a 419

AQ3

416

AO₂

407

10.1002/2014GC005608



Figure A1. Comparison of semianalytically estimated onset ages as a function of slab age at trench with predictions from the two-dimensional numerical experiments. Crosses are numerical model results; colored curves are semianalytical predictions for different critical Rayleigh numbers. Reference viscosity is fixed at 2.98×10^{19} Pa·s.

critical Rayleigh number Racrit, convection 420 becomes a more efficient mode of heat 421 transfer than conduction, and convective 422 instability develops. The time tonset, after 423 which $Ra_{loc} > Ra_{crit}$ is a function of the 424 model parameters and initial thermal condi-425 tions. Initial thermal conditions primarily 426 depend on the slab age at trench τ_{slab} (Fig-427 ure 2b). Ra_{crit} is usually ~1000, but its exact 428 value depends on the aspect ratio λ/h of the 429 convective cell [e.g., Turcotte and Schubert, 430 1982], where λ is the wavelength of convec-431 tive instability. 432

Our semianalytical solution predicts that 433 t_{onset} increases as a function of τ_{slab} 434 (Figure A1). This increase is first and fore-435 most due to an increase of η_{loc} with increas-436 ing τ_{slab} . Older slabs are cooler and hence 437 more viscous at any given time in the 438 experiment. For example at t = 0, η_{loc} 439 equals $\sim 8\eta_0$, $\sim 110\eta_0$ and $\sim 1900\eta_0$ at 440

 $\tau_{slab} = 5$ Ma, $\tau_{slab} = 25$ Ma and $\tau_{slab} = 70$ Ma, respectively. The rate of the increase of t_{onset} with τ_{slab} somewhat decreases at high τ_{slab} .

The general trend of t_{onset} as a function of τ_{slab} as well as the absolute values of t_{onset} agree well with the results of our numerical experiments (lines versus crosses in Figure A1). As we do not take into account the effects of composition in calculating Ra_{locr} this good agreement suggests that unstable thermal density stratification critically drives convective instability in our numerical experiments. That compositional buoyancy is only marginally important to drive instability is explained by a trade-off between the effects of harzburgite and basalt on total buoyancy of the top of the slab. In particular, our analysis shows that slab softening due to heating from below and above is key for triggering instability.

Any scatter of the numerical predictions in terms of onset age about each of the semianalytical solutions 450 (e.g., for $Ra_{crit} = 1100$: scatter of crosses about red line in Figure A1) is well explained by limitations for permitted λ in finite computational domains. In the numerical experiments, only natural fractions of twice the box width are permitted for λ . In particular for high τ_{slab} , for which the preferred λ is of the same order as box width, a mismatch between preferred and permitted λ is likely to affect onset ages. Therefore, we expect that using box width much larger than those modeled further improves the match between numerical model predictions and the semianalytical solution.

Acknowledgments

We thank Guillaume Richard, an anonymous reviewer and the editor for their thoughtful and detailed comments that helped to improve the manuscript. This study has been supported by NSF grant EAR-1141938. A basic version of the software that was used to run the numerical models (see Methods section) is available at Computational Infrastructure for Geodynamics (http://www. geodynamics.org).

458 **References**

459 Ballmer, M. D., J. van Hunen, G. Ito, P. J. Tacklev, and T. A. Bianco (2007), Non-hotspot volcano chains originating from small-scale sublitho-460 460 spheric convection, Geophys. Res. Lett., 34, L23310, doi:10.1029/2007GL031636. 461 461 Ballmer, M. D., J. van Hunen, G. Ito, T. A. Bianco, and P. J. Tackley (2009), Intraplate volcanism with complex age-distance patterns: A case 462 for small-scale sublithospheric convection, Geochem, Geophys, Geosyst., 10, O06015, doi:10.1029/2009GC002386. 462 463 463 Ballmer, M. D., G. Ito, J. van Hunen, and P. J. Tackley (2010), Small-scale sublithospheric convection reconciles geochemistry and geochro-464 464 nology of 'Superplume' volcanism in the western and south Pacific, Earth Plant, Sci. Lett., 290(1-2), 224–232. 465 465 Ballmer, M. D., C. P. Conrad, E. I. Smith, and N. Harmon (2013a), Non-hotspot volcano chains produced by migration of shear-driven upwell-466 466 ing toward the East Pacific Rise, Geology, 41(4), 479-482. 467 Ballmer, M. D., G. Ito, C. J. Wolfe, and S. C. Solomon (2013b), Double layering of a thermochemical plume in the upper mantle beneath 467 468 468 Hawaii, Earth Planet, Sci. Lett., 376, 155-164. 469 469 Bianco, T. A., C. P. Conrad, and E. I. Smith (2011), Time dependence of intraplate volcanism caused by shear-driven upwelling of low-470 470 viscosity regions within the asthenosphere, J. Geophys. Res., 116, B11103, doi:10.1029/2011JB008270. 471 471 Bonatti, E., and C. G. A. Harrison (1976), Hot Lines in the Earths Mantle, Nature, 263(5576), 402–404. 472 Buck, W. R., and E. M. Parmentier (1986), Convection beneath young oceanic lithosphere: Implications for thermal structure and gravity, J. 473 Geophys. Res., 91(B2), 1961-1974. 474 Christensen, U. (1984), Convection with pressure-dependent and temperature-dependent non-Newtonian rheology, Geophys. J. R. Astron. 475 Soc., 77(2), 343-384.

Christensen, U. (1995), Effects of phase-transitions on mantle convection, Annu. Rev. Earth Planet. Sci., 23, 65-87.

476

441

442

457

10.1002/2014GC005608

Cobden, L., S. Goes, M. Ravenna, E. Styles, F. Cammarano, K. Gallagher, and J. A. D. Connolly (2009), Thermochemical interpretation of 1-D	477
seismic data for the lower mantle: The significance of nonadiabatic thermal gradients and compositional heterogeneity, J. Geophys.	478
Res., 114, B11309, doi:10.1029/2008JB006262.	479
Conrad, C. P., B. Wu, E. L. Smith, I. A. Blanco, and A. Hoberts (2010), Shear-driven up/wreiling induced by lateral viscosity variations and actheorepharic for barry A mechanism for intendist volcanism. <i>Phys. Earth Planet</i> Inter, 178(2-4), 162–175.	480
astrendspirete shear a mechanism of indepate volcanism, rigs Lotar Harter, inter, ir volcars, for a thermal contraction crack origin.	482
Geochem, Geophys. Geosyst, 12, Q07007, doi:10.1029/2011GC003573.	483
Doin, M. P., and L. Fleitout (1996), Thermal evolution of the oceanic lithosphere: An alternative view, <i>Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.</i> , 142(1-2), 121–136.	484
Dumoulin, C., M. P. Doin, D. Arcay, and L. Fleitout (2005), Onset of small-scale instabilities at the base of the lithosphere: Scaling laws and	485
role of pre-existing lithospheric structures, Geophys. J. Int., 160(1), 344–356.	486
Faccenna, C., I. W. Becker, S. Lailemand, Y. Lagabrielle, F. Funiciello, and C. Piromallo (2010), Subduction-triggered magmatic pulses: A new class of plumos? <i>Earth Planat Sci</i> (147 2001 2) 54.69	407 488
Fukao, Y., and M. Obavashi (2013). Subducted slabs stagnant above, penetrating through, and trapped below the 660 km discontinuity.	489
Geophys. Res. Solid Earth, 118, 5920–5938, doi:10.1002/2013JB010466.	490
Gerya, T. V., and D. A. Yuen (2003), Rayleigh-Taylor instabilities from hydration and melting propel 'cold plumes' at subduction zones, Earth	491
Planet. Sci. Lett., 212(1–2), 47–62.	492
Goes, S., F. A. Capitanio, G. Morra, M. Seton, and D. Giardini (2011), Signatures of downgoing plate-buoyancy driven subduction in Ceno-	493
ZOIC Plate motions, Phys. Earth Planet. Inter., 184(1-2), 1–13. Godus O. H. and R. N. Pyskhwae (2008). Near-surface diagnostics of drinning or delaminating lithosphere. J. Geophys. Res. 113, R11404	495
doi:10.1029/2007JB005123.	496
Gorczyk, W., T. V. Gerya, J. A. D. Connolly, and D. A. Yuen (2007), Growth and mixing dynamics of mantle wedge plumes, Geology, 35(7),	497
587–590.	498
Griffiths, R. W. (1986), Dynamics of mantle thermals with constant buoyancy or anomalous internal heating, Earth Planet. Sci. Lett., 78, 435–	499
446.	500 501
J. Geophys. Res., 113. B04405. doi:10.1029/2006/B004862.	502
Herzberg, C., P. D. Asimow, N. Arndt, Y. L. Niu, C. M. Lesher, J. G. Fitton, M. J. Cheadle, and A. D. Saunders (2007), Temperatures in ambient	503
mantle and plumes: Constraints from basalts, picrites, and komatiites, Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst., 8, Q02006, doi:10.1029/	504
2006GC001390.	505
Hieronymus, C. F., and D. Bercovici (1999), Discrete alternating hotspot islands formed by interaction of magma transport and lithospheric	506
Hieronymus C. F. and D. Bercovici (2000). Non-hotspot formation of volcanic chains: control of tectonic and flexural stresses on magma	508
transport, Earth Plan. Sci. Lett., 181(4), 539–554.	509
Hirose, K., F. Yingwei, M. Yanzhang, and M. Ho-Kwang (1999), The fate of subducted basaltic crust in the Earth's lower mantle, Nature,	510
397(6714), 53–56.	511
Houseman, G. A., D. P. McKenzie, and P. Molnar (1981), Convective instability of a thickened boundary-layer and its relevance for the ther-	512
mai evolution of Continental Convergent Beits, J. Geophys. Res., 86(NB7), 6115–6132. Huang LS S J Zhong and L van Hunen (2003) Controls on sublithospheric small-scale convection. J Geophys. Res. 108(B8), 2405. doi:	514
10.1029/2003JB002456.	515
Inoue, T., Y. Tanimoto, T. Irifune, T. Suzuki, H. Fukui, and O. Ohtaka (2004), Thermal expansion of wadsleyite, ringwoodite, hydrous wadsley-	516
ite and hydrous ringwoodite, Phys. Earth Planet. Inter., 143, 279–290.	517
Iwamori, H. (1991), Zonal structure of cenozoic basalts related to mantle upwelling in Southwest Japan, J. Geophys. Res., 96(B4), 6157–6170.	518
Jadamec, M. A., and M. I. Billen (2012), The role of rheology and slab shape on rapid mantle flow: Three-dimensional numerical models of the Alaska slab edge. J. Geophys. Res. 117, B03304, doi:10.1029/2011/B009563	520
Johnson, R. W. (1989). Intraplate Volcanism in Eastern Australia and New Zealand. Cambridge Univ. Press.	521
Kameyama, M., and R. Nishioka (2012), Generation of ascending flows in the Big Mantle Wedge (BMW) beneath northeast Asia induced by	522
retreat and stagnation of subducted slab, Geophys. Res. Lett., 39, L10309, doi:10.1029/2012GL051678.	523
Karato, S., and P. Wu (1993), Rheology of the upper mantle: A synthesis, <i>Science, 260</i> (5109), 771–778.	524
Karato, S., M. R. Riedel, and D. A. Yuen (2001), Rheological structure and deformation of subducted slabs in the mantle transition zone:	525 526
Katsura, T., et al. (2004). Thermal expansion of Mo2SiO4 ringwoodite at high pressures. J. Geophys. Res., 109. B12209. doi:10.1029/	527
2004JB003094.	528
King, S. D., and D. L. Anderson (1998), Edge-driven convection, Earth Planet. Sci. Lett., 160(3-4), 289–296.	529
King, S. D., and J. Ritsema (2000), African hot spot volcanism: Small-scale convection in the upper mantle beneath cratons, Science,	530
<i>290</i> (5494), 1137–1140.	531
Korenaga, J., and T. H. Jordan (2004), Physics of multiscale convection in Earth's mantie: Evolution of sublithospheric convection, J. Geo-	533
Lei, J. (2012), Upper-mantle tomography and dynamics beneath the North China Craton, J. Geophys. Res., 117, B06313, doi:10.1029/	534
2012JB009212.	535
Lei, J., D. Zhao, and Y. Su (2009), Insight into the origin of the Tengchong intraplate volcano and seismotectonics in southwest China from	536
local and teleseismic data, J. Geophys. Res., 114, B05302, doi:10.1029/2008JB005881.	537
Lei, J., F. Xie, Q. Fan, and M. Santosh (2013), Seismic imaging of the deep structure under the Chinese volcanoes: An overview, Phys. Earth Planet Inter, 224(0), 104–123	530 539
Lei, J. S., and D. P. Zhao (2005), P-wave tomography and origin of the Changbai intraplate volcano in Northeast Asia. <i>Tectonophysics</i> , 397(3-	540
4), 281–295.	541
Liu, L., and D. R. Stegman (2012), Origin of Columbia River flood basalt controlled by propagating rupture of the Farallon slab, Nature,	542
482(7385), 386–U1508.	543
Long, M. D., and P. G. Silver (2009), Mantle flow in subduction systems: The subslab flow field and implications for mantle dynamics, J. Geo-	544
nhys Res 114 B10312 doi:10.1029/2008/B006200	545
phys. Res., 114, B10312, doi:10.1029/2008JB006200. Lustrino, M., and M. Wilson (2007), The circum-Mediterranean anorogenic Cenozoic igneous province. Farth Sci. Rev. 81(1-2), 1–65.	545 546
phys. Res., 114, B10312, doi:10.1029/2008JB006200. Lustrino, M., and M. Wilson (2007), The circum-Mediterranean anorogenic Cenozoic igneous province, <i>Earth Sci. Rev.</i> , 81(1-2), 1–65. Moresi, L., S. Zhong, and M. Gurnis (1996), The accuracy of finite element solutions of Stokes' flow with strongly varying viscosity, <i>Phys.</i>	545 546 547

AQ4

10.1002/2014GC005608

Morgan, W. J. (1972), Plate motions and deep mantle convection, <i>Geol. Soc. Am. Mem.</i> , <i>132</i> , 7–22.	549
Murakami, M., Y. Ohishi, N. Hirao, and K. Hirose (2012), A perovskitic lower mantle inferred from high-pressure, high-temperature sound	55U
velocity data, <i>Nature</i> , 435(1396), 90–0118. Diramallo C. and C. Esconna (2004) How doep can we find the traces of Alpine subduction? <i>Geophys. Res. Lett.</i> 21 L06605 doi:10.1029/	552
2003G (1928	553
Piromallo, C., T. W. Becker, F. Funiciello, and C. Faccenna (2006), Three-dimensional instantaneous mantle flow induced by subduction, Geo-	554
phys. Res. Lett., 33, L08304, doi:10.1029/2005GL025390.	555
Rabinowicz, M., S. Rouzo, J. C. Sempere, and C. Rosemberg (1993), 3-dimensional mantle flow beneath midocean ridges, J. Geophys. Res.,	556
98(B5), 7851–7869.	557
Kaddick, M. J., E. M. Parmentier, and D. S. Scheirer (2002), Buoyant decompression melting: A possible mechanism for intraplate volcanism, L. Goophy, Rev. 107(2010), 2029. doi:10.1020/2001/10006137	550 559
b. Geophys. nes., 107(010), 2226 (additional convertion in the Earth's mantle transition zone. J. Geophys. Res., 114, B01205. doi: 10.1027/10.1016/1000/10.1016/10016/10.1016/10016/10016/10016/10.1016/10016/10.1016/1001	560
10.1029/2008/B005734.	561
Richard, G. C., and H. Iwamori (2010), Stagnant slab, wet plumes and Cenozoic volcanism in East Asia, Phys. Earth Planet. Inter., 183(1-2),	562
280–287.	563
Richter, F. M., and B. Parsons (1975), On the interaction of two scales of convection in the mantle, J. Geophys. Res., 80(17), 2529–2541.	564
Riedel, M. R., and S. Karato (1997), Grain-size evolution in subducted oceanic lithosphere associated with the olivine-spinel transformation	566
and its elected on melody, <i>Europhanic Sci. Lett.</i> , 140(1-2), 27-45.	567
Sakamaki, T., A. Suzuki, E. Ohtani, H. Terasaki, S. Urakawa, Y. Katavama, Ki, Funakoshi, Y. Wang, J. W. Hernlund, and M. D. Ballmer (2013).	568
Ponded melt at the boundary between the lithosphere and asthenosphere, Nat. Geosci., 6(12), 1041–1044.	569
Sakuyama, T., et al. (2013), Melting of dehydrated oceanic crust from the stagnant slab and of the hydrated mantle transition zone: Con-	570
straints from Cenozoic alkaline basalts in eastern China, <i>Chem. Geol.</i> , 359, 32–48.	571
Sandwell, D. T., E. L. Winterer, J. Mammericky, R. A. R. A. Duncan, M. A. Lynch, D. A. Levitt, and C. L. Johnson (1995), Evidence for diffuse	572
extension or the Facilic plate from Fukapuka noges and cross-grain gravity interations, J. Geophys. Res., 100(68), 13,087–13,100. Shimoliku A. T. Kuko F. Ohtani T. Nakamura B. Okazaki R. Dohman and S. Chakrabotty (2009) Si and O diffusion in (Mg Ea)SiOA wad-	574
slevite and ingovodite and its implications for the rheology of the mantle transition zone. Earth Planet, Sci. Lett. 284(1–2):103–112.	575
Sigloch, K., N. McQuarrie, and G. Nolet (2008), Two-stage subduction history under North America inferred from multiple-frequency tomog-	576
raphy, Nat. Geosci., 1(7), 458–462.	577
Strak, V., and W. P. Schellart (2014), Evolution of 3-D subduction-induced mantle flow around lateral slab edges in analogue models of free	578
subduction analysed by stereoscopic particle image velocimetry technique, <i>Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.</i> , 403, 368–379.	579
Tackley, P. J., allo D. J. Stevenson (1995), A mechanism for spontaneous sen-perpetudating volcalism on the terrestinal planets, in <i>Providing</i>	581
Tang, Y., M. Obayashi, F. Niu, S. P. Grand, Y. J. Chen, H. Kawakatsu, S. Tanaka, J. Ning, and J. F. Ni (2014), Changbaishan volcanism in north-	582
east China linked to subduction-induced mantle upwelling, Nat. Geosci., 7(6), 470–475.	583
Torsvik, T. H., M. A. Smethurst, K. Burke, and B. Steinberger (2006), Large igneous provinces generated from the margins of the large low-	584
velocity provinces in the deep mantle, Geophys. J. Int., doi:10.1111/j.1365-1246X.2006.03158x.	585
Iurcotte, D. L., and G. Schubert (1982), Geodynamics: Applications of Continuum Physics to Geological Problems, John Wiley, New York.	580 587
van der Meer, D. G., W. Spaknan, D. J. van misserger, M. L. Amaru, and T. H. Torsvik (2010), Towards absolute plate motions constrained by lower-mantle slab remnants. <i>Nat General</i> 3(1): 36-40	588
Support Manual Association (National Coordination of the State Sta	589
Wellman, P., and I. McDougall (1974), Cainozoic igneous activity in eastern Australia, Tectonophysics, 23(1–2), 49–65.	590
Wilson, J. T. (1963), A possible origin of Hawaiian Islands, Can. J. Phys., 41(6), 863.	591
Wilson, M., and H. Downes (2006), Tertiary-Quaternary intra-plate magmatism in Europe and its relationship to mantle dynamics, in Euro-	592
pean Lithosphere Dynamics, edited by K. Stephenson and D. Gee, pp. 147–166, Geol. Soc. of London, London.	595 594
Au, W., C. Lungow-beneficini, L. Sukrude, and J. Auserna (2006), the effect of black composition and temperature on manue seismic struc- ture <i>Farth</i> Planet Sci Lett 275(1-2) 70–70	595
Yamazaki, D., T. Inoue, M. Okamoto, and T. Irifune (2005). Grain growth kinetics of ringwoodite and its implication for rheology of the sub-	596
ducting slab, Earth Planet. Sci. Lett., 236(3-4), 871-881.	597
Ye, Y., et al. (2012), Compressibility and thermal expansion of hydrous ringwoodite with 2.5(3) wt% H2O, Am. Mineral., 97(4), 573–582.	598
Yuan, K., and C. Beghein (2014), Three-dimensional variations in Love and Rayleigh wave azimuthal anisotropy for the upper 800 km of the	599
mantie, J. Geophys. Res. Solid Earth, 119, 3232–3255. Zhao, D. V. Tian, J. Lei, J. Liu, and S. Zhang (2000). Seismic image and existin of the Changhai introducts valence in East Aris. Bells of Fire	600 601
anao, J., T. Han, J. Lei, L. Liu, and S. Zheng (2009), Seismic image and origin of the Changbal intraplate voicand in East Asia: Kole of Dig mantle wedge above the stagnant Pacific slab. <i>Phys. Farth Planet. Inter.</i> 173(3–4), 197–206	602
Zhou, X., and R. L. Armstrong (1982), Cenozoic volcanic-rocks of Eastern China: Secular and geographic trends in chemistry and strontium	603
isotopic composition, Earth Planet. Sci. Lett., 58(3), 301–329.	604
Zou, H., Q. Fan, and Y. Yao (2008), U-Th systematics of dispersed young volcanoes in NE China: Asthenosphere upwelling caused by piling	605
up and upward thickening of stagnant Pacific slab, Chem. Geol., 255(1-2), 134–142.	606
	607

AQ5

AQ6

AQ1 Please note that references "Richard and coworkers [2009; 2010]" and "Lei and Zhao [2005; 2009]" have been changed as "Richard and Bercovici [2009]; Richard and Iwamori [2010]" and "Lei and Zhao [2005]; Lei et al., [2009]," respectively as per details given in the list. Please check if this is OK.

AQ2 Please provide a descriptive title for Appendix A.

AQ3 Please note that equation given in appendix should be numbered separately and hence equation (3) has been changed as equation (A1) as per journal style. Please check.

AQ4 Please provide publisher location for references "Johnson [1989]" and "Tackley and Stevenson [1993]".

AQ5 Please provide volume number and page range for reference "Torsvik et al. [2006]".

AQ6 Please provide complete page range for reference "Wilson [1963]".

AQ7: Author: Please complete the Publication Fee Consent Form included with your article and return to the Production Editor with your proofs.

AQ8: Please confirm that given names (red) and surnames/family names (green) have been identified correctly.

Author Proof

WILEY-BLACKWELL

USING e-ANNOTATION TOOLS FOR ELECTRONIC PROOF CORRECTION

Required software to e-Annotate PDFs: Adobe Acrobat Professional or Adobe Reader (version 8.0 or above). (Note that this document uses screenshots from Adobe Reader X) The latest version of Acrobat Reader can be downloaded for free at: http://get.adobe.com/reader/



of erfect competition in general equilil be ts of aggregate demand and supply nc lassical framework assuming monop important works on entry by onire een an evogenous number of firms M henceforth)¹ we open the 'black h

3. Add note to text Tool – for highlighting a section to be changed to bold or italic.



Highlights text in yellow and opens up a text box where comments can be entered.

How to use it

nain compo

level, are exc

- Highlight the relevant section of text.
- Click on the Add note to text icon in the Annotations section.
- Type instruction on what should be changed regarding the text into the yellow box that appears.

4. Add sticky note Tool – for making notes at specific points in the text.



Marks a point in the proof where a comment needs to be highlighted.

How to use it

- Click on the Add sticky note icon in the Annotations section.
- Click at the point in the proof where the comment should be inserted

- 44 (m. 1997) 199		
atior Ma	• dthreshe 08/06/2011 15:31:38	itl
and		lee
to a)C

Type the comment into the yellow box that appears.

тапи ани ѕиррту вноскъ. мозгот



USING e-ANNOTATION TOOLS FOR ELECTRONIC PROOF CORRECTION





How to use it

- Click on one of the shapes in the Drawing Markups section.
- Click on the proof at the relevant point and draw the selected shape with the cursor.
- To add a comment to the drawn shape, move the cursor over the shape until an arrowhead appears.
- Double click on the shape and type any text in the red box that appears.



Allows shapes, lines and freeform annotations to be drawn on proofs and for comment to be made on these marks..



WILEY-BLACKWELL

ecoj_2384_CrxRev2_EV_19-Ju	ul-10.pdf - Adobe Reader			
File Edit View Window	Help			×
	? Adobe Reader X <u>H</u> elp	F1	F =	Tools Comment Share
characterised by m different degree, t prices (Bertrand c	<u>A</u> bout Adobe Reader X About Adobe <u>P</u> lug-Ins		ľ	Annotations
costs allow us to er sector. Therefore, i	Improvement Program Options			🖻 🐶 💪 🗌 🛓 -
on the form of com number of firms.	Digital Editio <u>n</u> s		-	T _a T a T a T a
In the long run, of the economy, th productivity level, a the costs of entry. because of the tend Moreover, since sa	<u>O</u> nline Support R <u>e</u> pair Adobe Reader Installation Check for <u>U</u> pdates	•		Drawing Markups Comments List (14)
novel form of dyn BGM model). In p high enough, the n	Purchase Adobe Acrobat umber of firms is above the 'golden rule' number	that would		G Find ≜ + ⊗ + E +

WILEY-BLACKWELL

Additional reprint and journal issue purchases

Should you wish to purchase additional copies of your article, please click on the link and follow the instructions provided: https://caesar.sheridan.com/reprints/redir.php?pub=10089&acro=GGGE

Corresponding authors are invited to inform their co-authors of the reprint options available.

Please note that regardless of the form in which they are acquired, reprints should not be resold, nor further disseminated in electronic form, nor deployed in part or in whole in any marketing, promotional or educational contexts without authorization from Wiley. Permissions requests should be directed to mail to: permissionsus@wiley.com

For information about 'Pay-Per-View and Article Select' click on the following link: http://wileyonlinelibrary.com/ppv