1	Thermal localization as a potential mechanism to rift cratons
2 3	Gang Lu, ^{1,2,*} Boris J.P. Kaus ^{2,3} , Liang Zhao ¹
4 5 6 7	¹ State Key Laboratory of Lithospheric Evolution, Institute of Geology and Geophysics, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing, 100029, China
8	² Department of Earth Science, ETH Zurich, Sonneggstrasse 5, 8092 Zurich, Switzerland
9 10	³ University of Southern California, Los Angeles USA.
11 12	* Corresponding author e-mail: lvgang@mail.iggcas.ac.cn, Fax: +86-10-62010846
13 14	Abstract
15	Cratons are cold regions of continents that have remained stable since at least the
16	Precambrian. The longevity of cratons is often attributed to chemical buoyancy and/or
17	high viscosity of cratonic root material. Yet examples of destructed cratons (such as the
18	North China Craton) suggest that there are conditions under which chemical buoyancy
19	and/or high viscosity are insufficient to keep cratons stable. The formation of continental
20	rifts, as weak zones that reduce the total stresses of cratons, may be a mechanism that
21	increases the longevity of cratonic lithosphere. Since continental rifts result from
22	localized deformation, understanding the mechanism of shear localization is thus
23	important for understanding the stability or breakup of cratons. Here, we perform 2-D
24	numerical models for a cratonic lithosphere under extension to understand the initiation
25	of shear localization, for visco-elasto-plastic rheologies. Results reveal that three modes
26	of deformation exist: no localization, symmetric localization and asymmetric localization.
27	To further understand the underlying physics, we develop a 1-D semi-analytical method
28	that predicts the onset of localization as well as whether rifting will be symmetric or
29	asymmetric. Applications of the semi-analytical method to geological settings show that
30	fast deformation, cold thermal state or strong mantle rheology may result in localized

deformation and stabilize the remaining adjacent cratons. Our results successfully

32 interpret the major features of the North China Craton.

33

Keywords: thermal localization; numerical modeling; lithospheric thinning; North ChinaCraton

36

37 **1. Introduction**

Archean cratons are regions of continents that have remained undeformed since at 38 least the Precambrian. They are characterized by relatively low surface heat flow, 39 diamond deposits in kimberlites, and thick keels with high seismic velocities. Most 40 Archean cratons have undergone minimal internal deformation, despite being directly 41 adjacent to orogens or rifts (e.g. the east African Rift System, the Baikal Rift) at their 42 boundaries (e.g. Stern et al., 1994; O'Neill et al., 2008; Sengor, 1999). 43 Yet, there are examples showing that cratonic lithosphere can be destructed as 44 well e.g. the Wyoming Craton and the North China Craton (NCC) (Eggler et al., 1988; 45 Carlson et al., 2004; Fan & Menzies, 1992; Menzies et al., 1993; Griffin et al., 1998). 46 47 Although the longevity of cratonic lithosphere is often attributed to chemical buoyancy and/or high viscosity of cratonic root material (Shapiro et al., 1999; Sengor, 48 1999), they are relatively ineffective if cratons are involved with subduction zones 49 50 (Lenardic et al., 2000,2003). The existence of weak mobile zones surrounding cratons, in addition, was proposed to be a possible mechanism to increase the longevity of cratonic 51 lithosphere (Lenardic et al., 2000). Such weak zones could be continental rifts and 52 53 orogens that have relatively low yield stresses. Once a weak zone is initiated, the

integrated stress of the lithosphere would reduce significantly which keeps the remaining 54 part of the craton relatively undeformed. This might explain why most cratons are stable, 55 even though they are adjacent to rifts or orogens (O'Neill et al., 2008). The formation of 56 continental rifts is due to lithospheric runaway in which deformation is strongly localized 57 in narrows zones (e.g., England, 1983; Buck, 1991; Buck et al., 1999). While some 58 59 authors (e.g. England, 1983; Buck et al., 1991) extended the concept of rifts to be narrow rifts or wide rifts, it is the narrow rifts that behave as weak zones and stabilize cratons. 60 Wide rifts, in contrast, can be observed in destructed cratons, e.g. the eastern North China 61 62 Craton (Zhao & Xue, 2010), and the West Siberia Basin (Armitage & Allen, 2010). They are thought to result from stretching of relatively thick continental lithosphere without 63 shear localization (Armitage & Allen, 2010; Buck, 1991). Better understanding the 64 mechanisms of localization is thus important to understand dynamics of continental 65 evolution. 66

67 A number of studies have been focusing on the mechanisms of localization (e.g. Bercovici & Karato, 2003; Montesi & Zuber, 2002; and references therein). Dynamic 68 mechanisms of self-softening are required to generate localization (Bercovici & Karato, 69 70 2003; Montesi and Zuber 2002). Proposed mechanisms include grain size reduction (Kameyama et al., 1997; Jin et al., 1998; Braun et al., 1999), grain boundary sliding 71 (Precigout & Gueydan, 2009), two phase damage (Bercovici et al., 2001a; Bercovici et al., 72 73 2001b; Landuyt & Bercovici, 2009) with microcrack or void generation (Ashby & Sammis, 1990; Regenauer-Lieb, 1999), lattice preferred orientation of olivine (Tommasi 74 et al., 2009), or shear heating (Schubert & Turcotte, 1972; Bercovici, 1996; Regenauer-75 76 Lieb & Yuen, 2004;). In this study we focus on the thermal feedback, the coupling of

77 shear heating and temperature-dependent viscosity, as the softening mechanism. This process has been intensively studied over last decades (e.g. Braeck & Podladchikov, 2007; 78 Kameyama et al., 1999; Ogawa, 1987; Burg & Schmalholz, 2008; Kaus & Podladchikov, 79 2006; Regenauer-Lieb et al., 2001; Schmalholz et al., 2009; Crameri & Kaus, 2010). One 80 and two-dimensional models illustrated that this mechanism might indeed cause 81 82 lithospheric-scale shear zones. Yet, because many parameters were involved, it was difficult to understand which of those were the key parameters. Therefore, Kaus and 83 84 Podladchikov (2006) performed a systematical study and derived scaling laws for the 85 onset of localization. The scaling law showed that the onset of localization is given by $\dot{\varepsilon}_{bg} \ge \frac{1.4}{\Delta L} \sqrt{\frac{\kappa \rho c_p}{\mu_{eff}}}$, where κ is the thermal diffusivity, μ_{eff} the effective viscosity and 86 ΔL the heterogeneity length scale. $\gamma = E / nRT^2$ is the e-fold length of the viscosity. 87 88 Crameri and Kaus (2010) further extended the parameter study by taking into account the rheological stratification of the lithosphere as well as non-linear power law rheologies for 89 90 a lithosphere under compression. The 1-D models derived in this latter study were 91 capable of predicting whether localization occurs or not. Yet, they typically predicted 92 localization to initiate at smaller strains than observed in 2-D numerical simulations. Here, we improve this and propose a new semi-analytical model to predict the onset of shear 93 localization under extensional boundary conditions. The semi-analytical model is 94 compared with numerous 2-D numerical simulations that model a thick lithosphere with 95 96 Earth-like rheology and stratification under pure-shear extension. The 2-D simulations reveal three distinct modes of deformation, namely (1) the no localization mode, (2) the 97 symmetric localization mode, and (3) the asymmetric localization mode. It is 98

99	demonstrated that the semi-analytical model is capable of predicting the occurrence of
100	localization, including whether rifting is symmetric or asymmetric. In a next step, we use
101	our results to speculate on the causes of the breakup of the NCC.
102	
103	2. Model setup
104	
105	2.1 Mathematical Equations
106	The incompressible Boussinesq equations for a slowly deforming lithosphere are
107	given by

108
$$\frac{\partial v_i}{\partial x_i} = 0$$

109
$$\frac{\partial \sigma_{ij}}{\partial x_j} + \rho_0 (1 - \alpha (T - T_0))g_i = 0$$

110
$$\rho c_{p} \left(\frac{\partial T}{\partial t} + v_{j} \frac{\partial T}{\partial x_{j}} \right) = \frac{\partial}{\partial x_{j}} \left(k \frac{\partial T}{\partial x_{j}} \right) + H_{r} + H_{s} \quad (1)$$

- 111 where v_i is the velocity, x_i the spatial coordinates, *t* the time, *T* the temperature, ρ 112 the density, α the thermal expansivity, g_i the gravitational acceleration, 113 $\sigma_{ij} = -P\delta_{ij} + \tau_{ij}$ the total stress, $P = -\sigma_{ii}/3$ the pressure, δ_{ij} the Kronecker delta, 114 τ_{ij} the deviatoric stress, c_p the heat capacity, *k* the thermal conductivity, H_r the
- 115 radioactive heat production, and $H_s = \tau_{ij} (\dot{\varepsilon}_{ij} \frac{1}{2G} \frac{D\tau_{ij}}{Dt})$ the shear heating.
- 116 The strain rate is defined as

117
$$\dot{\varepsilon}_{ij} = \frac{1}{2} \left(\frac{\partial v_i}{\partial x_j} + \frac{\partial v_j}{\partial x_i} \right)$$

118 The rheology of rocks is Maxwell visco-elasto-plastic:

119
$$\dot{\varepsilon}_{ij} = \frac{\tau_{ij}}{2\mu} + \frac{1}{2G} \frac{D\tau_{ij}}{Dt} + \dot{\lambda} \frac{\partial Q}{\partial \sigma_{ij}}$$

120
$$\frac{D\tau_{ij}}{Dt} = \frac{\partial \tau_{ij}}{\partial t} + v_k \frac{\partial \tau_{ij}}{\partial x_k} - W_{ik} \tau_{kj} + \tau_{ik} W_{kj} \quad (2)$$

121 where μ is the effective viscosity, G the elastic shear module, $\dot{\lambda}$ the plastic multiplier,

122 *Q* the plastic flow potential and
$$W_{ij} = \frac{1}{2} \left(\frac{\partial v_i}{\partial x_j} - \frac{\partial v_j}{\partial x_i} \right)$$
 the vorticity.

123 The creep rheology is strain rate and temperature dependent:

124
$$\mu = \frac{1}{2} A^{\frac{1}{n}} \dot{\varepsilon}_{2nd}^{\frac{1}{n}} \exp(\frac{E}{nRT})$$
(3)

125 where A is a pre-exponential parameter, n the power-law exponent,

126 $\dot{\varepsilon}_{2nd} = (0.5\dot{\varepsilon}_{ij}\dot{\varepsilon}_{ij})^{0.5}$ the second invariant of the strain-rate tensor, *E* the activation

127 energy and R the universal gas constant.

128 The brittle strength of crustal rocks is approximated by Mohr-Coulomb plasticity:

129
$$F = \tau^* - \sigma^* \sin(\phi) - C \cos(\phi)$$

130
$$Q = \tau^*$$

131
$$\dot{\lambda} \ge 0, F \le 0, \dot{\lambda}F = 0 \qquad (4)$$

132 where
$$\tau^* = ((0.5(\sigma_{zz} - \sigma_{xx}))^2 + \sigma_{xz}^2)^{0.5}, \sigma^* = -0.5(\sigma_{xx} + \sigma_{zz}), C$$
 cohesion and ϕ the

internal angle of friction. For rocks in the mantle, the yield strength is described by

- 134 "Peierls" or "low-temperature" plasticity. Here the formulation of Goetze and Evans
- 135 (1979) is applied which is valid for differential stresses that are larger than 200 MPa:

136
$$\tau_{ij} = \frac{\dot{\varepsilon}_{ij}\sigma_0}{\sqrt{3}\dot{\varepsilon}_{2nd}} \left(1 - \sqrt{\frac{RT}{H_0}}\ln(\frac{\sqrt{3}E_0}{2\dot{\varepsilon}_{2nd}})\right) \quad (5)$$

137 with $\sigma_0 = 8.5 \times 10^9$ Pa, $E_0 = 5.7 \times 10^{11}$ s⁻¹ and $H_0 = 525$ kJ/mol.

138

139 2.2 The 2-D Model

140 Our standard 2-D setup is 800km wide by 670km deep (Figure 1). The model is 141 laterally homogeneous and consists of an upper crust (25km), a lower crust(15km), a 142 mantle lithosphere(150km) and asthenosphere mantle(480km) (see table 1 for model parameters). The whole model with a free surface is subjected to pure shear extension 143 with prescribed extensional strain rate $\dot{\varepsilon}_{bg}$. The thermal boundary conditions are zero-144 flux at side boundaries and isothermal at the top $(0^{\circ}C)$ and the bottom $(1600^{\circ}C)$ 145 146 boundaries. The steady-state initial temperature is obtained by performing half-space cooling from 1600 $^{\circ}$ C to 0 $^{\circ}$ C at the surface over a time thermal age. The deep part of the 147 mode, where temperature is greater than 1300 °C, is replaced by an adiabatic temperature 148 gradient of 0.5 °C /km. Deviatoric stresses are initially zero. The extensional strain rate is 149 varied from 10^{-16} to 10^{-13} s⁻¹. The initial thermal age, which indicates temperature of the 150 lithosphere by conduction only, is varied from 50Ma to 2000Ma. It should be noted that 151 152 the thermal age is typically different from geological ages. Due to convection in the real Earth, the lithosphere doesn't cool down significantly after about 600 Ma of geological 153 154 age. Yet, as we would like to do systematic simulations and obtain the onset of localization versus lithosphere strength and extension strain rate, we still perform 155 simulations with these parameters although they are somewhat unrealistic. Random noise 156 is present in the models because the locations of the tracers are initially randomly 157

perturbed. Tests with prescribed small weak seeds reveal that such weak seed would
focus strain localization and result in an earlier occurrence of localization. No additional
thermal or rheological heterogeneities are included in the model.

The 2-D simulations are done with the finite element code MILAMIN VEP 161 (Kaus et al., 2010, Crameri and Kaus 2010). MILAMIN_VEP solves a visco-elasto-162 plastic problem in a purely Lagrangian manner, and uses remeshing to deal with large 163 deformations. The crust has a Mohr-Coulomb plasticity and the mantle has a low-164 temperature (Peierls) plasticity (Goetze and Evans, 1979). Shear heating is included. The 165 166 code has been benchmarked and used in a number of previous studies (e.g. Kaus et al., 2009, Schmeling, et al., 2008, Schmalholz et al., 2009; Crameri & Kaus, 2010). The 167 resolution in this work is set to be 201×201 for the mesh grids. Tests with higher 168 resolution indicate that increasing the resolution yields narrower shear zones but does not 169 alter the overall results significantly. Around 0.2 million randomly distributed markers 170 are used. We find that perturbation introduced by the randomness of markers is sufficient 171 to initiate not only symmetric but also asymmetric localizations. 172

173

174 2.3 1-D semi-analytical model

In order to obtain a better insight in the results of the 2-D simulations, we have also developed a 1-D model, which has exactly the same stratification as the 2-D setup but assumes that the lithosphere is laterally homogeneous and deformed by pure shear extension only. The composition and boundary conditions are laterally homogeneous. The force equilibrium gives:

180
$$\frac{\partial \sigma_{zz}}{\partial z} + \rho g = 0 \quad (6)$$

181 The model is first considered visco-elastic:

182
$$\dot{\varepsilon}_{xx} = \frac{\tau_{xx}}{2\mu} + \frac{1}{2G} \frac{\partial \tau_{xx}}{\partial t}$$

183
$$\tau_{zz} = -\tau_{xx}, \quad \dot{\mathcal{E}}_{zz} = -\dot{\mathcal{E}}_{xx}$$

By discretizing the time term of the equation implicitly, the stress for the new time step atgiven strain rate is

186
$$\tau_{xx}^{new} = \frac{2\mu G\Delta t \dot{\varepsilon}_{xx} + \mu \tau_{xx}^{old}}{\mu + G\Delta t}$$

187 If the stresses are larger than the yielding stresses, plasticity is applied. The plasticity

applied in the crust is Mohr-Coulomb yield function (see equation (4)). In the 1-D model,

189 when yielding occurs, the stresses are set to be the yield stresses, i.e.

190
$$\sigma_1^y = -\sigma_{zz}$$

191
$$R_M^y = \frac{\sigma_1^y \sin(\phi) + C \cos(\phi)}{1 + \sin(\phi)}$$

$$\sigma_3^y = \sigma_1^y - 2R_M^y$$

193
$$\sigma_{xx} = -\sigma_3^y \quad (7)$$

where R_M^y is the critical radius of Mohr circle of yielding and σ_1^y and σ_3^y are the critical first and third principal stresses of yielding, respectively. σ_{xz} is zero and σ_{zz} is given by equation (6). In the mantle, if the differential stresses are larger than 200 MPa, Peierls plasticity (equation (5)) is applied.

198

199 **3. 2-D results**

200 Over 300 2-D simulations are performed by systematically varying lithosphere 201 thermal age and extensional strain rate, which results in three end members of 202 deformation modes: no localization, symmetric localization and asymmetric localization 203 (see Figures 2,3,4).

An example of a simulation in which localization does not occur ("*no localization* mode") is shown on Figure 2 (simu592, 10^{-14} s⁻¹, 200Ma). It has a thermal age of 200Ma and an extension strain rate of 10^{-14} s⁻¹. The whole model results in a pure-shear thinning until more than 100% extension. The deformation is homogeneous during extension. The temperature at the Moho, which indicates the potential for thermal localization, is nearly constant which indicates that no localized shear zone is initiated.

A model with the same parameters but with an older thermal age (400Ma) results in *symmetric localization* (simu600, 10^{-14} s⁻¹, 400Ma) (Figure 3). The deformation in this model is relatively homogeneous until ~25% strain. After 50% strain, the lithosphere undergoes necking at the location where a set of symmetric shear zone develop. The temperature at the Moho depth arises locally about 50 degrees up in the shear zone.

If the thermal age of the lithosphere is further increased (1000Ma) with the same overall parameters, *asymmetric localization* occurs (simu591, 10^{-14} s⁻¹, 1000Ma) (Figure 4). Due to the randomness of tracers in our models, the localized shear zone is randomly located. As seen in Figure 4, the shear zone is observable at ~25% strain, and asymmetry is significantly developed at ~30% strain, which is notable in both strain rate and composition fields. Contour plots of temperature indicate that the temperature in the shear zone, which is fully asymmetric, is more than 100 °C higher in the shear zone compared with the surrounding rocks. The maximum amplitude of localization appears at the uppermost mantle.

In our study, localization arises from thermal weakening associated with shear 224 heating. As a result, the temperature in the localized shear zone is larger then that of the 225 surrounding rocks. We can thus distinguish localization from no localization models in an 226 automated manner by using the Moho temperature as a criteria. Here, we consider models 227 to be localized if the Moho temperature is locally >50 °C higher than the average (see 228 Figures 2,3,4). To distinguish symmetric versus asymmetric localization, however, we 229 230 use an empirical method based on the 2-D composition and strain rate distribution. Only cases with well-defined narrow shear zones (Figure 4) across the lithosphere are treated 231 as asymmetric localization. Those cases with simple necking of the lithosphere are 232 defined as symmetric localization (Figure 3). 233

234

4. Semi-analytical model

In this section we develop a semi-analytical model based on the scaling law derived by Kaus and Podladchikov (2006). Following the work of Crameri and Kaus (2010), we define localization number as

239
$$I_{loc} = \frac{\dot{\varepsilon}_{bg} \Delta L}{1.4} \sqrt{\frac{\mu_{e} \gamma_{f}}{\kappa \rho c_{p}}} = \frac{\Delta L}{1} \sqrt{\frac{\dot{\varepsilon} \tau_{2bg} \gamma}{4\kappa \rho 2_{p}}}$$
(8)

, which predicts localization when $I_{loc} > 1$. All parameters are known in the 1-D code described in section 2.2 except the length scale ΔL . The onset of localization is independent on the shear modulus and the initial stress, but is a strong function of the length scale ΔL (Kaus & Podladchikov, 2006). In the work of Kaus and Podladchikov

(2006.) ΔL is simply the radius of initial heterogeneity with a temperature step. 244 However, as we do not introduce any initial thermal or rheological heterogeneity of 245 significant size, the physical meaning of the length scale ΔL in our work is unclear. In 246 the study of Crameri and Kaus (2010) the thickness of plastic layer is used as the 247 characteristic length scale ΔL . Here we take a different approach. Since the mechanism 248 249 of localization we consider in this work is the coupling of shear heating and temperaturedependent viscosity, here we derive the length scale ΔL based on the additional 250 temperature increase induced by shear heating, compared to a model without shear 251 252 heating.

First, we consider a simple 1-D heat diffusion model with an initial temperature 253 step ΔT in the center with a width ΔL (see Fig.5a). Temperature diffuses until the 254 maximum temperature becomes slightly smaller than ΔT . As shown in the figure, the 255 initial perturbation width ΔL is approximately equal to the part where temperature is 256 257 greater than $\Delta T/2$, which is called "peak width" hereafter. Thus one can recover the initial perturbation width ΔL from a given temperature profile. Similarly, in the current 258 study, the temperature differs from steady state as $T_{diff} = T_{SH} - T_{noSH}$, where T_{SH} is the 259 temperature profile computed in a 1-D model with shear heating, and T_{naSH} that in a 260 model without ($H_s=0$ in equation 1). Typically a single peak is located in the mantle 261 lithosphere where the stress is largest. Yet in some cases, for example in a warm 262 lithosphere, there will be another smaller peak in the upper crust and this leads to an over-263 estimating of ΔL . Therefore, we use max $(T_{diff})/2+4$ as the temperature criteria to 264 compute the length scale ΔL . Tests indicate that the amount of additional 4 degrees is 265

sufficient to overcome this problem while it is negligible once the single peak isdominating.

With the characteristic length scale ΔL being defined and the stress profile (Fig. 268 6a) being calculated, we can compute I_{loc} as a function of depth for a given setup (Fig. 269 6b). The maximum of I_{loc} appears in the upper most mantle, consisting with 2-D 270 271 simulations which show that localization is typically initiated below the Moho (e.g. Figure 4). If the maximum of I_{loc} is greater than 1, localization is expected to occur. As 272 we use a viscoelastic rheology, I_{loc} evolves with time, and a typical evolution of the 273 maximum of I_{loc} for non-localization, symmetric and asymmetric localization as a 274 function of strain is shown in Fig. 6d. Localization is predicted to occur for the setups in 275 Figure 3 and Figure 4, consistent with the numerical results. 276 Moreover, we can also distinguish different deformation modes of symmetric and 277

278 asymmetric localization. The evolution of localization number provides insights into the mechanism of localization. In the setup c) (asymmetric localization), I_{loc} first increases 279 rapidly and then decreases after around 15% strain (see Fig. 6d). Although the strain 280 when the localization number gets maximum is somewhat earlier than that of 2-D 281 simulation (see Fig. 4), they are consistent to the first order. The decreasing of 282 localization number may be explained as following. In setup c) with an old thermal age, 283 in which the strength of the lithosphere is quite strong, the rate of thermal energy 284 generated by shear heating is much faster than thermal diffusion and therefore the energy 285 286 strongly accumulates in a narrow shear band. With the increasing of the maximum of T_{diff} , the width of heterogeneity, as defined by the peak width, becomes narrower (See 287

288	Fig. 6c). Thus the localization number reduces when T_{diff} is arising. In this setup, the
289	maximum of T_{diff} exceeds 100°C (Figure 6e), reduces the viscosity by a factor of 10 or
290	more, which was previously demonstrated to be sufficient to result in asymmetric
291	localization (Huismans & Beaumont, 2003). In contrast, in the symmetric localization
292	setup, the localization number increases continuously until the final state. The rate of heat
293	production in this simulation is only slightly larger than the rate of heat conduction.
294	Therefore the width of the peak grows continuously due to the diffusion of T_{diff} at the
295	same time when the energy of shear heating accumulates in the shear zone. I_{loc}
296	increases continuously and gets significantly large when the strain is more than 50%.
297	This is well consistent with 2-D simulations (see Fig. 3) that necking of the lithosphere
298	occurs after 50% of strain. The maximum of T_{diff} in this case is around 50°C, that
299	reduces the viscosity by a factor of around 3. Combining with the fact that the
300	localization number is greater than 1, this predicts a symmetric localized zone, in
301	accordance with 2-D numerical results.

302 A further probe of viscosity evolution that compares the 1-D model with shear 303 heating (solid lines) with the one without (dash lines) is performed for the setups in which 304 localization develops (see Figure 6f and 6g for setups b) and c), respectively). We show the temporal evolution of both the effective and power law viscosity in the mantle 305 306 lithosphere, where the effective viscosity includes the effect of low-temperature plasticity. The viscosities in the setups without shear heating remain nearly constant, which 307 indicates that the self-softening effect without shear heating is insufficient to generate 308 localization. In contrast, the viscosities decrease significantly once shear heating is 309 310 introduced. Whereas the power law viscosity in the setup of symmetric localization

311 reduces by a factor of around 3, a factor of >10 for the reduction of power law viscosity occurs in the setup of *asymmetric localization*. Yet the reduction of effective viscosity, in 312 fact the Peierls viscosity here whose rheology does not strongly depend on temperature, 313 is only minor, which is caused by the fact that stresses do not change dramatically in the 314 1-D model, which is why the mantle lithosphere remains in the Peierls plasticity 315 316 deformation regime. In 2-D models, however, stress drops very rapidly once the shear zone is initiated (Schmalholz et al., 2009). As a result, the shear-zone deforms in the 317 power law creep regime rather then in the Peierls regime. The power law viscosity 318 319 reduction of a factor 10 or more is in this case sufficient to induce asymmetric localization (Huismans et al., 2005). 320

Based on the discussion above, we can thus use the 1-D models to compute a 321 'phase-diagram' of localization for the standard model (Fig. 7a) and the model with dry 322 olivine mantle (Fig. 7b). Since the thermal age affects the strength of the lithosphere via 323 324 temperature, which is in reality a key factor of viscosity, we convert thermal ages to temperatures at the depth of 200km on the right side in Figure 7. The boundary between 325 no localization and localization is given by $I_{loc} = 1$. The boundary between symmetric and 326 asymmetric localization is computed by recording the maximum drop of power law 327 viscosity due to shear heating. Asymmetric localization occurs in models in which power 328 law viscosity drops by a factor of 10 or more in the 1-D models. In addition, we have 329 330 performed 2-D numerical simulations to test the 1-D predictions. The 2-D simulations we have performed cover Earth-like strain rate ranging from 10^{-16} s⁻¹ to 10^{-13} s⁻¹. Yet 331 convection is initiated in the asthenosphere in 2-D models with a background strain rate 332 smaller than 5×10^{-15} s⁻¹. In this case, most of the computation is spent on resolving the 333

convection and the simulations become very time consuming. Therefore most of our 2-D 334 simulation results cover relatively fast strain rates. Comparisons of such phase-diagrams 335 and 2-D results are plotted in Figure 7 for both the standard setup and the one with dry 336 olivine mantle. The different mechanical modes of deformation predicted by the semi-337 analytical model are highlighted as shaded areas. Insets of 2-D simulations for the setups 338 339 discussed above illustrate different modes of deformation (Fig. 7). There is a good agreement between 1-D and 2-D results, which thus demonstrates that the semi-analytical 340 model is capable of predicting the onset of symmetric/asymmetric localization. 341

342

343 **5. Applications**

344 Stability of cratons

A number of studies addressed the longevity of cratons to the chemical buoyancy 345 due to high degrees of melt-depletion and the high viscosity imparted by the low 346 temperatures (Jordan, 1975, 1978; Pollack, 1986; Doin et al., 1997; Shapiro et al., 1999; 347 Sengor, 1999). However, geodynamic calculations suggested that they are relatively 348 insufficient to prevent the cratonic root from being recycled during convection over 349 350 billions of years (Lenardic et al., 2000, 2003; Sleep, 2003; O'Neill et al., 2008). A recent analysis showed that cratons are more likely to be generated if the Rayleigh number of 351 352 the mantle is larger, such as was the case in the Archean (Cooper and Conrad, 2010). The 353 decrease of mantle Rayleigh-number with time increases basal tractions, which makes it more likely for the craton to be destroyed. Yet, as soon as a craton is surrounded by weak 354 355 zones, the stresses associated with mantle convection are buffered and the craton is 356 prevented from being further deformed (Lenardic et al., 2000,2003). Such weak zones

could result from either symmetric or asymmetric localization of the lithosphere under
extension, and additionally contribute to the longevity of cratons.

Our semi-analytical model predicts a wide range of parameter space for 359 localization for both the standard model and the model with dry olivine mantle. On one 360 hand, at a certain extension strain rate, a cold thermal state (old thermal age) tends to 361 develop localization, while the lithosphere under a hot thermal state (young thermal age) 362 is more likely to deform without localization. The conditions for localization predicted in 363 our study are in good agreements with the initial thermal condition that forms narrow rifts 364 365 (Buck, 1991). Buck (1991) pointed out that none of narrow rifts were formed in a hot lithosphere (with a heat flow higher than 60-70mW m⁻²). Therefore a sufficient cold 366 thermal state is required to keep cratons stable. On the other hand, with a certain thermal 367 age, faster deformation is favored to initiate localization. For cratonic thermal ages 368 (>400Ma), a major part of Earth-like extension strain rate locates in the region of 369 localization, with dry lithosphere developing localization easier than wet lithosphere. It 370 implies that most cratons can form narrow rifts and keep stable. In other words, it is more 371 likely that cratons may deform uniformly without localization under very slow extension 372 373 or in a water-rich condition.

374

375 Water in the Mantle Lithosphere

The strength of olivine is strongly dependent on the content of water (Chopra & Paterson, 1984; Karato, 1986; Mackwell et al., 1985; Hirth & Kohlstedt, 1996; Kohlstedt, 2006). The water content in the upper mantle may vary regionally (Huang et al., 2005; Katayama et al., 2005; Ichiki et al., 2006; Peslier, et al., 2010). A recent study by Karato

380	(2011) has suggested high water content (up to 1 wt%) in the mantle transition zone,
381	with eastern China significantly higher than other continental regions. Some authors (e.g.
382	Zhu & Zheng, 2009) suggested that the destruction of NCC may be related to water
383	content in the mantle. The NCC is one of the most striking examples for the destruction
384	of cratons, which was proposed to have formed in the Paleoproterozoic age by the
385	amalgamation of two Archean blocks, the western (or "Ordos") and eastern blocks, along
386	the Trans-North China orogen (or "Central Block") (e.g. Zhao et al., 2001). Later in the
387	late Mesozoic and Cenozoic, the eastern part underwent from having a thick (~200km)
388	lithosphere to its current much thinner lithosphere (60-80 km) (Griffin et al, 1998; Chen
389	et al., 2006a, 2008; Zheng et al., 2008, 2009; Zhao et al., 2009). The western part however
390	remains stable, with a lithosphere thicker than 200 km (Chen et al., 2009; Zhao et al.,
391	2009; Chen, 2010). A narrow rift (Shaanxi-Shanxi Rift on the order of 100 km wide) in
392	the Central Block seperates the NCC into the stable western block and the destructed
393	eastern block (Zhao & Xue, 2010). The eastern NCC is believed to have been affected by
394	an extensional stress field, as evidenced by a series of half-graben basins as well as
395	seismic anisotropy patterns (Ren et al., 2002; Zhao & Zheng, 2005; Zhao et al.,
396	2007,2008). It has formed a basin (Bohai Bay Basin) with a maximum width of about
397	450km (Chen et al., 2006b; Zhao & Xue, 2010). Receiver function studies (Chen et al.,
398	2006b; Zheng et al., 2007,2008,2009) showed a thinned (~30 km) crust with small
399	thickness variations in the eastern NCC compared to a thicker (~40 km) crust in the
400	western NCC. It thus suggests that the eastern NCC has deformed in a "wide rifting"
401	mode. A seismic tomography study beneath the northeast Asia shows a stagnated slab in
402	the mantle transition zone, whose front end is located below the boundary of the eastern

and western NCC (Zhao & Ohtani, 2009; Huang et al. 2006). It is thus possible that the
lithosphere of the eastern NCC is water-rich due to the dehydration of the subducted
oceanic slab compared to the western NCC.

Here we apply our semi-analytical model to both the eastern and western NCC. 406 Since the western NCC is stable, it is reasonable to take its present-day stratification as 407 the pre-extension model for the eastern NCC. Our eastern/western NCC model is defined 408 having a 200km lithosphere, including a 25km upper crust and a 15km lower crust. The 409 rheologies for the upper crust and lower crust are the same as that in the standard model. 410 411 The rheologies for the mantle, however, are different. "Dry olivine" is applied in the western NCC model while "wet olivine" is used in the eastern NCC model. The results 412 for the occurrence of localization show that the thermal age required for localization in 413 the western NCC model at a certain background strain rate (say $\sim 10^{-15}$ s⁻¹) is generally 414 younger than that in the eastern NCC model (Fig. 8a). This implies the western NCC is 415 easier to develop localization and form narrow rifts, which keeps the western NCC stable. 416 In contrast, the eastern NCC tends to deform without localization. The shaded area in 417 Figure 8a indicates the conditions under which the western NCC is stable and the eastern 418 419 NCC is destructed. For the NCC prior to extension, in which the thermal age is assumed to be 500Ma, the temperature is about 1300°C at the base of the 200-km thick lithosphere. 420 According to the prediction, our model constraints the maximum extension strain rate of 421 NCC to be 1×10^{-15} s⁻¹. Considering the thinning of crustal thickness from 40km to 30km 422 in the eastern NCC, such a strain rate predicts a minimum extension period of ~10Ma. 423 This coincides in the first order with the duration of large-scale gold mineralization 424 (Yang et al., 2003) and magmatic activity (Wu et al., 2005) in this region. 425

As the next step, we combine our semi-analytical model with a rheology of wet
olivine which is a function of water concentration that is introduced by Li et al. (2008).
We take all parameters from Li's study except ignoring activation volume due to the
lack of pressure dependency in our model. The flow law of olivine is given as (Mei &
Kohlstedt, 2000)

431
$$\dot{\varepsilon} = A_{cre} \tau^{n_1} f_{H_2 O}^r \exp(-\frac{Q_{cre}}{RT})$$

432 with $A_{cre} = 1600 \text{MPa}^{-(n_1+r)} \text{s}^{-1}$, $n_1 = 3.5$, r = 1.2, $Q_{cre} = 530 \text{kJ mol}^{-1}$; $\dot{\varepsilon}$ and τ are 433 strain rate and shear stress, respectively.

434
$$f_{H_2O} = \exp(c_0 + c_1 \ln C_{OH} + c_2 \ln^2 C_{OH} + c_3 \ln^3 C_{OH})$$

435 is water fugacity, with $c_0 = -7.9859$, $c_1 = 4.3559$, $c_2 = -0.5742$, $c_3 = 0.0337$, and 436 f_{H_2O} in MPa and C_{OH} is water concentration in H/10⁶Si.

By fixing thermal age at 500Ma for cratonic condition, and varying extension 437 strain rate and water concentration, our prediction suggests that the critical minimum 438 water concentration required to let the Eastern NCC deform without localization depends 439 on the extension strain rate (Figure 8b). For small strain rates, less water is required for 440 the Eastern NCC to keep remaining in the "no localization" phase. Once the extension 441 442 strain rate is determined, the critical amount of water can then be obtained. Given the maximum extension strain rate for the Eastern NCC, for example, at 10⁻¹⁵ s⁻¹, at most 443 \sim 3000 H/10⁶Si of water is sufficient to reduce the strength of the lithosphere and make it 444 deform in the manner of wide-rift. This is comparable with water content in the mantle 445 transition zone or subduction zones suggested by other studies (e.g. Dixon et al. 2004; 446 Karato 2011). 447

448	However, whereas the crust in the eastern NCC thins from \sim 40km to \sim 30km, the
449	lithosphere has much larger thinning from ~200km to ~100km, due to differential
450	thinning (e.g. McKenzie, 1978; Steckler, 1985; White & McKenzie, 1988), which is not
451	well predicted in our model. Some other mechanisms might thus also partly contribute to
452	the thinning of the lithosphere. Hydration alone, for example, could weaken the
453	lithosphere and initiate the thinning of the mantle lithosphere (Li et al., 2008). It has been
454	suggested (Komiya & Maruyama 2007; Kusky et al., 2007) that the dual subduction of
455	the Pacific and Indo-Australian plates may double the amount of water transported into
456	the mantle transition zone under the marginal basins of the Western Pacific and under the
457	North China Craton. Therefore, the mantle transition zone might be a reservoir of water
458	during plate tectonics and raises a possibility to hydrate the lithosphere of the eastern
459	NCC before extension.

461 *Peierls strength*

Only a few experiments on low temperature plasticity (Peierls plasticity) have 462 been carried out over the past decades (Goetze, 1978; Evans & Goetze, 1979; Raterron et 463 al., 2004; Katayama & Karato, 2008; Mei et al, 2010), and as a consequence, the flow 464 laws are not well constrained. In order to better understand the effect of uncertainties in 465 experimental parameters on the initiation of shear localization we compare results of a 466 newly derived Peierls plasticity flow law (Mei et al., 2010) with the one used in this study 467 (Goetze and Evans, 1979) (Fig. 9), which can be evaluated in a rapid manner using our 1-468 D models. The flow law of the newly derived Peierls plasticity by Mei et al. (2010) is 469 470 described as

471
$$\dot{\varepsilon} = A_P \sigma^2 \exp(-\frac{E_k(0)}{RT}(1 - \sqrt{\frac{\sigma}{\sigma_P}})) \quad (9)$$

472 with $A_p = 1.4 \times 10^{-7} \text{ s}^{-1} \text{ MPa}^{-2}$, $E_k(0) = 320 \text{ km mol}^{-1}$ and $\sigma_p = 5.9 \text{ GPa}$. A plot of

473 "Christmas Tree" indicates that the Peierls plasticity by Goetze and Evans (1979) has higher strength in the mantle (Fig. 9a). The prediction results (Fig. 9b) illustrate that the 474 475 general trends remain the same but that Peierls plasticity affects both symmetric and asymmetric localization in parameter space with old thermal ages (>400Ma), in which the 476 temperature of the lithosphere is low enough to meet the condition for "low-temperature" 477 478 plasticity. Both symmetric and asymmetric localization is easier to initiate for the model with Peierls plasticity by Goetze and Evans (1979). In particular, the slower of the 479 extension strain rate, the more important of the influence. Therefore simulations with a 480 481 higher Peierls plasticity are more likely to develop localized zones, and suggest increasing possibility of stabilizing cratons. 482

483

484 **6. Conclusions**

We perform a systematic study on the conditions of strain localization in a thick 485 lithosphere under extension, in which localization is caused by shear-heating related 486 487 thermal weakening. In systematic 2-D models, we observe three end members of deformation of the lithosphere under extension, i.e. no localization, symmetric 488 489 localization and asymmetric localization. A semi-analytical method is developed that 490 gives insights in the underlying physics and helps to constrain the conditions for each of 491 those end members. Sharp boundaries exist between different modes of deformation. We 492 conclude that

493 (1) A cold thermal state tends to develop lithospheric localization in comparison with a494 hot thermal state.

495 (2) Faster deformation and colder thermal state are required to form lithospheric

496 asymmetric localization in comparison with symmetric localization in our standard setup.

497 (3) Mantle lithosphere with dry olivine rheology promotes the occurrence of localization.

498 (4) Model Peierls's plasticity that results in larger differential stresses (Goetze and Evans,

499 1979) predicts localization to occur easier.

500 Applications to the destruction of cratons and continental break-up are discussed.

501 As localization forms narrow rifts and protects cartons from being destructed, higher

strength of the lithosphere, e.g. stronger rheology and colder thermal state, as well as

503 faster deformation increases the likelihood that a localized lithospheric rift occurs, which

shields the remaining pieces of the craton from subsequent deformation. Lithospheres

with a weaker rheology instead deform in a homogeneous manner similar to the

506 formation of wide rifts.

507

- - - -

508 509

510

511 Acknowledgements512

We thank Tianyu Zheng, Ling Chen, Yumei He, and Marcel Thielmann for discussions, and reviewers
 Adrian Lenardic and Craig O'Neil for helpful suggestions that improved the paper. This research was
 financially supported by the NSFC Grant 90814002 and 40974030.

516

517

518 References

519

522

Afonso, J.C., G. Ranalli, 2004. Crustal and mantle strengths in continental lithosphere: is
 the jelly sandwich model obsolete?, Tectonophysics 394, 221-232.

Armitage, J.J., P.A. Allen, 2010. Cratonic basins and the long-term subsidence history of
 continental interiors, Journal of the Geological Society, 167, 61-70.

525	
526 527	Artemieva, I.M., 2009. The continental lithosphere: Reconciling thermal, seismic, and petrologic data. Lithos 109, 23-46.
528	
529	Ashby, M.F., C.G. Sammis, 1990. The Damage Mechanics of Brittle Solids in
530	Compression. Pure Appl. Geophys. 133, 489-521.
531	
532	Bercovici, D., 1996. Plate generation in a simple model of lithosphere-mantle flow with
533	dynamic self-lubrication. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 144, 41-51.
534	
535	Bercovici, D., Y. Ricard, G. Schubert, 2001a. A two-phase model for compaction and
536	damage 1. General Theory. J. Geophys. Res. 106, 8887-8906.
537	
538	Bercovici, D., Y. Ricard, G. Schubert, 2001b. A two-phase model for compaction and
539	damage 3. Applications to shear localization and plate boundary formation. J. Geophys.
540	Res. 106, 8925-8939.
541	
542	Bercovici, D., S. Karato, 2003. Theoretical analysis of shear localization in the
543	lithosphere. Plastic Deformation of Minerals and Rocks 51, 387-420.
544	
545	Braeck, S. and Y.Y. Podladchikov, 2007. Spontaneous thermal runaway as an ultimate
546	failure mechanism of materials. Phys. Rev. Lett. 98, Doi
547	10.1103/Physrevlett.98.095504.
548	
549	Braun, J., J. Chery, A. Poliakov, D. Mainprice, A. Vauchez, A. Tommasi, M. Daignieres,
550	1999. A simple parameterization of strain localization in the ductile regime due to
551	grain size reduction: A case study for olivine. J. Geophys. Res. 104, 25167-25181.
552	
553	Buck, W.R., 1991. Modes of continental lithospheric extension. J. Geophys. Res. 96,
554	20161-20178.
555	
556	Buck, W.R., L.L. Lavier, A.N.B. Poliakov, 1999. How to make a rift wide. Philosophical
557	Transactions of the Royal Society of London Series a-Mathematical Physical and
558	Engineering Sciences 357, 671-690.
559	
560	Burg, J. P. and S. M. Schmalholz, 2008. Viscous heating allows thrusting to overcome
561	crustal-scale buckling: Numerical investigation with application to the Himalayan
562	syntaxes. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 274, 189-203.
563	
564	Burov, E., F. Houdry, M. Diament, J. Deverchere, 1994. A broken plate beneath the
565	North Baikal Rift-Zone revealed by gravity modeling. Geophys. Res. Lett. 21, 129-132.
566	
567	Carlson, R.W., A.J. Irving, D.J. Schulze, C. Hearn, 2004. Timing of Precambrian melt
568	depletion and Phanerozoic refertilization events in the lithospheric mantle of the
569	Wyoming Craton and adjacent Central Plains Orogen. Lithos 77, 453-472.
570	

Chen, L., 2010. Concordant structural variations from the surface to the base of the upper 571 572 mantle in the North China Craton and its tectonic implications. Lithos doi:10.1016/j.lithos.2009.12.007. 573 574 Chen, L., T.Y. Zheng, W.W. Xu, 2006a. A thinned lithospheric image of the Tanlu Fault 575 Zone, eastern China: Constructed from wave equation receiver migration. J. Geophys. 576 Res. 111, Doi 10.1029/2005jb003974. 577 578 Chen, L., T.Y. Zheng, W.W. Xu, 2006b. Receiver function migration image of the deep 579 structure in the Bohai Bay Basin, eastern China. Geophys. Res. Lett. 33, Doi 580 10.1029/2006gl027593. 581 582 Chen, L., W. Tao, L. Zhao, T.Y. Zheng, 2008. Distinct lateral variation of lithospheric 583 thickness in the northeastern North China Craton. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 267, 56-68. 584 585 Chen, L., C. Cheng, Z.G. Wei, 2009. Seismic evidence for significant lateral variations in 586 lithospheric thickness beneath the central and western North China Craton. Earth 587 Planet. Sci. Lett. 286, 171-183. 588 589 590 Chen, W.P. and P. Molnar, 1983. Focal Depths of Intracontinental and Intraplate Earthquakes and Their Implications for the Thermal and Mechanical-Properties of the 591 Lithosphere. Journal of Geophysical Research, 88, 4183-4214. 592 593 Chopra, P. N., M. S. Paterson, 1984, The role of water in the deformation of dunite, J. 594 Geophys. Res., 89, 7861-7876. 595 596 Cooper, C.M., C.P. Conrad, 2009. Does the mantle control the maximum thickness of 597 cratons? Lithosphere 1, 67-72. 598 599 Crameri, F. and B.J.P. Kaus, 2010. Parameters that control lithospheric-scale thermal 600 localization on terrestrial planets. Geophys. Res. Lett. 37, Doi 10.1029/2010gl042921. 601 602 603 Dabrowski, M., M. Krotkiewski, and D.W. Schmid, 2008. MILAMIN: MATLAB-based finite element method solver for large problems. Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst. 9, 604 doi:10.1029/2007GC001719. 605 606 Deverchere, J., C. Petit, N. Gileva, N. Radziminovitch, V. Melnikova, V. San'kov, 2001. 607 Depth distribution of earthquakes in the Baikal rift system and its implications for the 608 rheology of the lithosphere. Geophys. J. Int. 146, 714-730. 609 610 Deverchere, J., F. Houdry, M. Diament, N.V. Solonenko, A.V. Solonenko, 1991. 611 Evidence for a Seismogenic Upper Mantle and Lower Crust in the Baikal Rift. Geophy. 612 Res. Lett. 18, 1099-1102. 613 614 615 Dixon, J.E., T.H. Dixon, D.R. Bell, R. Malservisi, 2004. Lateral variation in upper mantle viscosity: role of water. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 222, 451-467. 616

617	
618 619	Doglioni, C., E. Carminati, E. Bonatti, 2003. Rift asymmetry and continental uplift. Tectonics 22 Doi 10.1029/2002tc001459
620	1000000000000000000000000000000000000
621	Doin M. P. I. Eleitout II. Christensen 1007 Mantle convection and stability of
622	depleted and undepleted continental lithosphere. J. Geophys. Res. 102, 2771-2787.
623	
624 625	Eggler, D.H., J.K. Meen, F. Welt, F.O. Dudas, K.P. Furlong, M.E. Mccallum, R.W. Carlson, 1988. Tectonomagmatism of the Wyoming Province. Colorado School of
626	Mines Quarterly 83, 25-40.
627	Environment D. J. Lasharan D. M. Karaja K. Drivether 2006 Salarisita structure and
628 629	rheology of the lithosphere in the Lake Baikal region. Geophys. J. Int. 167, 1233-1272.
630	
631 632	England, P., 1983. Constraints on extension of continental lithosphere. J. Geophys. Res. 88, 1145-1152.
633	
634	Evans, B., C. Goetze, 1979. Temperature-variation of hardness of olivine and its
635	implication for polycrystalline yield stress. J. Geophy. Res. 84, 5505-5524.
636	
637	Fan, W., M. Menzies, 1992, Destruction of aged lower lithosphere and accretion of
638	asthenosphere mantle beneath eastern China. Geotectonica et Metallogenia 16, 171-
639	180
640	
641	Gao, S. P. Davis, H. Liu, P. Slack, Y. Zorin, N. Logatchev, M. Kogan, P. Burkholder, R.
642	Meyer 1994 Asymmetric upwarp of the asthenosphere beneath the Baikal Rift-Zone
643	Siberia. J. Geophys. Res. 99, 15319-15330.
644	
645	Goetze, C., 1978. Stress and Temperature in Bending Lithosphere as Constrained by
646 647	Experimental Rock Mechanics. Transactions-American Geophysical Union 59, 372- 372.
648	
649	Goetze, C., B. Evans, 1979. Stress and temperature in the bending lithosphere as
650	constrained by experimental rock mechanics. Geophys. J. R. Astron. Soc. 59, 463-478.
651	
652	Griffin, W., Z. Andi, S. O'Reilly, C. Ryan, 1998. Phanerozoic evolution of the lithosphere
653	beneath the Sino-Korean Craton. Mantle Dynamics and Plate Interactions in East Asia
654	27, 107-126.
655	
656	Gueydan, F., C. Morencey, J. Brun, 2008. Continental rifting as a function of lithosphere
657	mantle strength. Tectonophysics 460, 83-93.
658	
659	Hirth, G., D.L. Kohlstedt, 1996. Water in the oceanic upper mantle: Implications for
660	rheology, melt extraction and the evolution of the lithosphere. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.
661	144, 93-108.
662	

663 664 665	Huang, J.L., and D. Zhao, 2006. High-resolution mantle tomography of China and surrounding regions. J. Geophys. Res. 111, B09305, doi:10.1029/2005JB004066.
666 667	Huang, X.G., Y.S. Xu, S.I. Karato, 2005. Water content in the transition zone from electrical conductivity of wadsleyite and ringwoodite. Nature 434, 746-749.
668 669 670	Huismans, R.S., C. Beaumont, 2002. Asymmetric lithospheric extension: The role of frictional strain softening inferred from numerical experiments. Geology 30, 211-214.
671 672 673 674	Huismans, R.S., C. Beaumont, 2003. Symmetric and asymmetric lithospheric extension: Relative effects of frictional-plastic and viscous strain softening. J. Geophys. Res. 108, Doi 10.1029/2002jb002026
675 676 677 678	Huismans, R.S., S.J.H. Buiter, C. Beaumont, 2005. Effect of plastic-viscous layering and strain softening on mode selection during lithospheric extension. J. Geophys. Res. 110, Doi 10.1029/2004jb003114.
679 680 681 682	Ichiki, M., K. Baba, M. Obayashi, H. Utada, 2006. Water content and geotherm in the upper mantle above the stagnant slab: Interpretation of electrical conductivity and seismic P-wave velocity models. Phys. Earth Planet. Int. 155, 1-15.
683 684 685 686	Jackson, J.A., 2002a. Faulting, flow, and the strength of the continental lithosphere. International Geology Review 44, 39-61.
687 688	Jackson, J.A., 2002b. Strength of the continental lithosphere: time to abandon the jelly sandwich? GSA Today 12, 4-10.
689 690 691 692	Jin, D.H., S.I. Karato, M. Obata, 1998. Mechanisms of shear localization in the continental lithosphere: Inference from deformation microstructures of peridotites from the Ivrea zone, northwestern Italy. Journal of Structural Geology 20, 195-209.
693 694 695	Jordan, T.H., 1975. The continental tectosphere. Rev. Geophys. 13, 1-12.
696 697 698	Jordan, T.H., 1978. Composition and development of the continental tectosphere. Nature 274, 544-548.
699 700 701 702	Kameyama, M., D.A. Yuen, H. Fujimoto, 1997. The interaction of viscous heating with grain-size dependent rheology in the formation of localized slip zones. Geophys. Res. Lett. 24, 2523-2526.
703 704 705 706	Kameyama, M., D.A. Yuen, S.I. Karato, 1999. Thermal-mechanical effects of low- temperature plasticity (the Peierls mechanism) on the deformation of a viscoelastic shear zone. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 168, 159-172.
707 708	Kaus, B.J.P., 2009. Factors that control the angle of shear bands in geodynamic numerical models of brittle deformation. Tectonophysics 484, 36-47.

709	
710	Kaus, B.J.P., H. Muhlhaus, D.A. May, 2010. A stabilization algorithm for geodynamic
711	numerical simulations with a free surface. Phys. Earth Planet. Int. 181, 12-20.
712	
713	Kaus B.J.P., Y. Liu, I.W. Becker, D.A. Yuen, Y. Sni, 2009. Litnospheric stress-states
714	predicted from long-term tectonic models: Influence of rheology and possible
715	application to Taiwan. J. Asian Earth Sci. 36, 119-134.
/10	Kaus PIP VV Redladshikov 2006 Initiation of localized shear zones in
/1/ 718	viscoelastoplastic rocks. I. Geophys. Res. 111, B04412, doi:10.1020/2005IB003652
710	viscociastopiastic focks. J. Ocophys. Res. 111, D04412, d01.10.1027/2005jD005052.
720	Karato SI MS Paterson ID Fitz Gerald 1986 Rheology of synthetic olivine
720	aggregates - Influence of grain-size and water I Geophys Res 91 8151-8176
721	uggregutes minuence of grunt size and water. 5. Geophys. Res. 51, 6151 6176.
723	Karato, SI., 2011. Water distribution across the mantle transition zone and its
724	implications for global material circulation. Earth Planet, Sci. Lett. 301, 413-423.
725	I man both and the second s
726	Katayama, I. and S.I. Karato, 2008. Effects of water and iron content on the rheological
727	contrast between garnet and olivine. Phys. Earth Planet. Int. 166, 57-66.
728	
729	Katayama, I., S.I. Karato, M. Brandon, 2005. Evidence of high water content in the deep
730	upper mantle inferred from deformation microstructures. Geology 33, 613-616.
731	
732	Kohlstedt, D.L., 2006. The role of water in high-temperature rock deformation. Water in
733	Nominally Anhydrous Minerals 62, 377-396.
734	
735	Komiya, T. and S. Maruyama, 2007. A very hydrous mantle under the western Pacific
736	region: Implications for formation of marginal basins and style of Archean plate
737	tectonics. Gondwana Research 11, 132-147.
738	
739	Kusky, T.M., B.F. Windley, M.G. Zhai, 2007. Lithospheric thinning in eastern Asia;
740	constraints, evolution, and tests of models. Mesozoic Sub-Continental Lithospheric
741	Thinning under Eastern Asia 280, 331-343.
742	Londwet W. D. Donosvisi 2000 Formation and structure of litheartheric shoon range
743	Landuyl, W., D. Bercovici, 2009. Formation and structure of innospheric snear zones
744	whith damage. Phy. Earth Planet. Int. 175, 115-126.
745	Longridia A. I. N. Morasi, H. Muhlhaus, 2000. The role of mobile holts for the longavity
740	of deep cratonic lithosphere: The crumple zone model Geophys Res Lett 27, 1235
747 7/8	1238
740	12.56.
750	Lenardic A. L.N. Moresi H. Muhlhaus 2003 Longevity and stability of cratonic
751	lithosphere: Insights from numerical simulations of counled mantle convection and
752	continental tectonics, J. Geophys. Res. 108. Doi 10.1029/2002ib001859
753	

754 755 756 757 758	Li, ZX. A., CT. A. Lee, A.H. Peslier, A. Lenardic, S.J. Mackwell, 2008. Water contents in mantle xenoliths from the Colorado Plateau and vicinity: Implications for the mantle rheology and hydration-induced thinning of continental lithosphere. J. Geophys. Res. 113, B09210, doi:10.1029/2007JB005540.
759 760 761	Mackwell, S.J., D.L. Kohlstedt, M.S. Paterson, 1985. The role of water in the deformation of olivine single-crystals. J. Geophys. Res. 90, 1319-1333.
762 763 764 765	Maggi, A, J.A. Jackson, D. McKenzie, K. Priestley, 2000a. Earthquake focal depths, effective elastic thickness, and the strength of the continental lithosphere. Geology 28, 495-498.
766 767 768 769	Maggi, A, J.A. Jackson, K. Priestley, C. Baker, 2000b. A re-assessment of focal depth distributions in southern Iran, the Tien Shan and northern India: do earthquakes really occur in the continental mantle? Geophys. J. Int. 143, 629-661.
770 771 772	McKenzie, D., 1978. Some remarks on development of sedimentary basins. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 40, 25-32.
773 774 775 776	Mei, S., A.M. Suzuki, D.L. Kohlstedt, N.A. Dixon, W.B. Durham, 2010. Experimental constraints on the strength of the lithospheric mantle. J. Geophys. Res. 115, 10.1029/2009JB006873
777 778 778	Mei, S., D.L. Kohlstedt, 2000. Influence of water on plastic deformation of olivine aggregates 2. Dislocation creep regime. J. Geophys. Res. 105, 21471-21481.
780 781 782	Meissner, R., W. Mooney, 1998. Weakness of the lower continental crust: a condition for delamination, uplift, and escape. Tectonophysics 296, 47-60.
782 783 784 785 786	Menzies, M. A., W. Fan, M. Zhang, 1993. Palaeozoic and Cenozoic lithoprobes and the loss of >120 km of Archaean lithosphere, Sino-Korean craton, China. Geological Society, London, Special Publications 76, 71-81.
787 788 789	Montesi, L.G.J., M.T. Zuber, 2002. A unfied description of localization for application to large-scale tectonics. J. Geophy. ResSolid Earth 107, 1-17.
790 791 792	Mooney, W.D., G. Laske, T.G. Masters, 1998. CRUST 5.1: A global crustal model at 5 degrees x 5 degrees. J. Geophys. Res. 103, 727-747.
793 794 795	Ogawa, M., 1987. Shear Instability in a Viscoelastic Material as the Cause of Deep-Focus Earthquakes. J. Geophys. ResSolid Earth and Planets 92, 13801-13810.
796 797 798	O'Neill, C.J., A. Lenardic, W.L. Griffin, S.Y. O'Reilly, 2008. Dynamics of cratons in an evolving mantle. Lithos 102, 12-24.

799 800 801	Peslier, A.H., A.B. Woodland, D.R. Bell, M. Lazarov, 2010. Olivine water contents in the continental lithosphere and the longevity of cratons. Nature 467, 78-U108, doi: 10.1038/nature09317
802 803 804 805	Petit, C., E. Burov, J. Deverchere, 1997. On the structure and mechanical behaviour of the extending lithosphere in the Baikal rift from gravity modelling. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 149, 29-42.
806 807 808	Petit, C., J. Deverchere, 2006. Structure and evolution of the Baikal rift: A synthesis. Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst. 7, Doi 10.1029/2006gc001265.
809 810 811 812	Petit, C., I. Koulakov, J., Deverchere, 1998. Velocity structure around the Baikal rift zone from teleseismic and local earthquakes traveltimes and geodynamic implications. Tectonophysics 296, 125-144.
813 814 815	Pollack, H.N., 1986. Cratonization and thermal evolution of the mantle. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 80, 175-182.
816 817 818 819	Precigout, J., F. Gueydan, 2009. Mantle weakening and strain localization: Implications for the long-term strength of the continental lithosphere. Geology 37, 147-150.
820 821 822 822	Priestley, K., J. Jackson, D. McKenzie, 2008. Lithospheric structure and deep earthquakes beneath India, the Himalaya and southern Tibet. Goephys. J. Int. 172, 345- 362.
825 824 825 826	Raterron, P., Y.J. Wu, D.J. Weidner, J.H. Chen, 2004. Low-temperature olivine rheology at high pressure. Phys. Earth Planet. Int. 145, 149-159.
820 827 828 829	Radziminovich, N.A., 2010. Focal depths of earthquakes in the Baikal region: A review. Izvestiya - Phys. Solid Earth 46, 216-229.
830 831 832	Regenauer-Lieb, K., 1999. Dilatant plasticity applied 10 Alpine collision: ductile void growth in the intraplate area beneath the Eifel volcanic field. J. Geodynamics 27, 1-21.
833 834 835	Regenauer-Lieb, K., D.A. Yuen, J. Branlund, 2001. The initiation of subduction: Criticality by addition of water? Science 294, 578-580.
836 837 838 839	Regenauer-Lieb, K., D.A. Yuen, 2004. Positive feedback of interacting ductile faults from coupling of equation of state, rheology and thermal-mechanics. Phys. Earth Planet. Int. 142, 113-135.
840 841 842	Ren, J.Y., K. Tamaki, S.T. Li, J.X. Zhang, 2002. Late Mesozoic and Cenozoic rifting and its dynamic setting in Eastern China and adjacent areas. Tectonophysics 344, 175-205.
842 843 844	San'kov, V., J. Deverchere, Y. Gaudemer, F. Houdry, A. Filippov, 2000. Geometry and rate of faulting in the North Baikal Rift, Siberia. Tectonics 19, 707-722.

~	
845	
846	Schmalholz, S.M., B.J.P. Kaus, J.P. Burg, 2009. Stress-strength relationship in the
847	lithosphere during continental collision. Geology 37, 775-778.
848	
849	Schmeling, H., A.Y. Babeyko, A. Enns, C. Faccenna, F. Funiciello, T. Gerya, G.J.
850	Golabek, S. Grigull, B.J.P. Kaus, G. Morra, S.M., Schmalholz, J. van Hunen, 2008. A
851	benchmark comparison of spontaneous subduction models - towards a free surface.
852	Phys. Earth Planet.Int. 171, 198-223.
853	
854	Schubert, G. and D.L. Turcotte, 1972. One-Dimensional Model of Shallow-Mantle
855	Convection. J. Geophys. Res. 77, 945-951.
856	
857	Sengor, A.M.C., 1999. Continental interiors and cratons: any relation? Tectonophysics
858	305, 1-42.
859	
860	Shapiro, S.S., B.H. Hager, T.H. Jordan, 1999. Stability and dynamics of the continental
861	tectosphere. Lithos 48, 1-4.
862	
863	Sleep, N.H., 2003, Survival of Archean cratonal lithosphere, J. Geophys, Res. 108, doi:
864	10.1029/2001JB000169.
865	
866	Steckler, M.S., 1985, Uplift and extension at the Gulf of Suez - Indications of induced
867	mantle convection Nature 317 135-139
868	
869	Stern R I 1994 Arc Assembly and Continental Collision in the Neoproterozoic East-
870	African Orogen - Implications for the Consolidation of Gondwanaland Annu Rev
871	Farth Planet Sci 22 319-351
872	Larai Fiallet. 561. 22, 517 551.
873	Tommasi A M Knoll A Vauchez I Signorelli C Thoraval R Loge 2009 Structural
874	reactivation in plate tectonics controlled by olivine crystal anisotropy. Nature
875	Geoscience 2 422-426
876	Geoseience 2, 422 420.
877	Wernicke B 1981 Low-angle normal faults in the Basin and Range Province: nanne
878	tectonics in an extending orogen. Nature 291, 645-648
870	tectomes in an extending orogen. Nature 291, 045 040.
880	Westaway R 1995 Crustal Volume Balance during the India-Eurasia Collision and
000	Altitude of the Tibeten Plateau – a Working Hypothesis I. Geophys. Des. Solid Earth
001	Annude of the Thetan Flateau - a working Hypothesis. J. Geophys. ResSond Earth
882	100, 15175-15192.
883	White N. D. Malagraine 1088 Formation of the Stears Head Connectory of Sedimentary
884	White, N., D. Mckenzie, 1988. Formation of the Steers Head Geometry of Sedimentary
885	Basins by Differential Stretching of the Crust and Mantle. Geology 16, 250-253.
886	
887	wu, F.Y., J.Q. Lin, S.A. Wilde, X.O. Zhang, J.H. Yang, 2005. Nature and significance of
888	the Early Cretaceous giant igneous event in eastern China. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 233,
889	103-119.
890	

891 892 893 894	Yang, J.H., F.Y. Wu, S.A. Wilde, 2003. A review of geodynamic setting of large-scale Late Mesozoic gold mineralization in the North China Craton: an association with lithospheric thinning. Ore Geology Reviews 23, 125-152.
895 896 897 898	Zandt, G., S.C. Myers, T.C. Wallace, 1995. Crust and Mantle Structure across the Basin and Range Colorado Plateau Boundary at 37-Degrees-N Latitude and Implications for Cenozoic Extensional Mechanism. J. Geophys. ResSolid Earth 100, 10529-10548.
899 900 901 902	Zhao, G.C., S.A. Wilde, P.A. Cawood, M. Sun, 2001. Archean bolocks and their boundaries in the North China Craton: lithological, geochemical, structural and P-T path constraints and tectonic evolution. Precambiran Res. 107, 45-73.
903 904 905 906	Zhao, D., E. Ohtani, 2009. Deep slab subduction and dehydration and their deodynamic consequences: Evidence from seismology and mineral physics. Gondwana Res. 16, 401-413.
907 908 909 910	Zhao, L., M. Xue, 2010. Mantle flow pattern and geodynamic cause of the North China Craton reactivation: Evidence from seismic anisotropy. Geochem. Geophys. Geosyst. 11, Doi 10.1029/2010gc003068.
911 912 913	Zhao, L., R.M. Allen, T. Zheng, S.H. Hung, 2009, Reactivation of an Archean craton: Constraints from P- and S-wave tomography in North China. Geophys. Res. Lett. 36, doi:10.1029/2009GL039781.
914 915 916 917	Zhao, L., T.Y. Zheng, 2005. Using shear wave splitting measurements to investigate the upper mantle anisotropy beneath the North China Craton: Distinct variation from east to west. Geophys. Res. Lett. 32, Doi 10.1029/2005gl022585.
918 919 920 921	Zhao, L., T.Y. Zheng, G. Lu, 2008. Insight into craton evolution: Constraints from shear wave splitting in the North China Craton. Phys. Earth Planet. Int. 168, 153-162.
922 922 923 924 925	Zhao, L., T.Y. Zheng, L. Chen, Q.S. Tang, 2007. Shear wave splitting in eastern and central China: Implications for upper mantle deformation beneath continental margin. Phys. Earth Planet. Int. 162, 73-84.
926 927	Zhao, W.L., W.J. Morgan, 1985. Uplift of Tibetan Plateau. Tectonics 4, 359-369.
928 929 930	Zhao, W.L., W.J. Morgan, 1987. Injection of Indian Crust into Tibetan Lower Crust - a Two-Dimensional Finite-Element Model Study. Tectonics 6, 489-504.
931 932 933	Zheng, T.Y., L. Chen, L. Zhao, R.X. Zhu, 2007. Crustal structure across the Yanshan belt at the northern margin of the North China Craton. Phys. Earth Planet. Int. 161, 36-49.
934 935 936	Zheng, T.Y., L. Zhao, R.X. Zhu, 2009. New evidence from seismic imaging for subduction during assembly of the North China craton. Geology 37, 395-398.

937	Zheng, T.Y., L. Zhao, W.W. Xu, R.X. Zhu, 2008. Insight into modification of North
938	China Craton from seismological study in the Shandong Province. Geophys. Res. Lett.
939	35, Doi 10.1029/2008gl035661.
940	
941	Zhu, R.X., T.Y. Zheng, 2009. Destruction geodynamics of the North China craton and its
942	Paleoproterozoic plate tectonics. Chinese Sci. Bull. 54, 3354-3366.
943	
944	
945	
946	
947	
948	
949	
950	
951	
952	
953	
954	
955	
956	
957	
958	
959	
960	
961	
962	
963	
964	
965	
966	
967	
968	
969	
970	
971	
972	
973	
974	
975	
976	
977	
>	

TABLE 1: APPLIED ROCK-PHYSICAL AND RHEOLOGICAL PARAMETERS

	Upper crust (Wet quartzite)	Lower crust, weak (Diabase)	Lower crust, strong (Columbia diabase)	Mantle, wet (Wet olivine)	Mantle, dry (Dry olivine)
Elastic Shear Module(Pa)	1×10 ¹⁰	1×10^{10}	1×10^{10}	1×10^{10}	1×10^{10}
Prefactor(s ⁻¹ Pa ⁻ⁿ)	5.07×10 ⁻¹⁸	3.2×10 ⁻²⁰	1.2×10 ⁻²⁶	4.89×10 ⁻¹⁵	4.85×10 ⁻¹⁷
Activation Energy(J•mol ⁻¹)	154×10 ³	276×10 ³	485×10 ³	515×10 ³	535×10 ³
Power law exponent	2.3	3.0	4.7	3.5	3.5
Density(kg•m ⁻³)	2800	2900	2900	3300	3300
Cohesion(Pa)	1×10^{7}	1×10^{7}	1×10^{7}	1×10^{7}	1×10^{7}
Friction angle(°)	30	30	30	30	30
Thermal Conductivity($W \bullet m^{-1} \bullet K^{-1}$)	2.5	2.5	2.5	3.0	3.0
Heat Capacity(J•kg ⁻¹ •K ⁻¹)	1050	1050	1050	1050	1050
Radioactive Heat(W•m ⁻³)	1×10 ⁻⁶	5×10 ⁻⁷	5×10 ⁻⁷	0	0
Thermal Expansivity(K ⁻¹)	3.2×10 ⁻⁵	3.2×10 ⁻⁵	3.2×10 ⁻⁵	3.2×10 ⁻⁵	3.2×10 ⁻⁵

- From Hirth & Kohlstedt (1996), Ranalli (1995) and Schmalholz et al. (2009)

Figure Captions



1001 Figure 1.

(Left) Model setup for 2-D simulations. The model consists of an upper crust 1002 (25km), a lower crust (15km), a lithospheric (150km) and an asthenospheric 1003 (480km) mantle. The whole model has a constant strain rate condition at the 1004 bottom and side boundaries, and a free surface boundary condition on the 1005 top. Thermal boundary conditions are isotherm at the top (T=0) and bottom 1006 (T=1600) boundaries and zero heat flux at side boundaries. 1007 (Right) Illustration of initial temperature and strength profile for the standard 1008 model with a thermal age of 500Ma under an extension strain rate of 10^{-14} s⁻¹. 1009

- 1010 Mohr-Colomb plasticity limits stresses in the crust and whereas Peierls
- 1011 plasticity limits differential stresses in the mantle lithosphere.
- 1012



Figure 2. Snapshots of a simulation in the *no localization* mode. The model with a (young) thermal age of 200Ma extends at a strain rate of 10^{-14} s⁻¹.

with a (young) thermal age of 200Ma extends at a strain rate of 10^{-14} s⁻¹. Strain rate fields at different deformation stages are shown in the first three

plots. Moho temperature and a critera (blue line) that indicates the onset of

1018 localization if the temperature is locally 50 degrees larger than the average 1019 are also shown above each plot of strain rate field. The bottom plot shows

- 1020 the composition field and isotherms.
- 1021



Figure 3. Symmetric localization mode. The model with a (moderate)
thermal age of 400Ma extends under the same strain rate as the model of

Figure 2. The Moho temperature shows the occurrence of localization, with the composition field indicating that the shear zone is symmetric.



Figure 4. Asymmetric localization mode. Conditions are the same as in the models of Figure 2 and 3, but the thermal age of the lithosphere was increased to 1000Ma. The Moho temperature shows the occurrence of localization, with the composition field indicating that the shear zone is completely asymmetric.



Figure 5. Definition of length scale R. Left) relationship between initial
temperature heterogeneity (dash line) and diffused temperature profile (solid
line) in a diffusion model. Right) Differential temperature between a 1-D
model with and the one without shear heating, with peak width defined.



1055

Figure 6. Stress profile (a) and localization number (b) calculated by the 1056 semi-analytical model for the setups of Figure 2,3,4 at 15% of total strain. 1057 The black line in (b) shows the critical value for the localization number. 1058 Evolution of the length scale R (c), the localization number I_{loc} (d) and the 1059 differential temperature (e) are shown for the setups of Figure 2,3,4. The 1060 critical value (dash line in (d)) for the onset of localization is illustrated. (f) 1061 and (g) illustrate the effective and power law viscosities (solid lines) for the 1062 setups of *symmetric localization* and *asymmetric localization*, respectively. 1063 As a comparison, evolutions of viscosities for the same setups but without 1064 shear heating are shown as dash lines. In the case of asymmetric localization, 1065 the power law viscosity drops by more than an order of magnitude, whereas 1066 it is much less for symmetric localization. 1067 1068



Figure 7. Prediction results of the semi-analytical model for the standard
model (a) and the model with dry olivine mantle (b). Data points indicate 2D simulation results. Insets show three deformation modes for the setups in
Figure 2,3 and 4. Temperatures at the depth of 200 km for thermal ages on
the left side are shown on the right side respectively.



1082

Figure 8. (a) Onset of lithospheric-scale localization applied to the NCC. 1083 The solid line indicates the boundary of localization for the western NCC, 1084 and the dash line for the eastern NCC. The shading area figures out the 1085 parameter space when the western NCC develops localization whereas the 1086 eastern NCC doesn't. The mantle in the western NCC is assumed to have a 1087 dry olivine mantle rheology, whereas the eastern NCC is wet. (b) Onset of 1088 localization versus extension strain rate and water concentration in olivine 1089 for the setup of NCC which is assumed to have an initial thermal age of 500 1090 1091 Ma.



1094 Figure 9.

a) Strength profile shows the Peierls stress by Goetze et al. (dash lines,this study) and the newly derived one by Mei et al. (solid lines) for a background strainrate of 10^{-15} s⁻¹. b) Prediction of the onset of localization for the Peierls's plasticity by Goetze et al.(dash lines) and Mei et al.(solid lines), respectively.